

SAN FRANCISCO PUBLIC LIBRARY



3 1223 06447 2260

**5/S**



*San Francisco Public Library*

Government Information Center  
San Francisco Public Library  
100 Larkin Street, 5th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94102

REFERENCE BOOK

*Not to be taken from the Library*





Digitized by the Internet Archive  
in 2014

[https://archive.org/details/agenda2002sanf\\_0](https://archive.org/details/agenda2002sanf_0)



2, 1  
55  
10/02

## San Francisco Commission of Animal Control and Welfare

DATE: January 10, 200<sup>2</sup>

TIME: 5:30 P.M.

PLACE: CITY HALL, ROOM 408

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

JAN - 7 2002

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

MAILING ADDRESS:

1900 MARKET STREET, SUITE 822, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

COMMISSION VOICE MAIL: 415-252-3817

COMMISSION CHAIRPERSON, ELISSA ECKMAN:

VOICE MAIL: (415) 995-4737

AGENDA OF MEETING - FOR IMMEDIATE RELEASE:

Note: Public comment will be taken on each Discussion/Action Item

1. Call to Order And Roll Call
  2. Public Comment: At this point in the meeting advice or comments on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda may be discussed. Members of the public can choose to speak either at the beginning or end of the meeting but not both.*
  3. Approval of minutes of December 13, 2001, meeting. [Discussion/Action item].
  4. Chairperson's report and opening remarks [Discussion item]
    - a. Welcome to new Commissioner Kelly Jensen, D.V.M.
- [REDACTED]



January 7, 2002

- b. The Chair extends the hope that 2002 will be a productive term for the Commission, and that the Commission can maximize our lack of enforcement power by carefully choosing the issues we present for consideration by the Board of Supervisors.
- c. Thelma Lee Gross, DVM, a veterinary pathologist from Davis, California, will be speaking before the Commission at the February 14, 2002, meeting in an approximate 30 minute presentation covering the ethical, moral, and scientific reasons to not allow vertebrates to be sold live from the marketplace for human consumption.
- d. Sunshine Ordinance coordinator Donna Hall has advised this Commission that extemporaneous unagendized "Public Comment from Commissioner's" (item 4 below) is in violation of City law.

#### **4. Commissioner Public Comment**

#### **5. Status and tracking of letters of recommendations approved by Commission requesting action by Board of Supervisors [Discussion Item]**

- 1.) Live Animal Market [Kuehl Bill compliance]
- 2.) Letter sent to Board re UCSF lack of cooperation with city's resolution concerning animal testing.
- 3.) Letter to Board of Supervisors recommending amending §41.12 of the SF Health Code to provide for duties of "Guardians".
- 4.) Letter to Mayor regarding Golden Gate Stables

#### **6. Committee Reports / Commissioner's Reports [Discussion item]**

- a. Update on placement of Crime Stoppers posters [anti dog fighting]
- b. Update on API draft pamphlet regarding declawing fact sheet

#### **7. Old Business** (Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.)





January 7, 2002

[A] Continuing discussion and possible future action to renew the Commission's recommendation to the Board of Supervisors to prohibit the sale of all live animals in any establishment where food is prepared, manufactured, kept, stored, offered for sale, given away, or sold in the City and County of San Francisco. The prohibition would include Farmers Markets, Flea Markets and Farmers Markets occupying City owned property. [Chairperson Eckman, Commissioners Wilson, Franklin, Tchen] [Discussion Item]

[B] Discussion and possible action, pending advisement from the Commission's attorney, Rosa Sanchez, whether the Commission may allow public comment at the beginning and end of each meeting.  
[Full Commission] [Discussion/Action Item]

8. **New Business** (Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.)

[A] An election of officers to begin the term of January 2002 will be conducted pursuant to Article III, section 3.1 of the Commission's Rules and Regulations. The officers to be elected shall be a Chairperson, Vice Chairperson, and Secretary.

[Full Commission] [Discussion/Action Item]

7. **PUBLIC COMMENT:** At this point in the meeting advice or comments on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda may be discussed. Members of the public can choose to speak either at the beginning or end of the meeting but not both.*

#### 8. CALENDAR ITEMS

#### 9. ADJOURNMENT

#### KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE

##### DISABILITY ACCESS

**Room 408** is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART Station is Civic Center, three blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #42 Downtown Loop, the #71 Haight/Noriega, the F Line to Market and Van Ness and the Metro stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call 923-6142.

There is accessible parking at the following locations: two(2) designated blue curb spaces on the southwest corner of McAllister Street at Van Ness Avenue; the Performing Arts Garage (entrance on Grove Street between Franklin and Gough Streets), and at Civic Center Plaza Garage.



January 7, 2002

Large print agendas are available by calling Elissa Eckman at (415) 995-4737. The following services are available upon request at least two working days prior to the meeting: American Sign language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting, or a sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. For information or to make arrangements, contact Carla Vaughn at 252-2500 (voice) or 252-2550 (TDD).

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals.

#### **POLICY ON CELL PHONE, PAGERS, AND ELECTRONIC DEVICES**

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

#### **KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco's Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact Donna Hall at the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 409, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683; Office (415) 554-7724; Fax (415) 554-7854; E-mail: Donna\_Hall@ci.sf.ca.us

Citizens interested in obtaining a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance can request a copy from Ms. Hall or by printing Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code on the Internet, at <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/bdsupvrs/sunshine.htm>

**ATTENTION:** Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16 520 - 16 534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 554-9510; fax (415) 703-0121 and web site <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/ethics>





F.  
55  
2  
10/02

# COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL AND WELFARE

Mailing Address: 1390 Market Street, Room 822  
San Francisco, CA 94102  
Voice Mail: (415) 252-3817

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

MAY 21 2002

~~DEPT~~ MINUTES OF MEETING - JANUARY 10, 2002

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

## 1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

- (a) Chair Elissa Eckman convened the January 10, 2002 meeting of the Commission of Animal Control to order at approximately 5:32 p.m. at City Hall, Room 408, San Francisco California.

Commissioners in Attendance: Chair Elissa Eckman, Vice-Chair Cheryl Bentley, Secretary June Wilson, Catherine Tchen arriving at 5:39 p.m., Frederick Hobson, Sherri Franklin, Carl Friedman, Animal Care & Control, Sgt. Bill Herndon, SFPD. City Attorney Rosa Sanchez was in attendance.

Commissioners Absent: Jack Breslin, Dept. of Health.

A vote, which was unanimously passed by the Commission, was taken to approve Com. Breslin's absence. The City Attorney advised the Commission that because the above item was not agendized, the Commission could not take action on it, and recommended for future meetings that the item be agendized.

Coms. Friedman and Herndon left at 6:35 p.m., City Attorney Rosa Sanchez and Com. Hobson left at 6:46 p.m.

The meeting was convened at 5:32 p.m. and Commission Chair Eckman presided during all aspects of the meeting. Six Commissioners (or their lawful designates) holding valid appointments being present, the quorum requirement of Section 6 of the Commission's Rules & Regulations (50 percent of those eligible to vote) was satisfied.

## 2. PUBLIC COMMENT

Item taken out of order. (See Page 4.)

## 3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF DECEMBER 13, 2001 MEETING [Discussion/Action Item]

Com. Hobson moved, seconded by Com. Bentley, to review and amend the minutes. The Chair opened the meeting to public comment. Hearing none, the meeting was returned to the Commission.



Corrections were indicated to the December minutes as follows:

Com. Bentley indicated on page 3, Item No. 4, the third line, the word "mobbed" should be "mocked."

The Chair indicated that on page 1, under Item 1, "Seven" Commissioners, should be changed to "Five" Commissioners.

Com. Hobson moved, seconded by Com. (Bentley) that the December 13, 2001 minutes be approved as amended, and they were unanimously approved by the Commission.

**4. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT AND OPENING REMARKS [Discussion item]**

**A. Welcome to new Commissioner Kelly Jensen, DVM.**

The Chair extended a welcome to Kelly Jensen, whose seat is pending confirmation by the Mayor.

The Chair requested to take Item 8 (Election of Officers) out of order, with Com. Hobson asserting that the Commission had no officers or chair. He stated that according to the Commission's bylaws, Article 3.1 states, "The terms of office for the officers shall expire January 1st, following the date of their election." Then noted that if it's not in the Commission bylaws, that Roberts Rules of Order shall rule and then cited page 444, Section 3 of Roberts, "If neither the president or vice president is present, the secretary shall in their absence conduct the meeting," and further cited that, "The members of the Commission shall then appoint an interim chair to chair only that portion of the meeting until the election of an officer."

City Attorney Sanchez responded that it was the opinion of her office that what Com. Hobson stated is correct, except for the meaning of "absence," that her office has taken that to mean physical absence, and that following Common Law, the Commission will continue a holdover of offices until a new officer is elected. She further stated there are case laws that discuss this Holdover Doctrine and that the Doctrine applies to offices which have expired but no new officer has been elected, therefore the prior officer holds-over until a new officer is elected.

Com. Hobson went on record to protest that opinion.

The Chair then requested, without further objection, other than noted above, to take the elections out of order, and asked for nominations.

**ITEM TAKEN OUT OF ORDER:**

**8. NEW BUSINESS**

**[A] An election of officers to begin the term of January 2002 will be conducted pursuant to Article III, Section 3.1 of the Commission's Rules and Regulations. The officers to be elected shall be a Chairperson, Vice Chairperson, and Secretary. [Full Commission] [Discussion/Action Item]**





The Chair asked for nominations.

Com. Wilson nominated Com. Elissa Eckman for Chair.

Com. Hobson nominated Com. Cheryl Bentley for Chair.

The Chair, hearing no further nominations, opened the meeting to public comment:

The following members of the public addressed the Commission and spoke in support of the current Chair, Elissa Eckman: Nancy Wuerful, Vice President of SPEAC; Nadine May read a statement on behalf of Chin Chi, and noted that she herself concurred with the statement; Steve Cockral, SF Dogs San Francisco; L'Danyielle, Volunteer with the Quail Restoration Project, etc; Martha Hoffman, and Robin Buckley.

The Chair, hearing no further public comment, returned the meeting to the Commission.

Coms. Hobson and Tchen spoke in support of Com. Cheryl Bentley for Chair.

Com. Friedman stated his hope that whoever was elected chair, that every commissioner would support that person, with Com. Herndon stating he would give his support to either candidate.

Chair Eckman and Com. Bentley spoke in their own behalf and expressed their thoughts about some of the current problems of the Commission and their hopes for the future direction of the Commission.

Two votes were taken: The first being those Commissioners in favor of Elissa Eckman for Chair, with Coms. Franklin, Eckman and Wilson in favor; The second being those Commissioners in favor of Cheryl Bentley for Chair, with Coms. Tchen, Hobson and Bentley in favor.

The Chair stated there was an impasse on the vote at 3 to 3, that the vote be continued to the February meeting when there will be another commissioner present, and then accepted nominations for Vice Chair.

Com. Wilson nominated Com. Sherri Franklin for Vice Chair.

Com. Bentley nominated Com. Frederick Hobson for Vice Chair.

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment, and the following members of the public addressed the Commission and spoke in support of Sherri Franklin: Nadine May and L'Danyielle.

<sup>A vote</sup>  
~~Two~~ votes were <sup>as</sup>~~are~~ taken: The first being those Commissioners in favor of Sherri Franklin for Vice-Chair, with Coms. Franklin, Tchen, Wilson and Eckman in favor; The second being those Commissioners in favor of Frederick Hobson for Chair, with Coms. Bentley and Hobson in favor.

vice



Com. Franklin was elected Vice Chair by a 4 to 2 vote.

Com. Hobson then stated that since the Commission had elected an officer, that officer, since we don't have a Chair-elect, becomes the chair of the Commission until next month, with City Attorney Sanchez responding that the same opinion continues, the Chair is going to holdover until a new chair is elected.

The Chair then accepted nominations for Secretary.

The Chair nominated Com. June Wilson for Secretary.

Com. Hobson nominated Com. Catherine Tchen for Secretary, but Com. Tchen declined the nomination.

The Chair then opened the meeting to public comment. Hearing none, returned the meeting to the Commission.

Two votes were taken: The first being those Commissioners in favor of June Wilson for Secretary, with Coms. Franklin, Tchen, Eckman and Wilson in favor; The second being opposed, with Coms. Hobson and Bentley opposed.

Com. Wilson was elected secretary by a 4 to 2 vote.

That concluded the elections.

## ITEM HEARD OUT OF ORDER

### 2. PUBLIC COMMENT

The Chair opened the meeting to Public Comment as follows:

Nadine May addressed the Commission, stating she felt more members of the public would attend Commission meetings if they thought it would get more done, but that a lot of meeting time is spent on points of order and talking about things that don't really help animals.

Lisa Vittori brought several issues to the attention of the Commission: The first being Park & Rec's Dog policy and the Ft. Funston and GGNRA closures and ticketing, and was asking for the Commission's active advocacy on behalf of socialized and well-behaved dogs in the City and GGNRA parks.

She further asked the Commission to advocate on behalf of feral cats, that in a recent news article, feral cats were blamed for quail disappearances, and pointed out that an enormous amount of undergrowth disposal had been done, and that needs to be looked at too, instead of scape-goating feral cats.

She further hoped in the future the Commission could take on some of the wild animal





issues, especially the commercial wild animal abuses that happen with the circus and also with the labs.

The Chair hearing no further public comment, returned the meeting to the Commission.

The Chair then requested, without objection, to take Item 4-C out of order.

**ITEM HEARD OUT OF ORDER:**

4. C. **Thelma Lee Gross, DVM, a veterinarian pathologist from Davis, CA will be speaking before the Commission at the February 14, 2002 meeting in an approximate 30-minute presentation covering the ethical, moral, and scientific reasons to not allow vertebrates to be sold live from the marketplace for human consumption.**

The Chair urged everyone to attend and noted that the San Jose Mercury News, Sup. Peskin's aide, and the police officer from Tri-City Animal Services in Fremont who contacted the Commission last month, were all interested in attending.

Several Commissioners felt that Feb. 14th, Valentine's Day, was not a good date to have such an important speaker, that members of the public may not be able to attend. The Chair stated she would attempt to contact people and reschedule if possible.

4. B. **The Chair extends the hope that 2002 will be a productive term for the Commission, and that the Commission can maximize our lack of enforcement power by carefully choosing the issues we present for consideration by the Board of Supervisors.**

The Chair reiterated the above item, then moved the Item D.

- D. **Sunshine Ordinance Coordinator Donna Hall has advised this Commission that extemporaneous unagendized "Public Comment from Commissioners" is in violation of City law.**

The Chair stated that the Sunshine Coordinator Donna Hall has merely advised this Commission that public comment that is unagendized is a violation of the Sunshine Ordinance, and she felt the Commission needs to know this, because it is on the agenda.

City Attorney Sanchez indicated she had spoken to Donna Hall and that Ms. Hall was concerned about this item and how it was written and had asked her to say a few words on her behalf. That when Ms. Hall was contacted, the question presented to her was: "Can Commissioners discuss any item that is not on the agenda?" Ms. Hall's response was: "No, it would be a Sunshine Ordinance violation."



City Attorney Sanchez further stated that Ms. Hall wasn't specifically asked about the Public Comment for Commissioners, which is the way the Commission approved it, and noted that Ms. Hall was nonspoken about that, and that Ms. Hall does not have the legal authority to give a legal opinion, but that the City Attorney's office has given an opinion on this issue and the Commission has voted to have it.

Ms. Sanchez further stated that her office's opinion has been that, yes, it is a technical violation of the Sunshine Ordinance, however most commissions do it. It is the Commission's choice to do it or not, and that the repercussion to having that section in the agenda is that members of the public can take you before the Sunshine Task Force, however because the comments you make during that section are of no controversy, most likely you will not be taken before the Sunshine Task Force. She further stated that Ms. Hall's clarification to this issue was that this was not exactly what she was asked, and she cannot give a legal opinion on this.

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment. Hearing none, returned the meeting to the Commission.

Com. Hobson stated that the Commission had voted to place this item on the agenda 4 to 2, and that this is done in various commissions and that he did not think it violates the Sunshine, since they are comments and remarks about things that are not on the agenda and no action can be taken on them.

Com. Hobson further stated that it is regrettable that this has been placed on the agenda and website and that people now think that the Commission is in violation, and due to that, he will be presenting some amendments to the bylaws.

Com. Bentley suggested that when a commissioner asks someone for an opinion, to get their answer in writing and not rely on your own personal understanding, and the writing should reflect who asked for the opinion.

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment. Hearing none, returned the meeting to the Commission.

#### **4. COMMISSIONER PUBLIC COMMENT**

Com. Hobson stated his proposed bylaw amendments: One amendment being to change the date of expiration for Commission officers from January 1st to the election of new officers at the January meeting, that the officers will serve until the January meeting elects new officers.

The second proposed amendment being that in future the agenda be approved by the Commission prior to its being published.





Com. Tchen announced that after six years, she does not intend to reapply to the Commission, so there will be two seats vacant.

Com. Hobson then revisited the Public Comment By Commissioners item, stating that this happens at the Board of Sups every Monday and at other commissions, and that unless the City attorney and the Sunshine Ordinance are willing to enforce what their opinion is city-wide, then he felt they would not be acting in a judicious manner.

City Attorney Sanchez responded that her office is not telling the Commission it cannot do it, but simply advising the Commission, and that is reflected by the fact that the Commission voted on it and voted to have it. She stated that she is not here to tell the Commission what to do, that she is merely representing her office in giving legal advice.

The Chair, hearing no further public comment by commissioners, closed public comment.

City Attorney Sanchez then pointed out for Item 7-B, that that item can be disregarded.

**5. STATUS AND TRACKING OF LETTERS OF RECOMMENDATION  
APPROVED BY COMMISSION REQUESTING ACTION BY THE BOARD OF  
SUPERVISORS [DISCUSSION ITEM]**

**1) Live Animal Market [Kuehl Bill compliance]**

The Chair indicated she had spoken to Sup. Peskin's aide who indicated the following: That Sup. Peskin was looking to the Commission for some direction; that the Dept. of Public Health has refused to enforce the Kuehl Bill; and he is unsure of how to proceed and is looking for assistance.

The Chair further stated she encouraged his aide to come to the meeting to hear Dr. Gross' presentation, and that hopefully the Commission and Sup. Peskin would be able to work together to plot some course between the Kuehl Bill and what the Commission is thinking of doing with the live-animal market. The Chair then indicated that Sup. Peskin's aide was clear that they had almost given up hope of being able to do anything.

Com. Bentley indicated she had spoken with Sup. Peskin and that was not her impression, that he did not mention anything of being hopeless, but that there are many things to take care of and he just hadn't had time.

Com. Franklin suggested that Com. Breslin from the Health Department be present at the meeting when Dr. Gross makes her presentation.

Com. Tchen stated that for the past six years, the Health Department has not done anything to help the live-animal market issue.

Com. Bentley stated that Sup. Peskin told her several months ago that he had



contacted the Health Dept. and that the Health Dept. indicated they would not inspect the live-animal markets, and that he was looking into whether Animal Control could do the inspections.

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment as follows:

Nancy Wuerful inquired about the background re the live-animal market issue, with various commissioners attempting to fill her in. She then stated she was very concerned to hear the Health Department's position on this item and felt it was unacceptable to have any department overrule what bodies like this Commission and our supervisors put together. She further suggested that another approach could be through licensing and/or perhaps the Police Department.

The Chair suggested if the public feels strongly about this, to write their Health Department.

Com. Bentley suggested that perhaps the Commission could work with a vet to set out specific conditions for the care requirements of the animals, and that if the enforcing bodies had more specifics, it would be easier to enforce.

The Chair stated she felt what was important was not having these animals sold or coming into the City at all, or else you get into the difficulties of the enforcement issues.

Com. Franklin indicated that Com. Friedman stated he didn't have the budget to enforce it.

The Chair stated that the Commission needs to study this issue carefully, have speakers come in, etc. and that perhaps the Commission can get a proposed ordinance to the Board of Sups. Then if that ordinance fails, maybe then the Commission can get into the actual conditions in which the animals are kept.

Com. Tchen stated that even if you have rules, you still have no enforcement, and then stated she was a strong proponent of the total ban as the only way to help animals in SF.

Nancy Wuerful suggested having a vet/expert come and give testimony to the Commission concerning the conditions in which the animals should be kept.

The Chair suggested that perhaps Com. Bentley could get an avian vet to address the Commission and discuss this.

Lisa Vittori stated, as another perspective on this, that although she doesn't like it, that there's something honest about somebody killing their own meat, rather than eating a hamburger and never having to deal with the fact that you have a live animal that you're eating.





Com. Tchen stated that the Commission had received testimony that some animals are boiled live and that it can take over 30 minutes for the animal to die, and reports of other cruel practices, and that if the Commission can prohibit this, at least the animal may have quicker death.

The Chair stated that what we're dealing with is incredible suffering, and we don't want the suffering that these animals go through in transport, etc. here in SF, and that this is something the Commission needs to speak to.

Com. Bentley stated that due to the complexity of this issue, several meetings should be devoted to it. She further noted that Sup. Peskin suggested holding hearings, which she thinks the Commission should do to explore all the issues.

Com. Tchen stated the Commission had already held hearings for four years, and did not suggest going that route because she felt nothing would happen.

Com. Bentley said that Sup. Peskin indicated holding hearings as a strategy that might help get his ordinance through.

**2) Letter sent to Board re UCSF lack of cooperation with City's resolution concerning animal testing.**

The Chair stated that a letter had been sent, but that this still is an important issue the Commission needs to look at, because UCSF has been cited in the past for all sorts of violations and further noted that they are now getting ready to move into a new building, and will the conditions be better there?

Com. Franklin indicated that a member of this Commission needs to be on some sort of review board that is able to go in there and take a look around and accompany the USDA when they make their inspections.

Coms. Wilson and Tchen indicated the problems that commissioner might face, and cited examples from the past.

**3) Letter to Board of Supervisors recommending amending Section 41.12 of the SF Health Code to provide for duties of "Guardians."**

Com Franklin indicated she had a phone call in to Matt Gonzalez' office, but hasn't heard back yet.

Com. Tchen indicated she felt the Veterinarian Association seems threatened by the idea of the "guardianship" word, because they produced an article that was published in the LA Times, and the tone of the article itself was not supportive, and she felt the veterinarian field in general would not be supportive.





The Chair opened the meeting to public comment. Hearing none, the meeting was returned to the Commission.

**4) Letter to Mayor regarding Golden Gate Stables**

Com. Wilson indicated she had written a letter of support and that the Chair had sent it off.

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment. Hearing none, the meeting was returned to the Commission.

**6. COMMITTEE REPORTS/COMMISSIONER'S REPORTS [Discussion Item]**

**A. Update on placement of Crime Stoppers posters  
[anti dog fighting]**

Com. Franklin stated that about 35 2-foot by 3-foot posters were given to her and some have been put up in the Mission, Bernal Heights, the Avenues, and parts of Potrero Hill, and that on Thursday she and Sgt. Herndon will put them up in Bayview/Hunters Point, but that the large posters are still up in the air.

The Chair opened the meeting to Public comment.

Nadine May inquired about where the posters had been put up, with Com. Franklin responding, everywhere from laundromats to rec centers to pool areas, parks, Rainbow Grocery, SPCA, etc.

**B. Update on API draft pamphlet regarding declawing fact sheet**

The Chair stated she hadn't heard from API. Com. Wilson stated that Eric Mills had the flu, but that he may be able to advise the Commission at the next meeting.

The Chair, opened the meeting to public comment. Hearing none, the meeting was returned to the Commission.

**7. OLD BUSINESS**

**[A] Discussion and possible action to renew the Commission's recommendation to the Board of Supervisors to prohibit the sale of all live animals in any establishment where food is prepared, manufactured, kept, stored, offered for sale or sold in the City and County of San Francisco. The prohibition would include Farmers Markets, Flea Markets and Farmers Markets occupying City owned property. [Chair Eckman, Coms. Wilson, Franklin, Tchen.] [Discussion Item]**

The Chair submitted that this item had already been discussed by the Commission at



length, and opened the item to public comment. Hearing none, the meeting was returned to the Commission.

- [B] Discussion and possible action, pending advisement from the Commission's attorney, Rosa Sanchez, whether the Commission may allow public comment at the beginning and end of each meeting. [Full Commission] [Discussion/Action Item]**

City Attorney Sanchez said this item could be disregarded.

## **8. NEW BUSINESS**

- [A] An election of officers to begin the term of January 2002 will be conducted pursuant to Article III, Section 3.1 of the Commission's Rules and Regulations. The officers to be elected shall be a Chairperson, Vice Chairperson, and Secretary. [Full Commission] [Discussion/Action Item] (Item taken out of order. See page 2.)**

## **9. PUBLIC COMMENT**

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment. Hearing none, the meeting was returned to the Commission.

## **10. CALENDAR ITEMS**

Com. Wilson indicated Virginia Handley was going to speak about "Choke out," but was unable to do so today, and she will attempt to reschedule.

She further stated that she had heard of "Choke out" 25 years ago, but thought it wasn't used any more, but noted that apparently it is still going on. She explained that "choke out" is when a choke collar is put on a dog and then the trainer hangs him up high off his feet until he faints. She further suggested that the Commission check on dog trainers and their methods for making dogs obey.

## **11. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned, motion by the Com. Franklin seconded by Com. Wilson, at approximately 7:30 p.m.

Dated: 18 Jan 2002  
Amended: 22 Feb 2002  
Wilson, Secretary

---





DOCUMENTS DEPT.

MAR 11 2002

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

03-11-02A10:29 RCVD

San Francisco Commission of  
Animal Control and Welfare

DATE: FEBRUARY 14, 2002

TIME: 5:30 P.M.

PLACE: CITY HALL, ROOM 408

MAILING ADDRESS:

1390 MARKET STREET, SUITE 822, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

COMMISSION VOICE MAIL: 415-252-3817

COMMISSION CHAIRPERSON, ELISSA ECKMAN:

(VOICE MAIL): (415) 519-0215

AGENDA OF MEETING - FOR IMMEDIATE RELEASE:

Note: Public comment will be taken on each Discussion/Action Item

1. Call to Order And Roll Call
2. Public Comment: At this point in the meeting advice or comments on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda may be discussed. Members of the public can choose to speak either at the beginning or end of the meeting but not both.*
3. Approval of minutes of January 10, 2002, meeting. [Discussion/Action item].
4. Chairperson's report and opening remarks [Discussion item]
  - a. Official welcome to new Commissioner Kelly Jensen, D.V.M.



- b. A brief overview of some recent court cases and legal issues of relevancy to the Commission.

#### **4. Commissioner Public Comment**

#### **5. Status and tracking of letters of recommendations approved by Commission requesting action by Board of Supervisors [Discussion Item]**

- 1.) Live Animal Market [Kuehl Bill compliance]
- 2.) Letter sent to Board re UCSF lack of cooperation with city's resolution concerning animal testing.
- 3.) Letter to Board of Supervisors recommending amending §41.12 of the SF Health Code to provide for duties of "Guardians".

#### **6. Committee Reports / Commissioner's Reports [Discussion item]**

- a. Update on placement of Crime Stoppers posters [anti dog fighting]
- b. Update on API draft pamphlet regarding declawing fact sheet

#### **7. Old Business** (Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.)

**[A] An election of a Chairperson to begin the term of January 2002 will be conducted pursuant to Article III, section 3.1 of the Commission's Rules and Regulations. This item had to be carried forward from last month's meeting.**

**[Full Commission] [Discussion/Action Item]**

#### **8. New Business** (Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.)

**[A] Steve Cockrell, President of CITYDOGS, a San Francisco based organization of almost 100 members, advocating for the needs of urban dogs and their owners, requests approximately ten minutes for the opportunity to publicly introduce his organization to the Commission.**

**[Chairperson Eckman][Discussion Item]**

**[B] The Commission will examine and make recommendations re its 2001-2002 budgetary expenditures.**

**[Commissioner Bentley][Discussion Item]**





**7. PUBLIC COMMENT:** At this point in the meeting advice or comments on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda may be discussed. Members of the public can choose to speak either at the beginning or end of the meeting but not both.*

**8. CALENDAR ITEMS**

**9. ADJOURNMENT**

**KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**

**DISABILITY ACCESS**

Room 408 is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART Station is Civic Center, three blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #42 Downtown Loop, the #71 Haight/Noriega, the F Line to Market and Van Ness and the Metro stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call 923-6142.

There is accessible parking at the following locations: two(2) designated blue curb spaces on the southwest corner of McAllister Street at Van Ness Avenue; the Performing Arts Garage (entrance on Grove Street between Franklin and Gough Streets), and at Civic Center Plaza Garage.

Large print agendas are available by calling Elissa Eckman at (415) 995-4737. The following services are available upon request at least two working days prior to the meeting: American Sign language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting, or a sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. For information or to make arrangements, contact Carla Vaughn at 252-2500 (voice) or 252-2550 (TDD).

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals.

**POLICY ON CELL PHONE, PAGERS, AND ELECTRONIC DEVICES**

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

**KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco's Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact Donna Hall at the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 409, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683; Office (415) 554-7724; Fax (415) 554-7854; E-mail: Donna\_Hall@ci.sf.ca.us

Citizens interested in obtaining a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance can request a copy from Ms. Hall or by printing Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code on the Internet, at <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/bdsupvrs/sunshine.htm>

**ATTENTION:** Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to





March 7, 2002

register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 554-9510; fax (415) 703-0121 and web site <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/ethics>



F.  
55  
14/02

# **COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL AND WELFARE**

Mailing Address: 1390 Market Street, Room 822

San Francisco, CA 94102

Voice Mail: (415) 252-3817

**DOCUMENTS DEPT.**

MAY 21 2002

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

## **MINUTES OF MEETING - February 14<sup>th</sup>, 2002**

### **1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL**

Chair Elissa Eckman convened the February 14<sup>th</sup>, 2002 meeting of the Commission of Animal Control and Welfare to order at approximately 5.32p.m. at City Hall, Room 408, San Francisco California.

Commissioners in Attendance: Chair Elissa Eckman, Vice-Chair Sherri Franklin, Secretary June Wilson, Catherine Tchen, Frederick Hobson, Cheryl Bentley, Carl Friedman, Animal Care & Control, Sgt. Bill Herndon, SFPD. Kelly Jensen, Veterinarian. City Attorney Rosa Sanchez was in attendance.  
Commissioner Jack Breslin, Dept. of Health, absent.

Com. Herndon left at approximately 6.30p.m.

The meeting was convened at 5.32p.m. and Commissioner Chair Eckman presided during all aspects of the meeting. Seven Commissioners (or their lawful designates) holding valid appointments being present, the quorum requirement of Section 6 of the Commission's Rules & Regulations (50 percent of those eligible to vote) was satisfied.

### **2. PUBLIC COMMENT**

The Chair hearing none, returned the meeting to the Commission.

### **3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF JANUARY 10,2002 MEETING Discussion/Action Item)**

The minutes were approved with 2 minor changes. The Chair opened the meeting to public comment. Hearing none, the meeting was returned to the Commission.

### **4. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT AND OPENING REMARKS (discussion item) a. Official welcome to new Commissioner Kelly Jensen, D.V.M**

The Chair extended a welcome to Kelly Jensen.

ITEM TAKEN OUT OF ORDER

### **7. OLD BUSINESS**





- (a) **An election of a Chairperson to begin the term of January 2002 will be conducted pursuant to Article III, section 3.1 of the Commission's Rules and Regulations. This item had to be carried forward from last month's meeting. (Full Commission) (Discussion/Action Item)**

The Chair stated that she had been advised by the City Attorney to hold the election first. However, Com. Hobson insisted that she wait until Ms Sanchez arrived. The Chair decided to proceed and Com. Hobson asked her if she had the City Attorney's advice in writing. Shortly thereafter, Ms. Sanchez arrived and advised the chair to proceed as previously instructed. Com. Hobson then stated that there was a "conflict of interest" concerning Com. Franklin. Ms. Sanchez stated that she was investigating this matter. The election of President proceeded as follows:

Com. Wilson nominated Com. Eckman for Chair

Com. Hobson nominated Com. Bentley for Chair

Two votes were taken: The first being those Commissioners in favor of Elissa Eckman for Chair, with Coms. Franklin, Eckman, Wilson and Jensen in favor. The second being those Commissioners in favor of Cheryl Bentley for Chair, with Coms. Tchen, Hobson and Bentley in favor.

- (b) **A brief overview of some recent court cases and legal issues of relevancy to the Commission.**

The Chair had various clippings from different newspapers of some recent court cases involving animals.

#### **4. Commissioner Public Comment**

Com. Hobson disagreed with the Secretary's comments that accompanied the June amendment to the minutes.

ITEM OUT OF ORDER

#### **8. NEW BUSINESS**

- (a) **Steve Cockrell, President of CITYDOGS, a San Francisco based organization of almost 100 members, advocating for the needs of urban dogs and their owners, requests approximately ten minutes for the opportunity to publicly introduce his organization to the Commission.**

**(Chairperson Eckman) (Discussion Item)**

Steve Cockrell spoke about his organization, CityDogs with almost 100 members and said that their focus is on gathering information to provide a basis for informed decision-making by the public and policymakers. He wants to develop solutions and guidelines



that will be good for everyone including Rec & Park, dog owners, children and adults alike.

**5. Status and tracking of letters of recommendations approved by Commission requesting action by Board of Supervisors (Discussion Item)**

**1). Live Animal Market (Kuehl Bill compliance)**

There was considerable discussion regarding the enforcement and limitations of this bill. Supervisor Peskin needs more information on this bill and wants to meet with Com. Friedman on this matter.

**2). Letter sent to Board re UCSF lack of cooperation with city's resolution concerning animal testing.**

There appears to be considerable concern over this matter.

**3). Letter to Board of Supervisors recommending amending 41.12 of the SF Health Code to provide for duties of "Guardians".**

No answer as yet.

**6. COMMITTEE REPORTS/ COMMISSIONER'S REPORTS (Discussion Item)**

**a. Update on placement of Crime Stoppers posters (anti dog fighting)**

Com. Franklin had nothing to report and Com Herndon had already left.

**b. Update on API draft pamphlet regarding declawing fact sheet.**

This item was discussed but no action taken.

**8. NEW BUSINESS**

**(b) The Commission will examine and make recommendations re its 2001-2002 budgetary expenditures.  
(Commissioner Bentley (Discussion Item))**

There was considerable discussion as to the various projects for which the funds should be allocated. There were a number of items considered for funding, suggested public notification of Commissions activities, an invitation to attend commission hearings, to procure additional dog fighting posters and pay for their installation. This item will be continued at a later date.

**7. PUBLIC COMMENT**

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment. Hearing none, the meeting was returned to the Commission.

**8. CALENDAR ITEMS**

The Chair stated that Thelma Lee Gross, DVM a veterinary pathologist from Davis, CA will be speaking before the Commission at next months meeting.

**9. ADJOURNMENT**



The meeting was adjourned, motion by Chair Eckman, seconded by Vice-Chair Franklin,  
at approximately 7.40p.m.

Dated: 17<sup>th</sup> February, 2002

Amended:

Wilson, Secretary

---



7

5  
3/4/02

# San Francisco Commission of Animal Control and Welfare

DATE: <sup>10/</sup>MARCH 14, 2002

TIME: 5:30 P.M.

PLACE: CITY HALL, ROOM 408

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

MAY 21 2002

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

MAILING ADDRESS:

1390 MARKET STREET, SUITE 822, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

COMMISSION VOICE MAIL: 415-252-3817

COMMISSION CHAIRPERSON, ELISSA ECKMAN:

(VOICE MAIL): (415) 519-0215

AGENDA OF MEETING - FOR IMMEDIATE RELEASE:

**Note:** Public comment will be taken on each Discussion/Action Item

1. **Call to Order And Roll Call**
2. **Public Comment:** At this point in the meeting advice or comments on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda may be discussed. Members of the public can choose to speak either at the beginning or end of the meeting but not both.*
3. **Approval of draft minutes of February 14, 2002, meeting.**  
[Discussion/Action item].
4. **Chairperson's report and opening remarks** [Discussion item]



- a. This meeting will be devoted to an approximate 30 minute talk by Thelma Lee Gross, D.V.M. concerning the cruelty inherent in live animal market practices, followed by a question and answer period.

**4. Commissioner Public Comment**

**5. Status and tracking of letters of recommendations approved by Commission requesting action by Board of Supervisors [Discussion Item]**

- 1). Live Animal Market [Kuehl Bill compliance]
- 2.) Letter sent to Board re UCSF lack of cooperation with city's resolution concerning animal testing.
- 3.) Letter to Board of Supervisors recommending amending §41.12 of the SF Health Code to provide for duties of "Guardians".

**2 6. Committee Reports / Commissioner's Reports [Discussion item]**

- a. Update on placement of Crime Stoppers posters [anti dog fighting]
- b. API draft pamphlet regarding declawing fact sheet *no*

**7. Old Business** (Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.)

[No old business]

**1 8. New Business** (Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.)

**Dr. Thelma Lee Gross, D.V.M. will discuss scientific evidence that indicates against live animal market practices, the moral obligation to render the suffering of animals used for human consumption null, and misconceptions concerning several previously presumed humane methods of slaughter. Dr. Gross will review abuses recently observed at the Stockton Street live animal markets in San Francisco. These topics will be discussed in relation to current regulatory efforts by the veterinary profession and our legislators.**

**Thelma Lee Gross, DVM, has been a boarded veterinary pathologist for 20 years who specializes in surgical pathology and dermatopathology. Currently she is an adjunct professor of dermatopathology in the Department of Medicine and Epidemiology at the School of veterinary medicine in Davis, California.**

**[ [Chairperson Eckman][Discussion Item]**





**7. PUBLIC COMMENT:** *At this point in the meeting advice or comments on items within the Commission's jurisdiction other than the items on the agenda may be discussed. Members of the public can choose to speak either at the beginning or end of the meeting but not both.*

**8. CALENDAR ITEMS**

**9. ADJOURNMENT**

**KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**

**DISABILITY ACCESS**

**Room 408** is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART Station is Civic Center, three blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #42 Downtown Loop, the #71 Haight/Noriega, the F Line to Market and Van Ness and the Metro stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call 923-6142.

There is accessible parking at the following locations: two(2) designated blue curb spaces on the southwest corner of McAllister Street at Van Ness Avenue; the Performing Arts Garage (entrance on Grove Street between Franklin and Gough Streets), and at Civic Center Plaza Garage.

Large print agendas are available by calling Elissa Eckman at (415) 995-4737. The following services are available upon request at least two working days prior to the meeting: American Sign language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting, or a sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. For information or to make arrangements, contact Carla Vaughn at 252-2500 (voice) or 252-2550 (TDD).

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals.

**POLICY ON CELL PHONE, PAGERS, AND ELECTRONIC DEVICES**

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

**KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco's Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact Donna Hall at the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 409, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683; Office (415) 554-7724; Fax (415) 554-7854; E-mail: Donna\_Hall@ci.sf.ca.us

Citizens interested in obtaining a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance can request a copy from Ms. Hall or by printing Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code on the Internet, at <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/bdsupvrs/sunshine.htm>



March 8, 2002

**ATTENTION:** Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 554-9510; fax (415) 703-0121 and web site <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/ethics>



5  
4/02  
**COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL AND WELFARE**

Mailing Address: 1390 Market Street, Room 822  
San Francisco, CA 94102  
Voice Mail: (415) 252-3817

**DOCUMENTS DEPT.**

MAY 21 2002

**MINUTES OF MEETING - MARCH 14, 2002**

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

**1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL**

- (a) Chair Elissa Eckman convened the March 14, 2002 meeting of the Commission of Animal Control to order at approximately 5:38 p.m. at City Hall, Room 408, San Francisco, California.

Commissioners in Attendance: Chair Elissa Eckman; Vice-Chair Sherri Franklin; Secretary June Wilson; Cheryl Bentley; Kelly Jensen, DVM; Carl Friedman, Animal Care & Control; Sgt. Bill Herndon, SFPD; Jack Breslin, Dept. of Health; City Attorney Rosa Sanchez.

Commissioners Absent: Catherine Tchen, Frederick Hobson., absent. *with cause*

Coms. Friedman, Herndon and Breslin left early.

The meeting was convened at 5:38 p.m. and Commission Chair Eckman presided during all aspects of the meeting. Five Commissioners (or their lawful designates) holding valid appointments being present, the quorum requirement of Section 6 of the Commission's Rules & Regulations (50 percent of those eligible to vote) was satisfied.

The Chair then requested, without objection, to take Item 8, New Business, out of order, and a presentation to the Commission followed by Dr. Thelma Lee Gross.

**ITEM TAKEN OUT OF ORDER:**

**8. NEW BUSINESS:**

Dr. Thelma Lee Gross, DVM, will discuss scientific evidence that indicates against live animal market practices, the moral obligation to render the suffering of animals used for human consumption null, and misconceptions concerning several previously presumed humane methods of slaughter. Dr. Gross will review abuses recently observed at the Stockton Street live animal markets in San Francisco. These topics will be discussed in relation to current regulatory efforts by the veterinary profession and our legislators.

Thelma Lee Gross, DVM, has been a boarded veterinary pathologist for 20 years who specializes in surgical pathology and dermatopathology. Currently she is an





**adjunct professor of dermatopathology in the Department of Medicine and Epidemiology at the School of Veterinary Medicine, Davis, California.**  
**[Chairperson Eckman - Discussion Item]**

Dr. Gross addressed the Commission at length, and the following are highlights only of her presentation:

Dr. Gross discussed the increased importance of analgesia in veterinary medicine, and noted that the issue of pain has often been neglected in lower animals because of a lack of knowledge and an inability to recognize pain in those species, but noted that the inability to recognize pain does not mean it does not exist.

She felt that the ignorance of pain perception in animals has colored societal attitudes, and one example is the live markets where she feels animal abuse abounds and involves the infliction of pain on these lower animals, and further noted recently seeing the cutting of fish while still alive, piling up of frogs in plastic bags, fish placed out of water on display, crowding of birds and turtles awaiting sale, and felt that the public remains largely uninvolved in these issues.

She noted that the study of pain and analgesia in lower vertebrates has recently enlarged, and the veterinary community has come to the increasing realization that these animals feel pain as we do, and that this is both from direct experience in handling these animals as doctors and through scientific research.

She noted that the perception of pain occurs only in the conscious animal, and that would be the main issue in most of her presentation. She then discussed the four processes of nociception (pain) and noted that all four processes have been shown to exist in lower vertebrates, birds, amphibians, reptiles. She further discussed the correlative findings for pain in lower vertebrates.

She then discussed the "Origination of Pain in Live Markets," and noted that injury to tissue by poor handling practices increases sensitivity to pain, and noted this occurring in the live markets to frogs, turtles, birds and fish, who can be damaged by pressure or scraping or piling up due to crowding and rough handling, and even inadequate hydration.

She further noted that a dehydrated animal is more susceptible to trauma which will induce pain, that the mucous layer of the skin requires hydration which is easily lost in frogs and fish, making them susceptible to injury which results in pain. She also noted, more importantly, that if there is pain in one localized area, that increases pain sensitivity to other noninjured sites, thus sensitivity to pain is heightened and that sensitivity can spread to noninjured sites.

She further discussed Inhumane Killing, and noted that according to the 2000 Report by the AVMA Panel on Euthanasia, that any physical killing method that does not include previous or concurrent rendering of unconsciousness is unacceptable and inhumane.

She then noted humane methods of killing would include: Decapitation followed by



pithing; or stunning followed by decapitation; and further noted the importance of having an animal be unconscious either simultaneously just before or just after a method of killing. She noted that decapitation alone is not acceptable, because the brains of lower vertebrates are tolerant to conditions of low oxygen and low blood flow, thus they can remain conscious even after decapitation.

She then noted her opinion that it may be physically impossible to humanely kill a turtle using physical methods alone, because the head cannot be painlessly extracted from the shell. She stated decapitation alone is considered only marginally humane in birds, unless it's accompanied by another method to induce rapid loss of consciousness, but that there is some argument about this.

She then stated that humane methods of killing are not occurring consistently if at all in the live markets in San Francisco.

She then discussed the current efforts of the commercial industry and the numerous movements by many institutions to reduce animal suffering in the context of killing for food, and cited many examples, with some noted, in part, as follows:

That U.C. Cal Davis Extension has prepared guidelines for the humane handling and slaughter of various species of farm animals including birds; that a recently formed committee with FSIS is determining how best to establish more definitive criteria for the humane handling of animals; that an extra \$3 million was recently approved for enforcement of the Animal Welfare Act and the Humane Slaughter Act; that in Feb. 2002 the FSIS appointed 17 new vets who will conduct on-site verification of humane handling, stressing that these resources will bolster the FSIS's supervision of humane standards for killing.

She noted that on the state level, the Calif. Dept. of Food & Agriculture has an animal care program, whose whole emphasis is to increase awareness of animal care and handling issues; that the American Humane Assoc. has developed the Free Farmed Certificate Program, a voluntary program, which provides verification that enrolled farms meet the Animal Welfare Standards, and noted their ultimate goal is to certify slaughterhouses as well, thus humane handling will go from rearing all the way up to processing.

She then discussed the current efforts to reduce stress on animals at slaughterhouses, including the future elimination of electric prods, and noted much has been done voluntarily.

She also noted in poultry: That some industry people are considering conveying birds into gas-filled chambers to render them unconscious before slaughter; a reduction in transit times, shipment of the birds at night when it's cooler; and noted that the poultry transportation guidelines are industry-sponsored.

She then discussed the legal efforts that impact live market practices, but noted that despite the laws, there has been no improvement in the plight of the animals of the San







Francisco markets, because there is no organization that is willing or able to ensure and oversee compliance.

She further noted that if the condition of nonenforcement is permitted to continue, then the next step is to abolish the markets, and hoped the Commission, based on the evidence she brought forward, would continue to pursue the abolition of these markets from San Francisco.

The Chair opened the meeting to Public Comment as follows:

Pius Lee, Chinatown Neighborhood Association, addressed the Commission and advised that the merchants in Chinatown's markets are in compliance with AB 2479 and AB 238, that AB 2479 clearly states what you can and cannot do, and noted there are penalties for being in violation, including having your permit revoked. He further noted the requirement of displaying signs which state that the release of live turtles or frogs into the wild or any public water is prohibited by law. He indicated that if violations are seen in Chinatown, to inform the Fish & Game Commission.

He stated that if the Commission wants to improve the conditions in Chinatown, that the pro-animal groups and the community should work together to develop a program to educate the merchants and the general public and to look for a solution, but noted that many merchants don't speak much English.

He further informed the Commission that he thinks it unfair to the Chinese community and the small-business person in Chinatown that the Commission gave Dr. Gross the opportunity to speak without giving the community the opportunity to come and express their position, and further stressed the need to develop an educational program.

Rich Ow stated he was a consumer of live frogs, turtles and fish, and that this has been going on in San Francisco for 150 years. He noted that several years ago there was a court case, and scientific evidence was produced concerning the habitat of the animals, in which the decision was to let Chinatown's fish shops operate as they are.

He further suggested the Commission provide the community with a video that can be translated to Chinese to provide to the fish shops, because they want to follow the rules and regulations. He also hoped the Commission would hear more from the Chinese community, not Chinatown alone.

Eric Mills, Action for Animals, stated he has been working on this issue for over seven years and that nothing has changed. He stated there are two new state laws which have not been enforced on any level, and that the issue has boiled down to a cultural and racial issue, which it absolutely is not.

He further stated that he is in the markets every week and he sees many violations, and that he is concerned about the public health: That he has seen Chinese Softshell Turtles in the markets and is concerned about the diseases and parasites they might be carrying, that



there are only two species of turtles which are allowed in these markets legally, the Red-Eared Slider, and the Spiny Soft Shells.

He further stated that people buy these animals live from the markets and dump them in the wild and it's wiping out the local wildlife, and that these animals can carry diseases and parasites which can kill people.

Dr. Peter Urche, reiterated the comments made by Dr. Gross, that new procedures are now available to evaluate and determine the presence of pain in many species of animals, both vertebrates and invertebrates, and that this information points to the fact that these animals are experiencing severe pain that we previously did not have the ability to determine, and that this needs to be stopped.

Patricia Briggs, presented a poster to the Commission with various photographs depicting violations occurring in the markets involving aquatic animals and fowl, and reminded the Commission that the focus on this issue has been on Chinatown, but the farmer's markets, Fisherman's Wharf and supermarkets should not be overlooked.

She also provided a copy of the Health Dept. reports for a vendor at one of the farmer's market to show there is repeated disregard for these animals.

Jamie Ray, asked several questions, including what the Commission could do about this, and how enforcement would be handled.

Coms. Wilson and Herndon advised that as an advisory board, the comments received from the public will be passed on to the Board of Sups, and that the ultimate decision lies with them. Com. Bentley suggested the public contact every supervisor and attend board meetings and make public comment.

Com. Herndon and Friedman giving a brief history surrounding the problems with enforcement, with Com. Friedman responding that presently his office is overwhelmed and simply does not have the resources for enforcement.

Patricia Kimball stated she was sorry the press had left the meeting early and had missed the health issues, which is the way she feels the problem should be addressed.

Nadine May expressed her regrets that people left the meeting early, and that she felt Fisherman's Wharf and all the animal markets should be included in this issue.

The Chair hearing no further public comment, returned the meeting to the Commission with questions for Dr. Gross.

Com. Bentley inquired about space requirements for birds. Dr. Gross responded that much work has been done in this area, and that specific guidelines had been prepared for the LA live animal markets, with Com. Friedman indicating he had a copy of those guidelines.





Com. Franklin inquired if there was a way to humanely kill these animals for food in the market settings. Dr. Gross responded, that, yes, these animals can be humanely euthanized using physical means, with the exception, in her opinion, of turtles, and further Commission discussion ensued regarding turtles.

The Chair inquired whether you could compare the pain receptors on these vertebrates with the pain receptors found in dogs and cats. Dr. Gross responded that all four of the processes, including reception or perception of pain, are the same based on scientific evidence, and that these fish, turtles, frogs and birds feel pain in the same sense as dogs and cats.

The Chair further inquired if the humane care of these animals in the live markets would include the transport and holding area where they exist before they are dispatched. Dr. Gross responded that it absolutely does. Upon further inquiry, Dr. Gross indicated that the federally regulated industries are striving towards some sort of humane practices, but noted that there was no pretext of humane treatment occurring in the live animal markets.

The Chair hearing no further comment, turned the meeting to Item 6-A on the agenda.

**ITEM TAKEN OUT OF ORDER:**

**6. COMMITTEE REPORTS/COMMISSIONER'S REPORTS [Discussion Item]**

**A. Update on placement of Crime Stoppers posters  
[anti dog fighting]**

Com. Herndon advised he met with the Crime Stopper Board, and that they had voted to stay in business for another six months, and they reaffirmed their commitment for the funding of the posters, so he will get going on it.

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment as follows:

Jamal Modica, President of Tough House, a pitbull club and outreach program, addressed the Commission and gave an overview of his program. He noted that questions had been raised to him of why the boy depicted in the poster was an African-American, and that if he was in a position to handle the posters, he would have a couple more posters with other races depicted as well. That he see all races, ages, sizes, shapes and colors that are into the dog fighting game.

He indicated he thinks the posters are an excellent start, but felt the effort shouldn't stop with just the posters, that there needs to be some other alternatives. He finds that the SPCA and Animal Care do have a lot of information available, but finds himself bombarded with animal-care questions by the community, and feels the areas that are causing the most problems are not being reached, which is one reason why he started Tough House, to have more mobile outreach and sites set up directly in these areas.





Com. Herndon responded that a lot of work went into the posters, and that they didn't want it to look like it was targeting any group. He also explained that the posters were designed to show this was something that affects the youth of America, and to get the message out about animal issues, the cruelty of fighting, and the entire way the public looks at animal issues. He also stated that incidents of dog fighting has decreased in the last few years.

Jamal Modica, then stated that Tough House has many activities in the works, including posters and a movie and soundtrack with a lot of the guys that used to fight dogs and used to sell drugs, but now they're trying to do something positive to try to promote the safety of dogs and trying to stop the fighting. He then offered his assistance or advice, and further stated to keep up the good work.

The Chair hearing no further public comment, Continued on to Item 6-B.

**B. Update on API draft pamphlet regarding declawing fact sheet**

Com. Franklin moved, (seconded by Com. Bentley), that this item be dropped from the agenda. A vote was taken to drop the item with Coms. Franklin, Eckman, Jensen, Bentley voting yes, and Com. Wilson voting no. The item was dropped by a four to one vote.

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment as follows:

L'Danielle questioned why the item was dropped. With various commissioners explaining that the Commission hoped to have its name included in the fact sheet, but that repeated attempts to contact the person working on it had been made to no avail, and that it was believed she was out of state.

**2. PUBLIC COMMENT**

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment:

Pat Briggs stated her dissatisfaction that Coms. Breslin and Friedman had left the meeting early when members of the public had stayed, and she had specific questions for them.

Dr. Ron Cole stated that no one had addressed Pius Lee's request for an educational program, and felt a how-to video in Chinese is needed, because lay people are doing this slaughter. He then suggested that a university would be the logical place to make the video.

Eric Mills, Action for Animals, suggested writing the newspaper Asian Week re this issue. He further discussed a rodeo cruelty issue, called steer-tailing, and left a flier.

The Chair, hearing no further public comment, returned the meeting to the Commission.

**3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF FEBRUARY 14, 2001 MEETING  
[Discussion/Action Item]**



The Chair stated that a recording had not been obtained from the last meeting, and the minutes were prepared by Com. Wilson. No corrections were noted.

Com. Franklin moved, (seconded by Chair Echen) to approve the minutes, and the minutes were unanimously approved.

**4. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT AND OPENING REMARKS [Discussion item]**

(See Item 8, New Business - page 1.)

**4-1. COMMISSIONER PUBLIC COMMENT**

The Chair, hearing no Commissioner comment, continued to Item 5.

**5. STATUS AND TRACKING OF LETTERS OF RECOMMENDATION  
APPROVED BY COMMISSION REQUESTING ACTION BY THE BOARD OF  
SUPERVISORS [DISCUSSION ITEM]**

**1) Live Animal Market [Kuehl Bill compliance]**

Com. Bentley stated that Com. Friedman is going to meet with Sup. Peskin in the next couple weeks.

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment. Hearing none, continued on with Item 2.

**2) Letter sent to Board re UCSF lack of cooperation with City's resolution concerning animal testing.**

The Chair stated she had not been able to work on this, but intends to contact somebody and find out about the public member idea re touring the facilities and how that can be accomplished.

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment as follows:  
Eric Mills, Action for Animals, provided copies of a recent article from Street Sheet concerning the issue of animal shelters selling animals to research facilities.

**3) Letter to Board of Supervisors recommending amending Section 41.12 of the SF Health Code to provide for duties of "Guardians."**

Com. Franklin stated she was getting a positive response from Matt Gonzalez' office, and thinks they'll move on it in the next few months.

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment. Hearing none, continued on with the agenda.





6. **COMMITTEE REPORTS/COMMISSIONER REPORTS**

(Item taken out of order. See page 6.)

7. **OLD BUSINESS**

(No old business.)

8. **NEW BUSINESS**

(Item taken out of order. See page 1.)

9. **PUBLIC COMMENT**

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment as follows:

*com Franklin asked if new meetings were noted + Com Eckenrode answered*  
L'Danielle inquired when the new commissioners would be attending. The Chair responded that she believes two seats would be available, and that applications are being taken by the Clerk of the Board, and that there should be two new commissioners by May. *\*And that it's posted on the City's website.*

The Chair hearing no further public comment, returned the meeting to the Commission.

10. **CALENDAR ITEMS**

No calendar items were noted.

11. **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned, motion by Com. Wilson seconded by Com. Franklin, at approximately 7:45 p.m.

Dated: 22 March, 2002  
Amended: 19 April 2002  
J. Wilson, Secretary

---



DOCUMENTS DEPT.

APR - 5 2002

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

04-0400 (4039300)RNV

## San Francisco Commission of Animal Control and Welfare

**DATE:** APRIL 11, 2002

**TIME:** 5:30 P.M.

**PLACE:** CITY HALL, ROOM 408

**MAILING ADDRESS:**

1390 MARKET STREET, SUITE 822, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

COMMISSION VOICE MAIL: 415-252-3817

COMMISSION CHAIRPERSON, ELISSA ECKMAN:

(VOICE MAIL): (415) 519-0215

**AGENDA OF MEETING - FOR IMMEDIATE RELEASE:**

**Note:** Public comment will be taken on each Discussion/Action Item

1. Call to Order And Roll Call
2. **Public Comment:** At this point in the meeting advice or comments on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda may be discussed. Members of the public can choose to speak either at the beginning or end of the meeting but not both.*
3. Approval of draft <sup>&</sup>minutes of March 2002, meeting. [Discussion/Action item].
4. Chairperson's report and opening remarks [Discussion item]
  - a. Farewell to outgoing Commissioners Hobson and Tchen



April 5, 2002

b. City Council of Fremont disapproves private slaughterhouse for chickens.

**4. Commissioner Public Comment**

**5. Status and tracking of letters of recommendations approved by Commission requesting action by Board of Supervisors [Discussion Item]**

- 1). Live Animal Market [Kuehl] Bill compliance]
- 2.) Letter sent to Board re UCSF lack of cooperation with city's resolution concerning animal testing.
- 3.) Letter to Board of Supervisors recommending amending §41.12 of the SF Health Code to provide for duties of "Guardians".

**6. Committee Reports / Commissioner's Reports [Discussion item]**

- a. Update on placement of Crime Stoppers posters [anti dog fighting]

**7. Old Business** (Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.)

Discussion regarding next step to be taken following March 14, 2002, presentation by Dr. Gross indicating against live animal market practices, the moral obligation to render the suffering of animals used for human consumption null, and misconceptions concerning several previously presumed humane methods of slaughter. [Chairperson Eckman][Discussion/Action Item]

**8. New Business** (Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.)

Discussion of possible uses for the Commission's remaining budget for the fiscal year 2001-2002.

[Full Commission][Discussion/Action Item]

**7. PUBLIC COMMENT:** At this point in the meeting advice or comments on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda may be discussed. Members of the public can choose to speak either at the beginning or end of the meeting but not both.*

**8. CALENDAR ITEMS**

**9. ADJOURNMENT**

**KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**





April 5, 2002

**DISABILITY ACCESS**

Room 408 is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART Station is Civic Center, three blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #42 Downtown Loop, the #71 Haight/Noriega, the F Line to Market and Van Ness and the Metro stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call 923-6142.

There is accessible parking at the following locations: two(2) designated blue curb spaces on the southwest corner of McAllister Street at Van Ness Avenue; the Performing Arts Garage (entrance on Grove Street between Franklin and Gough Streets), and at Civic Center Plaza Garage.

Large print agendas are available by calling Elissa Eckman at (415) 519-0215. The following services are available upon request at least two working days prior to the meeting: American Sign language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting, or a sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. For information or to make arrangements, contact Carla Vaughn at 252-2500 (voice) or 252-2550 (TDD).

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals.

**POLICY ON CELL PHONE, PAGERS, AND ELECTRONIC DEVICES**

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

**KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco's Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact Donna Hall at the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 409, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683; Office (415) 554-7724; Fax (415) 554-7854; E-mail: Donna\_Hall@ci.sf.ca.us

Citizens interested in obtaining a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance can request a copy from Ms. Hall or by printing Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code on the Internet, at <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/bdsupvrs/sunshine.htm>

**ATTENTION:** Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 554-9510; fax (415) 703-0121 and web site <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/ethics>



5  
/02  
**COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL AND WELFARE**

Mailing Address: 1390 Market Street, Room 822

San Francisco, CA 94102

Voice Mail: (415) 252-3817

**DOCUMENTS DEPT.**

**MAY 21 2002**

**DRAFT MINUTES OF MEETING - APRIL 11, 2002**

**SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY**

**1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL**

- (a) Vice-Chair Sherri Franklin convened the April 11, 2002 meeting of the Commission of Animal Control to order at approximately 5:35 p.m., at City Hall, Room 408, San Francisco California.

Commissioners in Attendance: Chair Elissa Eckman (arriving at 5:40), Vice-Chair Sherri Franklin, Secretary June Wilson, Cheryl Bentley, Frederick Hobson (arriving at 5:40), Kelly Jensen, DVM, Catherine Tchen (arriving at 5:45), Carl Friedman, Animal Care & Control, Sgt. Bill Herndon, SFPD. City Attorney Rosa Sanchez.

Commissioners Absent: Com. Breslin, Dept. of Health.

Commissioners leaving early: Coms. Herndon (6:30), Com. Jensen (7:15), Com. Hobson (7:15). City Attorney Sanchez (7:15).

The meeting was convened at 5:35 p.m. by Vice-Chair Franklin, after which Commission Chair Eckman arrived and then presided during the remaining aspects of the meeting. Seven Commissioners (or their lawful designates) holding valid appointments being present, the quorum requirement of Section 6 of the Commission's Rules & Regulations (50 percent of those eligible to vote) was satisfied.

**2. PUBLIC COMMENT:**

The Vice-Chair opened the meeting to public comment as follows:

Eric Mills, Action for Animals, provided a flier re rodeo cruelty.

Steve Cockrell, City Dogs, provided an update re Park & Rec's new dog policy, which he thinks is unacceptable, and stated that City Dogs and SF Dog are working on an alternative policy. He further noted that Park & Rec had received over 2,600 public comments, and that they had not looked at or analyzed over half of the comments.

**3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF MARCH 14, 2002 MEETING  
[Discussion/Action Item]**

Com. Bentley requested a sentence be added to Item No. 9: That Com. Franklin had





asked that the Chair insure that vacancies be legally noticed. Com. Franklin stated she didn't recall it, and it was decided to consult the tape.

It was noted that the minutes should reflect that Coms. Hobson and Tchen were "absent with cause."

The Chair moved, (seconded by Com. Franklin) to approve the minutes, and the minutes were approved, (with Coms. Eckman, Franklin, Wilson, Bentley, Jensen, voting yes, (and Com. Hobson and Tchen not voting).

#### **4. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT AND OPENING REMARKS [Discussion item]**

##### **a. Farewell to outgoing Coms. Hobson and Tchen.**

The Chair opened the meeting to commissioner and public comment, with several members of the public and commissioners giving their thanks and farewells to Coms. Hobson and Tchen for their hard work and service to the Commission and for animals.

##### **b. City Council of Fremont disapproves private slaughterhouse for chickens.**

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment, with Eric Mills, Action for Animals, stating that he had attended the Fremont Council meeting, that it had been a major victory, the Council voted 5 to 0 not to allow the slaughterhouse.

#### **4-1. COMMISSIONER PUBLIC COMMENT**

Com. Bentley provided leaflets regarding an upcoming event, then noted that she has learned that since the Whipple verdict, tenants have been having problems with landlords disallowing dogs where they previously had been allowed, and noted that she has asked the City Attorney to look into this matter.

She then stated that a friend had contacted the Board of Sups. Clerk's Office in an attempt to obtain info on the Commission, and that the Clerk's office had no information regarding the Commission, not even a phone number, and hoped this could be checked out. The Chair suggested this item be agendized.

Com. Wilson indicated she had been contacted by a citizen who reports that skunks and raccoons are taking over the Presidio, and there is a concern about rabies. Com. Friedman indicated that SF is pretty much rabies free, that SF hasn't had a case of rabies in a dog or cat in over 50 years, and then noted that the Presidio is not on City property, and that this is an issue for the Presidio Trust. Com. Wilson will look into it.

Com. Hobson stated he had been informed that Sup. Peskin has dropped his plans to carry legislation to the Board to enforce the Kuehl Bill, due to unwillingness by city departments to enforce it. Com. Bentley stated that Sup. Peskin had asked the Dept. of Health and



Animal Care & Control if they would enforce, but they had refused to enforce it. Com. Friedman responded that he had not refused to enforce, that it was Sup. Peskin's decision to drop the legislation.

Tia Redland, stated that for the live food markets, she would like to see the problem addressed to allow for more humane treatment, but allowances made for cultural food.

Hearing no further commissioner or public comment, the Chair returned the meeting to the Commission with Com. Herndon requesting Item 6-A be taken out of order.

**ITEM HEARD OUT OF ORDER:**

**6. COMMITTEE REPORTS/COMMISSIONER'S REPORTS [Discussion Item]**

**A. Update on placement of Crime Stoppers posters  
[anti dog fighting]**

Com. Herndon advised, he had received the commitment for funding from Crime Stoppers and Animal Control, and that as soon as he receives the disk, he will get pricing.

Com. Wilson suggested the Commission fund more posters. Com. Herndon indicated that the City of Oakland wants to put them up in Oakland as well.

**ITEM HEARD OUT OF ORDER:**

**7. OLD BUSINESS**

Discussion regarding next step to be taken following March 14, 2002 presentation by Dr. Gross indicating against live animal market practices, the moral obligation to render the suffering of animals used for human consumption null, and misconceptions concerning several previously presumed humane methods of slaughter. [Chairperson Eckman] [Discussion/Action Item.]

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment:

Eric Mills, Action for Animals, indicated Dr. Gross' study has been submitted to the Journal of American Veterinary Association.

Dr. Ron Cole, suggested the Commission prevail upon Dr. Gross and U.C. Davis to make some educational videos, which could be used by employees of the live animal markets, with translations.

Hearing no further public comment, the Chair returned the meeting to the Commission, where further lengthy discussion ensued with Com. Hobson making an amended motion, (seconded by Com. Tchen), as follows:

"That the sale of live animals sold for human consumption on city property be





heretofore prohibited; that that recommendation go to the Board of Supervisors in a letter signed by the officers of the Commission."

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment, with Eric Mills giving his support for the motion. Hearing no further public comment, further Commission discussion ensued.

The Chair stated that Com. Hobson's motion was not dealing with the agenda item re Dr. Gross's presentation, and that she felt further study and time is needed before any recommendation is sent to the Board, with Com. Jensen noting that she was going to try to provide further information to the Commission and perhaps videos. Several commissioners felt that further study was not needed for the Commission to make their recommendation, and parts of Dr. Gross's presentation could be incorporated in the letter.

A vote was taken on Com. Hobson's motion with Coms. Hobson, Tchen and Bentley voting yes, and Coms. Eckman, Franklin, Jensen and Wilson voting no. The motion did not pass.

The Chair requested putting the item over to next month's agenda.

**5. STATUS AND TRACKING OF LETTERS OF RECOMMENDATION  
APPROVED BY COMMISSION REQUESTING ACTION BY THE BOARD OF  
SUPERVISORS [DISCUSSION ITEM]**

**1) Live Animal Market [Kuehl Bill compliance]**

Com. Bentley stated there is a possibility of a lawsuit since the City has refused to enforce the law.

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment. Hearing none, continued on with Item 2.

**2) Letter sent to Board re UCSF lack of cooperation with City's resolution concerning animal testing.**

The Chair stated she had heard that In Defense of Animals is again trying to take some action on this item, and they wanted to inform the Commission that they are writing a letter re a primate experiment.

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment. Hearing none, continued with Item 3.

**3) Letter to Board of Supervisors recommending amending Section 41.12 of the SF Health Code to provide for duties of "Guardians."**





Com. Franklin stated that she has received positive feedback re this item, but that it is very difficult to get appointments with the supervisors, but hopes it will get pushed through.

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment. Hearing none, continued on with Item 8.

(Items 6 and 7 heard out of order.)

## **8. NEW BUSINESS**

Discussion of possible uses for the Commission's remaining budget for the fiscal year 2001-2002.

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment. Hearing none, the Commission discussed uses of the remaining budget as follows:

Com. Franklin suggested producing a leaflet to educate the public about the Commission, which could be placed in vet clinics, etc to encourage more public participation. Com. Friedman suggested the Commission have a logo made.

The Chair suggested that the Commission consider whether it's a necessary expense to continue having such detailed minutes prepared, because it is expensive.

Com. Friedman stated he would talk to the budget people and determine whether the existing budget could be carried forward, or whether the Commission should spend what they have now on the leaflets and Crime Stopper posters.

## **9. PUBLIC COMMENT**

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment:

Eric Mills suggested having a contest for school kids to come up with a logo.

Gina Eichler suggested the Commission produce some educational information in light of the dog mauling trial.

## **10. CALENDAR ITEMS**

Com. Franklin stated she had received calls from citizens about different responses to animal emergencies from 911 or ACC, and that they are being bounced back and forth. She indicated she had spoken to the public safety coordinator for the Emergency Communications Department to discuss the possibility of a set of questions that the 911 operators could use, so that animal emergency calls would go to the right place, and requests Commission discussion.



Com. Wilson advised that Cable Station 29, which has a large audience in the Bay Area, has some free air time available and a studio in which to make videos, which may be of use to the Commission.

**11. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned, motion by Com. Franklin seconded by Com. Wilson at approximately 7:30 p.m.

Dated: 19<sup>th</sup> April, 2002

Amended: *no amendments*

Wilson, Secretary

---





# San Francisco Commission of Animal Control and Welfare

**DATE:** MAY 9, 2002

**TIME:** 5:30 P.M.

**PLACE:** CITY HALL, ROOM 408

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

MAY 6 2002

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

**MAILING ADDRESS:**

1390 MARKET STREET, SUITE 822, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

COMMISSION VOICE MAIL: 415-252-3817

COMMISSION CHAIRPERSON, ELISSA ECKMAN:

(VOICE MAIL): (415) 519-0215

**AGENDA OF MEETING - FOR IMMEDIATE RELEASE:**

**Note:** Public comment will be taken on each Discussion/Action Item

1. Call to Order And Roll Call
2. **Public Comment:** At this point in the meeting advice or comments on items within the Commission's jurisdiction other than the items on the agenda may be discussed. Members of the public can choose to speak either at the beginning or end of the meeting but not both.
3. Approval of draft minutes of April 2002, meeting. [Discussion/Action item].
4. Chairperson's report and opening remarks [Discussion item]
  - a. Welcome to new Commissioners Laurie Kennedy, Jamal Modica, and Kelly Jensen, DVM
  - b. Commission voice mail needs to be updated
5. Commissioner Public Comment
6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendations approved by Commission requesting action by Board of Supervisors [Discussion Item]



May 6, 2002

- 1.) Live Animal Market [Kuehl Bill compliance]
  - 2.) Letter sent to Board re UCSF lack of cooperation with city's resolution concerning animal testing.
  - 3.) Letter to Board of Supervisors recommending amending §41.12 of the SF Health Code to provide for duties of "Guardians".
- 6. Committee Reports / Commissioner's Reports [Discussion item]**
- a. Update on placement of Crime Stoppers posters [anti dog fighting]
- 7. Old Business** (Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.)
- A. Continued discussion regarding appropriate action to be taken following March 14, 2002, presentation by Dr. Gross indicating against live animal market practices, the moral obligation to render the suffering of animals used for human consumption null, and misconceptions concerning several previously presumed humane methods of slaughter. [Chairperson Eckman/Commissioner Jensen, DVM][Discussion/Action Item]
  - B. Continued Discussion of possible uses for the Commission's remaining budget for the fiscal year 2001-2002.
    1. Professional composition and distribution of fliers through graphics department
    2. Other  
[Full Commission][Discussion/Action Item]
- 8. New Business** (Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.)
- A. What action should The Commission take concerning San Francisco Recreation and Parks Department proposed dog policy?  
[Commissioner Franklin][Discussion/Action Item]
  - B. Whether the Commission should write a letter to the Board urging them to convene oversight hearings regarding UCSF's continuing violations of the Animal Welfare Act and to institute some sort of city oversight of UCSF animal testing such as requesting that a member of this commission be allowed to inspect their animal testing facilities for compliance.  
[Chair Eckman][Discussion/Action Item]





May 6, 2002

**C. Whether Commissioner Public Comment should remain on the agenda in extemporaneous form.**

**[Chair Eckman][Discussion/Action Item]**

- 7. PUBLIC COMMENT:** At this point in the meeting advice or comments on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda may be discussed. Members of the public can choose to speak either at the beginning or end of the meeting but not both.*

**8. CALENDAR ITEMS**

**9. ADJOURNMENT**

**KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**

**DISABILITY ACCESS**

**Room 408** is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART Station is Civic Center, three blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #42 Downtown Loop, the #71 Haight/Noriega, the F Line to Market and Van Ness and the Metro stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call 923-6142.

There is accessible parking at the following locations: two(2) designated blue curb spaces on the southwest corner of McAllister Street at Van Ness Avenue; the Performing Arts Garage (entrance on Grove Street between Franklin and Gough Streets), and at Civic Center Plaza Garage.

Large print agendas are available by calling Elissa Eckman at (415) 519-0215. The following services are available upon request at least two working days prior to the meeting: American Sign language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting, or a sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. For information or to make arrangements, contact Carla Vaughn at 252-2500 (voice) or 252-2550 (TDD).

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals.

**POLICY ON CELL PHONE, PAGERS, AND ELECTRONIC DEVICES**





May 6, 2002

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

**KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco's Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact Donna Hall at the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 409, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683; Office (415) 554-7724; Fax (415) 554-7854; E-mail: Donna\_Hall@ci.sf.ca.us

Citizens interested in obtaining a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance can request a copy from Ms. Hall or by printing Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code on the Internet, at <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/bdsupvrs/sunshine.htm>

**ATTENTION:** Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 554-9510; fax (415) 703-0121 and web site <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/ethics>



55  
/02  
**COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL AND WELFARE**

Mailing Address: 1390 Market Street, Room 822  
San Francisco, CA 94102  
Voice Mail: (415) 252-3817

**DOCUMENTS DEPT.**

**MINUTES OF MEETING - MAY 9, 2002**

**JUN 17 2002**

**SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY**

**1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL**

- (a) Chair Elissa Eckman convened the May 9, 2002 meeting of the Commission of Animal Control to order at approximately 5:30 p.m. at City Hall, Room 408, San Francisco California.

Commissioners in Attendance: Chair Elissa Eckman; Vice-Chair Sherri Franklin; Secretary June Wilson; Cheryl Bentley; Kelly Jensen, DVM; Laurie Kennedy; Jamal Modica; Jack Breslin, Dept. of Health; Carl Friedman, Animal Care & Control. City Attorney Rosa Sanchez.

Commissioners absent with cause: Com. Herndon, SFPD.

Commissioners leaving early: Coms. Breslin and Friedman (6:55). City Attorney Sanchez, (due to illness, 6:15).

The meeting was convened at 5:30 p.m. by Commission Chair Eckman, who presided during all aspects of the meeting. Seven Commissioners (or their lawful designates) holding valid appointments being present, the quorum requirement of Section 6 of the Commission's Rules & Regulations (50 percent of those eligible to vote) was satisfied.

(Note: Many items heard out of order, without objection.)

**4. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT AND OPENING REMARKS [DISCUSSION ITEM].**

- A. Welcome to new Commissioners Laurie Kennedy, Jamal Modica, and Kelly Jensen, DVM.**

The Chair welcomed the new commissioners, then opened the meeting to public comment.

**2. PUBLIC COMMENT:**

Christine Garcia, stated that her efforts at appointment to this Commission had been sabotaged by a commissioner, and expressed her hope that the Commission would in the future work together more cooperatively.

Former Com. Frederick Hobson requested he continue receiving the agenda/minutes, and advised that he had an immediate disclosure request.





Tia Resleure, noted that the Commission's website needs updating, and requested that copies of the letters sent to the Board be posted on the website.

The Chair, hearing no further public comment, returned to Item 3.

**3. APPROVAL OF DRAFT MINUTES OF APRIL 2002 MEETING**  
**[Discussion/Action item.]**

The Chair moved, (seconded by Com. Franklin) to approve the minutes, and the minutes were unanimously approved.

**8. NEW BUSINESS**

**B. Whether the Commission should write a letter to the Board urging them to convene oversight hearings regarding UCSF's continuing violations of the Animal Welfare Act and to institute some sort of City oversight of UCSF animal testing, such as requesting that a member of this Commission be allowed to inspect their animal testing facilities for compliance.**

Suzanne Roy, In Defense of Animals, advised the Commission that despite the City's 1998 resolution, UCSF continues to receive citations for violating the Animal Welfare Act. She then described the controversial monkey experiments, noting repeated violations with these experiments.

She urged the Commission to take action by: Encouraging the Board of Sups to convene hearings to hold UCSF accountable; that a recommendation be made to the Board to pass an ordinance, (such as the Cambridge, MA ordinance), giving local inspection and enforcement authority to the City; and then urged the Commission to take a firm stand against the animal cruelty involved in the monkey experiments.

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment as follows:

Eric Mills, Action for Animals, noted that UCSF's oversight committee meetings are closed, and they should be open. Tia Resleure, urged the Commission approach this issue as an animal-welfare rather than an animal-rights stance.

Dr. Elliot Katz, In Defense of Animals, noted that the info IDA documented is a finding by the Dept of Agriculture. IDA has not asked to stop the research, but are addressing a specific researcher found in violation. He further noted that this information has been provided to the Board, and urged holding hearings.

Frederick Hobson, stated that a past City Attorney opinion indicated that only the Sec. of Agriculture could grant the right to be on the oversight committee, and urged holding hearings.

Subscription price, Five Dollars per Annum in Advance. Single Copies, Fifteen Cents.  
Entered as Second-Class Matter, October 3, 1917, Post Office at Chicago, Ill., under  
Post Office No. 312, Special Delivery.

Acceptance for mailing at special rate of postage provided for in Act of October 3, 1917,  
authorized on July 16, 1918.

Copyright, 1919, by American Medical Association  
Published by the American Medical Association, 535 North Dearborn Street, Chicago, Ill.

Subscription orders, notices of change of address, notices of discontinuance, and all other  
communications should be sent to the Editor.

Advertisements should be sent to the Business Manager, American Medical Association,  
535 North Dearborn Street, Chicago, Ill.

Advertisements for medicinal products should be sent to the Editor, American Medical  
Association, 535 North Dearborn Street, Chicago, Ill.

Advertisements for medical instruments should be sent to the Editor, American Medical  
Association, 535 North Dearborn Street, Chicago, Ill.

Advertisements for medical books should be sent to the Editor, American Medical  
Association, 535 North Dearborn Street, Chicago, Ill.

Advertisements for medical supplies should be sent to the Editor, American Medical  
Association, 535 North Dearborn Street, Chicago, Ill.

Advertisements for medical services should be sent to the Editor, American Medical  
Association, 535 North Dearborn Street, Chicago, Ill.

Advertisements for medical organizations should be sent to the Editor, American Medical  
Association, 535 North Dearborn Street, Chicago, Ill.

Advertisements for medical societies should be sent to the Editor, American Medical  
Association, 535 North Dearborn Street, Chicago, Ill.

Advertisements for medical associations should be sent to the Editor, American Medical  
Association, 535 North Dearborn Street, Chicago, Ill.

Advertisements for medical institutions should be sent to the Editor, American Medical  
Association, 535 North Dearborn Street, Chicago, Ill.

Advertisements for medical departments should be sent to the Editor, American Medical  
Association, 535 North Dearborn Street, Chicago, Ill.

Advertisements for medical journals should be sent to the Editor, American Medical  
Association, 535 North Dearborn Street, Chicago, Ill.

The Chair, hearing no further public comment, returned the meeting to the Commission.

The Chair noted that the Cambridge ordinance mandates City oversight by appointing a commissioner to oversee the care and use of lab animals, and suggested one avenue would be to create an ordinance.

She further discussed her present efforts to arrange a process for the Commission to report directly to the Board on items of concern, and further Commission discussion ensued.

The Chair moved, (seconded by Bentley) that the Chair write a short demand letter setting forth what has happened in the past and requesting or stating that the Commission will be addressing them in the near future. The motion was unanimously passed by the Commission.

## **8. NEW BUSINESS**

### **A. What action should the Commission take concerning San Francisco Recreation and Parks Department proposed dog policy? [Com. Franklin] [Discussion/Action Item]**

Com. Franklin stated that Rec & Park voted to approve the dog policy at their recent meeting, and that the majority of speakers were opposed to the policy, including herself.

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment:

Steve Cockrell, City Dogs, requested the Commission support the proposal of taking this item to the Board, that supervisors had promised that if Rec & Park did not come up with an equitable compromise, then the Board would assume authority over this matter, and stated that the public has been ignored in this process. He requested the Commission write a letter to the Board requesting hearings.

Jane Fedor, stated that the Commission has an obligation to the public to ensure that the Board takes action against the approved dog policy, because it is unacceptably inhumane and restricts off-leash to a degree that is unnecessary, and noted that the public was not heard. Dr. Elliot Katz stated the Commission should make a stand against the policy. Tia Resleure stated she was in favor of the Gold Bone Program.

The Chair, hearing no further public comment, returned the meeting to the Commission where further discussion ensued.

Com. Franklin moved, (seconded by Com. Jensen) that the Commission write a letter expressing its disapproval of the policy. The motion was unanimously passed by the Commission. Coms. Kennedy and Franklin will draft the letter.





## **7. OLD BUSINESS**

- A. Continued discussion regarding appropriate action to be taken following March 14, 2002, presentation by Dr. Gross indicating against live animal market practices [Chair Eckman and Com. Jensen] [Discussion/Action item]**

Com. Jensen stated she had spoken to Dr. Gross, that she felt the issue was more with the keeping of the animals and less with how they are killed, the one exception being turtles, and felt this should be an item to speak directly to the Board about.

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment:

Dr. Katz stated that this is not an animal rights issue, but an issue with the way the animals are being kept, and further noted that he has visited the markets, and that as a vet, could attest to some of the extremely poor conditions. Remarks also made by Eric Mills, Tia R. and Frederick Hobson.

The Chair, hearing no further public comment, returned the meeting to the Commission.

Com. Modica inquired if any progress had been made regarding the informational video in Chinese, with Com. Kennedy stating she has a friend willing to do the translations. Com. Jensen indicated she is working on a leaflet with guidelines, etc. Com. Kennedy suggested getting community feedback.

Further discussion ensued, and the item was continued.

- B. Continued discussion of possible uses for the Commission's remaining budget for the fiscal year 2001-2002.**

- 1. Professional composition and distribution of fliers through Graphics Department.**

Coms. Franklin and Bentley stated they would work on the wording for the fliers. Com. Kennedy suggested having a contest for art students to come up with a logo, and will attempt to pull it together before the next meeting.

- 2. Other [Full Commission] [Discussion/Action Item.]**  
Com. Modica raised the idea of a fund-raiser/party.

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment:

Frederick Hobson stated that the Commission should have a fax number. Dr. Katz suggested hiring someone to prepare press releases for the Commission, which would increase public awareness. Several members of the public suggested putting the logo contest out to the entire art community, including all schools.





The Chair, hearing no further public comment, returned the meeting to the Commission.

**8. NEW BUSINESS**

**C. Whether Commissioner Public Comment should remain on the agenda in extemporaneous form. [Chair Eckman] [Discussion/Action item.]**

The Chair gave a brief overview, then opened the meeting to public comment:

Frederick Hobson urged that the item remain on the agenda. Dr. Katz suggested imposing time limits. Dr. Ron Cole was in favor of rescinding it.

The Chair, hearing no further public comment, returned the meeting to the Commission.

Com. Bentley moved, (seconded by Com. Franklin), that this matter be reconsidered in three months, so that the new commissioners will know what's going on. The motion passed with Coms. Bentley, Franklin, Jensen, Kennedy and Modica voting yes, and Coms. Eckman and Wilson voting no.

**6. STATUS AND TRACKING OF LETTERS OF RECOMMENDATION APPROVED BY COMMISSION REQUESTING ACTION BY THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS [DISCUSSION ITEM]**

- 1. Live Animal Market [Kuehl Bill Compliance.]**  
(Previously covered. No public comment noted.)
- 2. Letter sent to Board Re UCSF lack of cooperation with City's Resolution concerning animal testing.**  
(Previously covered. No public comment noted.)
- 3. Letter to Board of Supervisors recommending amending Sec. 41.12 of the SF Health Code to provide for duties of "Guardians."**

Com. Franklin is working on this item. The Chair opened the meeting to public comment:

Dr. Katz noted that the SF SPCA is in support of this change, and provided a booklet. Tia Resleure stated she was opposed to this change.

The Chair, hearing no further public comment, returned the meeting to the Commission.

**6A. COMMITTEE REPORTS/COMMISSIONER'S REPORTS [Discussion Item]**

- a. Update on placement of Crime Stoppers posters [anti dog fighting]**  
Com. Herndon absent, item continued.



**4. CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT AND OPENING REMARKS [DISCUSSION ITEM].**

**B. Commission voicemail needs to be updated**

The Chair discussed updating the voicemail to advise the public where to send letters, etc. which it presently does not do.

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment, with Frederick Hobson suggesting the purchase of a fax machine and the Commission's own voicemail.

**7A. PUBLIC COMMENT:**

(No public comment noted.)

**8A. CALENDAR ITEMS**

Frederick Hobson requested a possible action item be calendared re: a proposed recommendation to the Board to boycott those cosmetic companies which use testing in animals.

**9. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned, motion by Com. Bentley, seconded by Com. Franklin at approximately 8:05 p.m.

Dated: 17<sup>th</sup> May, 2002

Amended:

Wilson, Secretary

---





5  
3/02  

# San Francisco Commission of Animal Control and Welfare

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

**DATE: JUNE 13, 2002**

JUN 10 2002

**TIME: 5:30 P.M.**

**PLACE: CITY HALL, ROOM 408**

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

**MAILING ADDRESS:**

1390 MARKET STREET, SUITE 822, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

COMMISSION VOICE MAIL: 415-252-3817

COMMISSION CHAIRPERSON, ELISSA ECKMAN:

(VOICE MAIL): (415) 519-0215

**AGENDA OF MEETING - FOR IMMEDIATE RELEASE:**

Note: Public comment will be taken on each Discussion/Action Item

1. Call to Order And Roll Call
2. Public Comment: At this point in the meeting advice or comments on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda may be discussed. Members of the public can choose to speak either at the beginning or end of the meeting but not both.*
3. Approval of draft minutes of May 9, 2002, meeting. [Discussion/Action item].
4. Chairperson's report and opening remarks [Discussion item]
  - a. Commission begins the April term on a positive note.
  - b. Noteworthy article in June 5, 2002, Chronicle regarding rescue of animals from live animal markets.
5. Commissioner Public Comment



June 10, 2002

**6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendations approved by Commission requesting action by Board of Supervisors [Discussion Item]**

- 1) Letter sent to Board re UCSF lack of cooperation with city's resolution concerning animal testing.
- 2) Letter to Board of Supervisors recommending amending §41.12 of the SF Health Code to provide for duties of "Guardians".
- 3) Letter sent to the Board regarding Park and Recreation's dog policy.

**7. Committee Reports / Commissioner's Reports [Discussion item]**

- a. Status of Crime Stoppers Posters Project [anti dog fighting]
- b. Commission informational pamphlet/flyer and logo
- c. State of Commission's budget for 2002-2003 and whether budget will be carried over

**8. Old Business** (Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.)

- A. Following the March 14, 2002, presentation by Dr. Gross indicating against live animal market practices: a discussion on whether the Commission should send the Board of Supervisors a letter recommending the suspension of live animals sales (vertebrates) for human consumption pending compliance with State law (specifically the Kuehl Bill and anti-cruelty provisions). [Chairperson Eckman/Commissioner Jensen, DVM][Discussion/Action Item]

**9. New Business** (Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.)

- A. Sunshine Ordinance presentation/training by the City Attorney's Office to familiarize members of the Commission with its requirements. [Chair Eckman][Discussion Item]

**10. PUBLIC COMMENT:** At this point in the meeting advice or comments on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda may be discussed. Members of the public can choose to speak either at the beginning or end of the meeting but not both.***11. CALENDAR ITEMS****12. ADJOURNMENT**





June 10, 2002

## **KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**

### **DISABILITY ACCESS**

**Room 408** is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART Station is Civic Center, three blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #42 Downtown Loop, the #71 Haight/Noriega, the F Line to Market and Van Ness and the Metro stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call 923-6142.

There is accessible parking at the following locations: two(2) designated blue curb spaces on the southwest corner of McAllister Street at Van Ness Avenue; the Performing Arts Garage (entrance on Grove Street between Franklin and Gough Streets), and at Civic Center Plaza Garage.

Large print agendas are available by calling Elissa Eckman at (415) 519-0215. The following services are available upon request at least two working days prior to the meeting: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting, or a sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. For information or to make arrangements, contact Carla Vaughn at 252-2500 (voice) or 252-2550 (TDD).

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals.

### **POLICY ON CELL PHONE, PAGERS, AND ELECTRONIC DEVICES**

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

## **KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco's Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact Donna Hall at the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 409, 1 Dr. Carlton B.





June 10, 2002

Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683; Office (415) 554-7724; Fax (415) 554-7854; E-mail: Donna\_Hall@ci.sf.ca.us

Citizens interested in obtaining a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance can request a copy from Ms. Hall or by printing Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code on the Internet, at <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/bdsupvrs/sunshine.htm>

**ATTENTION:** Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 554-9510; fax (415) 703-0121 and web site <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/ethics>



# COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL AND WELFARE

Mailing Address: 1390 Market Street, Room 822

San Francisco, CA 94102

Voice Mail: (415) 252-3817

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

JUL 18 2002

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

## MINUTES OF MEETING - JUNE 13, 2002

### 1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

- (a) Chair Elissa Eckman convened the June 13, 2002 meeting of the Commission of Animal Control to order at approximately 5:40 p.m., at City Hall, Room 408, San Francisco California.

Commissioners in Attendance: Chair Elissa Eckman; Vice-Chair Sherri Franklin; Secretary June Wilson; Cheryl Bentley; Kelly Jensen, DVM; Laurie Kennedy; Jamal Modica; Jack Breslin, Dept. of Health; Carl Friedman, Animal Care & Control, Sgt. Bill Herndon, SFPD.

The meeting was convened at 5:40 p.m. by Commission Chair Eckman, who presided during all aspects of the meeting. Seven Commissioners (or their lawful designates) holding valid appointments being present, the quorum requirement of Section 6 of the Commission's Rules & Regulations (50 percent of those eligible to vote) was satisfied.

Absent: Rosa Sanchez, City Attorney.

Commissioners leaving early: Coms. Breslin and Herndon (7:15)

### 2. PUBLIC COMMENT

Steve Cockrell, President, City Dogs SF, thanked the Commission for its letter to the Board re the RPD dog policy, and advised that the item is going for hearings.

He further noted that in March the Golden Gate Audubon Society put forward a plan for quail recovery in SF that many felt had serious issues regarding cats and dogs, trees and public input, and that those issues had been raised, but the Audubon Society has not responded to requests to meet. He requested the support of the Commission in having a quail recovery plan that has community consensus and is sensitive to the needs of pet owners and all members of the community.

Frederick Hobson noted that two items he had discussed were not included in the last minutes and requested they be included: 1) That he had requested to continue receiving the minutes and agenda and had been advised that the request needed to be put in writing; 2) That he spoke on the behavior of Com. Wilson.





He further stated that former Com. Tchen had sent a letter indicating that although requested, she was not receiving the agenda or the minutes, with Mr. Hobson noting that this is in violation of the Sunshine and Brown Act.

The Chair, hearing no further public comment, moved Agenda Item 8-A be heard out of order, (Seconded by Com. Jensen).

**ITEM HEARD OUT OF ORDER:**

**8. OLD BUSINESS**

- A. Following the March 14, 2002, presentation by Dr. Gross indicating against live animal market practices: a discussion on whether the Commission should send the Board of Supervisors a letter recommending the suspension of live animals sales (vertebrates) for human consumption pending compliance with State Law (specifically the Kuehl Bill and anti-cruelty provisos). [Chairperson Eckman/Com. Jensen, DVM] [Discussion/Action Item]**

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment. Hearing none, returned the item to the Commission and a lengthy discussion ensued:

Com. Jensen indicated that the Commission could present Dr. Gross's information to the Board as yet another reason to enforce the law, and that the enforcement aspect is what she is interested in.

Com. Friedman stated he had called State Fish & Game and was advised that they had recently looked at some of the vendors and shops and had issued two citations. He further noted that, if people see violations in the markets, to call Fish & Game and they will respond with whatever resources available.

The Chair noted that the Kuehl Bill adds to the existing Penal Code, that while the Kuehl bill does not specifically mention fish, Section A and C of the Penal Code do with regard to humane treatment of animals which include fish, and noted that the Commission should ask that the City enforce the law.

The Chair further noted she had recently been interviewed by KTSF, and that their footage was the best argument for enforcement of the Kuehl Bill, and further stated that now is the right time to address this issue and urged the Commission to vote for writing a letter to the Board requesting compliance with the Kuehl Bill and with the Penal Code, and that there should be a suspension of live-animal sales in farmers markets and live animal markets.

Com. Bentley urged for requesting the suspension, because it could be done right away, that if the Commission asks only for enforcement, the enforcing bodies would say they don't have the resources.



Com. Kennedy inquired about the enforcement problems, with the Chair giving an overview of the laws and Com. Friedman advising that under the Kuehl Bill a violation is an infraction with a fine not to exceed \$250 or no more than \$1,000, or they can take an educational course, if available.

The Chair moved, (Seconded by Com. Wilson), that Com. Jensen write a letter to the Board of Supervisors detailing the findings of Dr. Gross, mentioning the law and requesting a hearing. If a hearing is then granted, the Commission can go into more detail at that time. The vote was taken and the motion was passed unanimously by the Commission.

The Chair then requested, without objection, to take Agenda Item 9-A out of order.

**ITEM HEARD OUT OF ORDER:**

**9. NEW BUSINESS**

- A. Sunshine Ordinance presentation/training by the City Attorney's Office to familiarize members of the Commission with its requirements. [Chair Eckman]  
[Discussion Item]

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment:

Frederick Hobson stated that there is a need for this training, because there have been violations.

Paul Zarefsky and Edward Olson from the City Attorney's Office gave a presentation/training session to the members of the Commission and passed out a training booklet for the Commissioners. Mr. Zarefsky's discussion focused on the following three topics: 1) What is a meeting; 2) Notice and Agenda Requirements; and 3) Public Comment Requirements. Following the presentation was a lengthy question-and-answer session from the Commissioners, which included (among others) discussion of public records requests, and whether Commissioner Comments needed to be agendaized. Com. Bentley read and provided copies of a letter from Chin Chi re her not receiving the agenda and minutes.

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment. Hearing none, returned the meeting to the Commission and requested without object to taking Agenda Item 7 out of order.

**ITEM HEARD OUT OF ORDER:**

**7. Committee Reports/Commissioner's Reports [Discussion item.]**

- a. Status of Crime Stoppers Posters Project [anti dog fighting]

Com. Herndon updated the Commission, advising that the person who was handling the posters had resigned, that he had just received the materials back, but nothing had been





done with it. He will now have it sent to the City printer. Coms. Wilson and Modica offered their help. Com. Modica suggested that doing a commercial or skit on public access TV might be a great way to get the message out as well.

The Chair and Com. Modica noted that Elliot Katz had offered money in addition to what the Commission has for the posters.

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment as follows:

A member of the public spoke of her concern that this project might not get completed and appealed to the Commission to make sure this valuable project is completed. Frederick Hobson noted his concern that the posters be completed as well.

#### **HEARD OUT OF ORDER:**

**c. Commission's budget for 2002-2003 and whether budget will be carried over.**

Com. Friedman stated he had spoken to the finance director and that starting July 1, the budget will be \$10,000, but thinks carry-forward will probably not be allowed.

Com. Modica inquired about fund-raising, with Com. Friedman indicating he believes you can do fund-raising, but that the City Attorney should be consulted.

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment:

Frederick Hobson suggesting that the funding be used for public records requests and for providing agendas and minutes. He further noted he wants to receive copies of the minutes as well as the agenda, and that he had not received the minutes, even though he requested it in writing.

Hearing no further public comment, the Commission turned to Item 7-B.

**b. Commission informational pamphlet/flyer and logo**

Coms. Bentley and Franklin created a pamphlet for the Commission and passed it out, stating that if they can get consensus on the pamphlet, they could take it to the printer and get prices.

It was suggested that under "Important Animal Numbers," instead of putting "Vicious Dog," to use "Emergencies" and the 911 number, or the Animal Control Dispatch number.

Com. Friedman indicated the Animal Control Dispatch only has one line and doesn't want it overloaded, and stated that if there is an emergency or an animal that's causing a major threat, to call 911, that the police can arrive much faster than his department. Com. Friedman also noted that Com. Herndon is working with the





911 operators to teach them how to field calls from the public.

The item was continued to the next meeting.

**3. Approval of Draft minutes of May 9, 2002 meeting [Discussion/Action item]**

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment.

Frederick Hobson stated that in addition to his corrections noted earlier, that under Item 8-A New Business, that he made comments and expressed reservations about the dog policy, and wants that included in the minutes, and further noted that under Public Comment, he also spoke of the behavior of Com. Wilson.

Com. Bentley indicated under Item 7 Old Business the word "fliers" should be spelled "flyers."

Com. Bentley further indicated that former Com. Tchen was upset that her comments had not been included in the April minutes, Com. Bentley requests that the April minutes be amended to include Ms. Tchen's comments. The Chair suggested the item be taken up with the City Attorney.

The minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission.

**4. Chairperson's Report and opening remarks [Discussion/Action item.]**

**A. Commission begins the April term on a positive note.**

The Chair passed out a letter from Sup. Gonzalez who was going to request a public hearing to discuss the use of animals in lab testing at UCSF, and that it was in response to a letter that this Commission recommended. She further noted that the Commission is gaining more credibility with the Board, and hopes that all the commissioners can build on that.

She further noted that she can get business cards for the commissioners, and that the cost will come out of the budget.

**B. Noteworthy article in June 5, 2002 Chronicle regarding rescue of animals from live animal markets.**

The Chair discussed the above article and stated that this article had prompted KTSF, a Chinese-language station, to call her and she gave an interview, and noted that this issue now appears to be of concern to people.

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment:

Frederick Hobson noted that the Chair's Opening Remarks are similar to Commissioner



description in the agenda, nor a mention of business cards.

Com. Kennedy stated she is excited to be a part of this Commission and to be able to do something for animals, and was very happy about the response to the letter re animal testing.

**5. COMMISSIONER PUBLIC COMMENT**

Com. Bentley noted that the Commission's website is not listed on the agenda and that it should be. The Chair will check with the City Attorney.

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment. Hearing none returned the meeting to the Commission.

**6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendation approved by Commission requesting action by Board of Supervisors [Discussion Item]**

**1) Letter sent to Board re UCSF lack of cooperation with City's resolution concerning animal testing.**

The Chair indicated the letter had been sent, and opened the meeting to public comment. Hearing none, returned the meeting to the Commission for discussion.

Com. Franklin indicated she had spoken to Sup. Gonzalez and given him some background information and that he is very interested in this issue and looking to the Commission for a recommendation as to how the Board should proceed.

Com. Bentley suggested that since speakers are only given three minutes to speak, that each Commissioner should discuss only one particular issue so as much information can be provided as possible. It was suggested to consult the City Attorney re how many Commissioners may speak without violating Sunshine.

**2) Letter to Board of Supervisors recommending amending Sec. 41.12 of the SF Health Code to provide for duties of "Guardians."**

Com. Franklin stated that this shouldn't be a problem, and that she will continue trying to get it pushed through.

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment. Hearing none, continued with Agenda Item 3.

**3) Letter sent to the Board regarding Park and Recreation's dog policy.**

Coms. Franklin and Kennedy provided copies of a letter that was handed out to each Supervisor's aide, and noted that the aides were very interested and want the Commission's input. Com. Franklin also addressed the full Board.





Commission's input. Com. Franklin also addressed the full Board.

Com. Kennedy stated she learned from the supervisor's aides that they believe this item will go to one or two committees, and that in order to get this item pushed through, people should continue to call their supervisors every day.

Com. Wilson noted that Dog Pack has recently started in the City, which is a political organization, and that she will be attending the first meeting next week.

The Chair, opened the meeting to public comment. Hearing none, continued to Item 10.

**10. PUBLIC COMMENT**

No public comment.

**11. CALENDAR ITEMS**

No calendar items noted, and no public comment.

**12. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned, motion by Com. Kennedy seconded by Com. Wilson at approximately 7:50 p.m.

Dated: 23<sup>rd</sup> June, 2002

Amended: 13<sup>th</sup> July, 2002

Wilson, Secretary

---



3  
f55  
11/02

# San Francisco Commission of Animal Control and Welfare

**DATE:** July 11, 2002

**TIME:** 5:30 P.M.

**PLACE:** CITY HALL, ROOM 408

**MAILING ADDRESS:**

1390 MARKET STREET, SUITE 822, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

COMMISSION VOICE MAIL: 415-252-3817

COMMISSION CHAIRPERSON, ELISSA ECKMAN:

(VOICE MAIL): (415) 519-0215

**AGENDA OF MEETING - FOR IMMEDIATE RELEASE:**

**Note:** Public comment will be taken on each Discussion/Action Item

1. Call to Order And Roll Call
2. Public Comment: At this point in the meeting advice or comments on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda may be discussed. Members of the public can choose to speak either at the beginning or end of the meeting but not both.*
3. Approval of draft minutes of June 13, 2002, meeting. [Discussion/Action item].
4. Chairperson's report and opening remarks [Discussion item]
  - a. Welcome
5. Commissioner Public Comment

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

1

JUL 8 2002

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY



July 8, 2002

**6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendations approved by Commission requesting action by Board of Supervisors [Discussion Item]**

- a. Letter sent to Board regarding Live Animal Markets

**7. Committee Reports / Commissioner's Reports [Discussion item]**

- a. Crime Stoppers Posters Project [anti dog fighting]
- b. Commission informational pamphlet/flyer and logo
- c. Amending §41.12 of the SF Health Code to provide for duties of "Guardians".
- d. Park and Recreations dog policy.

**8. Old Business** (Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.)

**9. New Business** (Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.)

- A. A discussion concerning a compilation of recommendations and suggestions to be provided to the Board of Supervisors in regards to encouraging UCSF to adhere to humane treatment of and finding alternatives to the use of laboratory animals. [Vice-Chair Franklin][Discussion/Action Item]
- B. A discussion concerning a letter of thanks to be written to City Attorney Dennis Herrera concerning his office taking action against Petco. [Discussion/Action Item][Commissioner Bentley]
- C. A discussion concerning establishing a procedure for members of the public to request copies of the agenda and minutes and that such procedure appear on the agenda. [Commissioner Bentley][Discussion/Action Item]

**10. PUBLIC COMMENT:** At this point in the meeting advice or comments on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda may be discussed. Members of the public can choose to speak either at the beginning or end of the meeting but not both.*

**11. CALENDAR ITEMS**

**12. ADJOURNMENT**





July 8, 2002

## **KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**

### **DISABILITY ACCESS**

**Room 408** is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART Station is Civic Center, three blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #42 Downtown Loop, the #71 Haight/Noriega, the F Line to Market and Van Ness and the Metro stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call 923-6142.

There is accessible parking at the following locations: two(2) designated blue curb spaces on the southwest corner of McAllister Street at Van Ness Avenue; the Performing Arts Garage (entrance on Grove Street between Franklin and Gough Streets), and at Civic Center Plaza Garage.

Large print agendas are available by calling Elissa Eckman at (415) 519-0215. The following services are available upon request at least two working days prior to the meeting: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting, or a sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. For information or to make arrangements, contact Carla Vaughn at 252-2500 (voice) or 252-2550 (TDD).

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals.

### **POLICY ON CELL PHONE, PAGERS, AND ELECTRONIC DEVICES**

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

## **KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco's Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact Donna Hall at the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 409, 1 Dr. Carlton B.



July 8, 2002

Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683; Office (415) 554-7724; Fax (415) 554-7854; E-mail: Donna\_Hall@ci.sf.ca.us

Citizens interested in obtaining a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance can request a copy from Ms. Hall or by printing Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code on the Internet, at <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/bdsupvrs/sunshine.htm>

**ATTENTION:** Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 554-9510; fax (415) 703-0121 and web site <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/ethics>





# COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL AND WELFARE

Mailing Address: 1390 Market Street, Room 822

San Francisco, CA 94102

Voice Mail: (415) 252-3817

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

## Minutes of Meeting - July 11, 2002

AUG 12 2002

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

### 1. Call to order and roll call

The meeting was convened at 5.33p.m. by Chair Eckman, who presided during all aspects of the meeting. Seven Commissioners (or their lawful designates) holding valid appointments being present, the quorum requirement of Section 6 of the Commission's Rules & Regulations (50 percent of those eligible to vote) was satisfied.

Commissioners in Attendance: Chair Elissa Eckman, Vice-Chair Sherri Franklin, Secretary June Wilson, Cheryl Bentley, Kelly Jensen, DVM, Laurie Kennedy, Jamal Modica, Rosa Sanchez, City Attorney

Absent with excuse: Jack Breslin, Dept of Health, Carl Friedman, Animal Care & Control, Sgt. Bill Herndon, SFPD

### 2. Public Comment

Eric Mills, Action for Animals, stated that the SF Cow Palace is again going to put on a special rodeo performance for Bay Area school children on October 24<sup>th</sup>. He also spoke about black bears and tigers being transported for circus purposes under inhumane conditions. Frederick Hobson thanked the Chair for the Agenda and also complained about the commission secretary for not sending him the minutes. He has filed a complaint with the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force.

Catherine Tchen read a letter that she had prepared concerning her personal background and experience which she passed out copies to each commissioner.

### 3. Approval of the draft minutes of June 13, 2002

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment.

Frederick Hobson complained once again about the minutes and the Commission secretary.

The Chair requested a correction to item 4A to reflect that Sup. Gonzalez was going to request a committee hearing to discuss the use of animals in lab testing at UCSF and to strike the words that "The Chair passed out a letter from Sup. Gonzalez".

The minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission.

### 5. Commissioner Public Comment

Com. Franklin commented on a great article about the fur ban



by Matt Gonzalez in the Bay Guardian

#### **6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendations approved by commission requesting action by Board of Supervisors**

Com. Jensen stated that the letter was in its last drafts and when finished plans to deliver it in person to the Board of Supervisors.

#### **7. Committee Reports/Commissioner's Reports**

##### **a. Crime Stoppers Posters Project.**

Com. Modica said that he has been working with Conscious Youth Media, a nonprofit company that teaches young teenagers in inner cities how to use cameras and do graphics. He has had several successful photo shoots. He thinks soon they'll have some great posters to pass out. He has also started a new club at City College.

##### **b. Commission information pamphlet/flyer and logo**

Com. Franklin made a draft and handed it out for all commissioners to comment on it at the next meeting. Com. Bentley handed out a brochure from a previous commission. Com. Kennedy suggested having a central e-mail as a place for people to communicate. Com. Bentley asked if the commission could get our own e-mail and Ms. Sanchez said that she would look into it. Com. Franklin wanted to get on our website, when our meeting is and all information on our website and Com. Kennedy offered to do that. It was decided that the flyer, pamphlet will be looked at next month with any suggestions for them. The logo will be at a later date.

##### **c. Amending Section 41.12 of the SF Health code to provide for duties of "Guardians"**

Com. Franklin stated that it was sitting with the City Attorney getting the wording on it and then it will go to the Board.

#### **Public Comment**

Frederick Hobson stated that the Examiner had phoned him about the "Guardian" issue and he had suggested phoning Com. Bentley as a former vice chair for more information. Elliot Katz, In Defense of Animals, stated that since L.A. Times made the "Guardian" issue a front page story, he has been getting many calls from reporters in parts of the world and the USA. Ms. Resleure passed out some flyers of opposition to the word "Guardian". Catherine Tchen supports "Guardian" also. Linda Fisher stated that on KPIX, they did a poll and 63% approved of "guardianship".

##### **d. Park & Recreation Dog Policy**

Com. Franklin stated that they are waiting for Sup. Yee to have a committee meeting. The policy becomes final in 90 days.

#### **8. Old Business**

None

#### **9. New Business**





**A. A discussion concerning a compilation of recommendations and suggestions to be provided to the Board of Supes in regards to encouraging UCSF to adhere to humane treatment of and finding alternatives to the use of laboratory animals.**

Com. Franklin heard that there is a committee hearing maybe in early August and hopes that every interested party will be able to speak, and then make recommendations after we hear it all. Elliot Katz thought September would be a better month to enable physicians and veterinarians to be expert witnesses.

**B. A discussion concerning a letter of thanks to be written to City Attorney Dennis Herrera concerning his office taking action against Petco. (animal care violation)**

Com. Bentley stated that the city is now bringing a lawsuit against Petco. It was suggested by Ms. Sanchez to write to the Board of Supervisors first saying that we are planning to send a thank-you letter to Dennis Herrera and Carl Friedman of Animal Care & Control and if we don't hear from you within 2 weeks, we'll assume that it's okay to send other two letters. A vote was unanimously passed.

**C. A discussion concerning establishing a procedure for members of the public to request copies of the agenda and minutes and that such procedure appear on the agenda.**

Ms. Sanchez stated that there is no fee for agendas and it must be made in writing. There can be a one-cent fee for supporting materials that go with the agenda. Minutes are public records, given free at meetings. If a member of the public requests the minutes later, it's then 10 cents a page, and postage can also be charged. It's up to the commission, to set the policy. Ms. Sanchez quoted the Sunshine Ord. "For minutes, a brief summary of each person's statement during the public comment period for each agenda item". Ms. Tchen complained that her long speech about the live animal markets had been omitted in the April minutes. Ms. Sanchez said that the Sunshine Ordinance provides a brief written summary of 150 words may be submitted and included in the agenda packet. Ms. Tchen also complained that she thought the minutes were being secretly altered after they were prepared by the transcriptionist. Eric Mills suggested a mailing list. The Chair stated that July was the last month that we would have a professional transcriptionist. Com. Bentley asked if the minutes were edited and the answer from both the Chair and Com. Wilson was no. It was decided that Vice Chair Franklin's work place address in future would be used for any correspondence. The vote was unanimous.

City Attorney Rosa Sanchez left at 6.50p.m.

**10. Public Comment**

Dr. Katz stated that Rec and Park has been poisoning and trapping gophers on Ocean Beach, a two and half-mile stretch. Ron Cole suggested that we rent a post office box with Commission's name on it.

**11. Calendar Items**

None





**12.Adjournment**

The meeting was adjourned, motion by Com. Kennedy, seconded by Com. Eckman at approximately 6.55p.m.

Dated 20<sup>th</sup> July, 2002

Wilson, Secretary

---



# San Francisco Commission of Animal Control and Welfare

**DATE:** August 8, 2002

**TIME:** 5:30 P.M.

**PLACE:** CITY HALL, ROOM 408

**MAILING ADDRESS:**

1390 MARKET STREET, SUITE 822, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

COMMISSION VOICE MAIL: 415-252-3817

COMMISSION CHAIRPERSON, ELISSA ECKMAN:

(VOICE MAIL): (415) 519-0215

**AGENDA OF MEETING - FOR IMMEDIATE RELEASE:**

**Note:** Public comment will be taken on each Discussion/Action Item

1. Call to Order And Roll Call
2. Public Comment: At this point in the meeting advice or comments on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda may be discussed. Members of the public can choose to speak either at the beginning or end of the meeting but not both.*
3. Approval of draft minutes of July 11, 2002, meeting. [Discussion/Action item].
4. Chairperson's report and opening remarks [Discussion item]
  - a. Welcome
5. Commissioner Public Comment

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

AUG 5 2002

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY





August 5, 2002

**6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendations approved by Commission requesting action by Board of Supervisors [Discussion Item]**

- a. Letter sent to Board regarding Live Animal Markets

**7. Committee Reports / Commissioner's Reports [Discussion item]**

- a. Crime Stoppers Posters Project [anti dog fighting]
- b. Amending §41.12 of the SF Health Code to provide for duties of "Guardians".
- c. Park and Recreations dog policy.
- d. Status of future hearing date concerning UCSF lack of compliance with 1998 resolution of Board of Supervisors concerning welfare of laboratory animals.
- c. Report(s) from City Attorney

**8. Old Business** (Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.)

**No Old Business**

**9. New Business** (Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.)

- A. Discussion concerning draft of Commission informational pamphlet/flyer and status of corresponding logo.[Full Commission][Discussion/Action Item]

**10. PUBLIC COMMENT:** At this point in the meeting advice or comments on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda may be discussed. Members of the public can choose to speak either at the beginning or end of the meeting but not both.*

**11. CALENDAR ITEMS**

**12. ADJOURNMENT**

**KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**

**DISABILITY ACCESS**

Room 408 is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART Station is Civic Center, three blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #42 Downtown Loop, the #71 Haight/Noriega, the F Line to Market and Van Ness and



August 5, 2002

the Metro stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call 923-6142.

There is accessible parking at the following locations: two(2) designated blue curb spaces on the southwest corner of McAllister Street at Van Ness Avenue; the Performing Arts Garage (entrance on Grove Street between Franklin and Gough Streets), and at Civic Center Plaza Garage.

Large print agendas are available by calling Elissa Eckman at (415) 519-0215. The following services are available upon request at least two working days prior to the meeting: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting, or a sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. For information or to make arrangements, contact Carla Vaughn at 252-2500 (voice) or 252-2550 (TDD).

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals.

#### **POLICY ON CELL PHONE, PAGERS, AND ELECTRONIC DEVICES**

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

#### **KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco's Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact Donna Hall at the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 409, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683; Office (415) 554-7724; Fax (415) 554-7854; E-mail: Donna\_Hall@ci.sf.ca.us

Citizens interested in obtaining a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance can request a copy from Ms. Hall or by printing Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code on the Internet, at <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/bdsupvrs/sunshine.htm>





*August 5, 2002*

**ATTENTION:** Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 554-9510; fax (415) 703-0121 and web site <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/ethics>





102

# COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL AND WELFARE

Mailing Address: 1390 Market Street, Room 822  
San Francisco, CA 94102  
Voice Mail: (415) 252-3817

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

## Minutes of Meeting - August 8, 2002

SEP 16 2002

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

### 1. Call to order and roll call

The meeting was convened at 5.30p.m. by Chair Eckman, who presided during all aspects of the meeting. Five Commissioners (or their lawful designates) holding valid appointments being present, the quorum requirement of Section 6 of the Commission's Rules & Regulations (50 percent of those eligible to vote) was satisfied.

Commissioners in Attendance: Chair Elissa Eckman, Vice-Chair Sherri Franklin, Secretary June Wilson, Cheryl Bentley, Jamal Modica, Jack Breslin, Dept of Health, Carl Friedman, Animal Care & Control, Rosa Sanchez, City Attorney.

Absent with excuse: Kelly Jensen, DVM, Laurie Kennedy, Sgt. Bill Herndon, SFPD.

### 2. Public Comment

Eric Mills, Action for Animals, stated that a measure to ban pig-farrowing crates would be on the November ballot in Florida. He also spoke about the State Fair and the special performance at the SF cow palace of rodeo for school children.

### 3. Approval of the draft minutes of July 11, 2002

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment.  
The minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission.

### 4. Chairperson's report and opening remarks

The Chair welcomed and thanked everyone for coming to the meeting.

### 5. Commissioner Public Comment

Com. Wilson stated that for the past 4 years, she has been assisting Companion Animal Network to get their recorded programs on Channel 29 (SF public access station). This requires delivery of tapes once a month for a weekly broadcast. She is looking for a replacement for this worthy cause. This weekly program maybe viewed at 5.30p.m. each Saturday.

### 6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendations approved by Commission requesting action by Board of Supervisors

a. Eric Mills stated that he visited 6 live animal markets in Chinatown where he saw about 8 map turtles for sale. Nothing has changed in 8 years. North Lake in Oakland is being drained to resurface the bottom. Rec & Park are expecting to take out about 150 turtles to new homes in Castro Valley.

## **7. Committee Reports/Commissioner's Reports**

a. The Chair stated that Crime Stoppers have disbanded due to a lack of funds. We can still put up posters but cannot offer any reward for people reporting dog fighting. Com. Friedman offered to help find the money (\$1000) that would lead to arrest and conviction of the culprits. Com. Modica emphasized the need to get the posters on the streets to get the message out.

e. City Attorney Rosa Sanchez reported on the options for AC & WC e-mail account. After considerable discussion, it was decided that a laptop and an e-mail address with SF City Span would best serve our needs. Ms. Sanchez will report on this matter at the next meeting. Ms. Sanchez left at 6.05p.m.

b. Com. Franklin stated that "Guardian"/owner is still with the city attorney and there should be a meeting in the next 2 weeks.

c. Com. Franklin stated that Rec & Parks dog policy meeting is still going on right now and people are supporting Leland Yee's resolution by about 5 to 1. Com. Wilson stated that 2 days beforehand at the Natural Areas hearing 41 people spoke in favor of Leland Yee's resolutions and only 9 against.

d. Com. Franklin stated that she had had a meeting with Sup. Maxwell who said that she would support a hearing concerning the welfare of laboratory animals at UCSF.

## **8. Old Business**

No old business

## **9. New Business**

Com Franklin stated that she would like to shorten the proposed logo. Com. Breslin suggested making debarking a calendar item at the next meeting. Com. Friedman thanked Com. Bentley and the Commission for a very nice letter sent to him, thanking him for his efforts in bringing PetCo to court.

## **10. Public Comment**

No public comment

## **11. Calendar Items**

No calendar items

## **12. Adjournment**

The meeting was adjourned at 6.15p.m. motion by Com. Franklin, seconded by Com. Wilson.

Dated: 10<sup>th</sup> August, 2002  
Wilson, Secretary

---

5  
2/02

# San Francisco Commission of Animal Control and Welfare

09-09-02P02 35 RMD

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

**DATE:** SEPTEMBER 12, 2002  
**TIME:** 5:30 P.M.  
**PLACE:** CITY HALL, ROOM 408

SEP 9 2002

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY**MAILING ADDRESS:**

1390 MARKET STREET, SUITE 822, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

COMMISSION VOICE MAIL: 415-252-3817

COMMISSION CHAIRPERSON, ELISSA ECKMAN:

(VOICE MAIL): (415) 519-0215

**AGENDA OF MEETING - FOR IMMEDIATE RELEASE:**

Note: Public comment will be taken on each Discussion/Action Item

1. Call to Order And Roll Call
2. Public Comment: At this point in the meeting advice or comments on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda may be discussed. Members of the public can choose to speak either at the beginning or end of the meeting but not both.*
3. Approval of draft minutes of September 8, 2002, meeting. [Discussion/Action item].
4. Chairperson's report and opening remarks [Discussion item]
  - a. Welcome
  - b. Mention of newsworthy editorial item
  - c. Thanks to Commissioner Kennedy for remodeling Commission's web site
5. Commissioner Public Comment







September 9, 2002

**6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendations approved by Commission requesting action by Board of Supervisors [Discussion Item]**

- a. Letter sent to Board regarding Live Animal Markets

**7. Committee Reports / Commissioner's Reports [Discussion item]**

- a. Educational Posters regarding pit bulls
- b. Amending §41.12 of the SF Health Code to provide for duties of "Guardians".
- c. Park and Recreations dog policy.
- d. Status of future hearing date concerning UCSF lack of compliance with 1998 resolution of Board of Supervisors concerning welfare of laboratory animals.
- e. Report(s) from City Attorney

**8. Old Business** (Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.)

- A. Discussion concerning shortening draft of Commission informational pamphlet/flyer and status of corresponding logo. [Vice-Chair Franklin][Discussion/Action Item]

**9. New Business** (Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.)

- A. Discussion concerning additional humane treatment concerns arising from live animal markets: People who slaughter live animals for food at home. [Chairperson Eckman][Discussion/Action Item]
- B. Discussion concerning whether the Commission should include the practice of "debarking" along with "declawing" as subject matter the Commission is concerned about. [Commissioner Breslin][Discussion/Action Item].



September 9, 2002

C. Discussion concerning possible conflict between the California Education Code, the State Board of Education mandate for humane education and treatment of animals; and the Grand National Rodeo inviting Bay Area school children k-8 to the Cow Palace on October 24, 2002, for a school day performance.[Chairperson Eckman][Discussion/Action Item]

**10. PUBLIC COMMENT:** At this point in the meeting advice or comments on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda may be discussed. Members of the public can choose to speak either at the beginning or end of the meeting but not both.*

#### **11. CALENDAR ITEMS**

#### **12. ADJOURNMENT**

### **KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**

#### **DISABILITY ACCESS**

Room 408 is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART Station is Civic Center, three blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #42 Downtown Loop, the #71 Haight/Noriega, the F Line to Market and Van Ness and the Metro stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call 923-6142.

There is accessible parking at the following locations: two (2) designated blue curb spaces on the southwest corner of McAllister Street at Van Ness Avenue; the Performing Arts Garage (entrance on Grove Street between Franklin and Gough Streets), and at Civic Center Plaza Garage.

Large print agendas are available by calling Elissa Eckman at (415) 519-0215. The following services are available upon request at least two working days prior to the meeting: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting, or a sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. For information or to make arrangements, contact Carla Vaughn at 252-2500 (voice) or 252-2550 (TDD).

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals.





September 9, 2002

**POLICY ON CELL PHONE, PAGERS, AND ELECTRONIC DEVICES**

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

**KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco's Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact Donna Hall at the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 409, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683; Office (415) 554-7724; Fax (415) 554-7854; E-mail: Donna\_Hall@ci.sf.ca.us

Citizens interested in obtaining a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance can request a copy from Ms. Hall or by printing Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code on the Internet, at <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/bdsupvrs/sunshine.htm>

**ATTENTION:** Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415)





# COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL AND WELFARE

Mailing Address: 1390 Market Street, Room 822

San Francisco, CA 94102

Voice Mail: (415) 252-3817

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

## Minutes of Meeting - September 12, 2002

OCT 16 2002

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

### 1. Call to order and roll call

The meeting was convened at 5.33p.m. by Chair Eckman, who presided during all aspects of the meeting. Five Commissioners (or their lawful designates) holding valid appointments being present, the quorum requirement of Section 6 of the Commission's Rules & Regulations (50 percent of those eligible to vote) was satisfied.

Commissioners in Attendance: Chair Elissa Eckman, Vice-Chair Sherri Franklin, Secretary June Wilson, Laurie Kennedy, Kelly Jensen DVM, Jack Breslin, Dept of Health, Carl Friedman, Animal Care & Control, Sgt. Bill Herndon, SFPD Rosa Sanchez, City Attorney.

Absent with excuse: Cheryl Bentley, Jamal Modica.

### 2. Public Comment

Eric Mills, Action for Animals, stated that he spoke with the Alameda County Fair Board of Directors asking them to consider an ordinance to prevent the performing acts and display of wild animals. Jeffrey Wescott and Dave Madison spoke at length about a dog attacking one of their dogs. They don't blame the dog, they blame the owner and would like to see more responsible owners as they say that there is no vicious dogs at birth. Comm. Friedman stated that there is a state law that stops a person with a vicious dog from owning a dog for 3 years. Comm. Herndon suggested licensing the owner as the owner is responsible. Dee King stated that Pets Unlimited had groomed her Maine coon cat When she bought the cat home, she found that they had shaved her cat and the cat was spitting and hissing. Comm. Jensen suggested phoning the Better Business Bureau and Comm. Friedman suggested writing the Head of the Board of Directors.

### 3. Approval of the draft minutes of August 8, 2002

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment.  
The minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission.

### 4. Chairperson's report and opening remarks

The Chair welcomed and thanked everyone for coming to the meeting. She also drew attention to a news article "Terrorists, Animal Abusers should receive no quarter" and she thanked Comm. Kennedy for remodeling the Commission's web site.

### 5. Commissioner Public Comment

Comm. Breslin received a copy of "Pigeon Solutions" and he will be invited at a later meeting to speak on this subject. Comm. Friedman announced that Eric Mills will be awarded "Humanitarian of the Year" by the Marin Humane Society. Comm. Wilson could not find anyone who could take over her delivery of Companion Animal Network Tapes to the SF public access station.

## **6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendations approved by Commission requesting action by Board of Supervisors**

a. Comm. Jensen stated that she had no reply yet to her letter regarding the Live Animal Markets and the Commission tried to think up ways to get the Supervisors attention. Eric Mills stated that he visited a market in Chinatown where he saw map turtles for sale. He called authorities to report it but no one showed up. Nothing has changed.

## **7. Committee Reports/Commissioner's Reports**

a. Comm. Herndon said that it wasn't lack of funds that Crime Stoppers disbanded, it was lack of community involvement, they needed Board members. Comm. Friedman stated that the new revised educational posters regarding dog fighting is just about ready and should have some definite information at the next meeting.

b. Com. Franklin stated that "Guardian"/owner is still with the city attorney

c. Com. Franklin stated that there will be a committee meeting on 26<sup>th</sup> Sept. to discuss Leland Yee's proposed ordinance in response to Rec & Parks dog policy and she will write another letter to Rec & Park. Comm. Friedman said that the Dog Advisory Task Force will continue to meet regardless of what comes out of the committee meeting. The President of SF/SPCA is Chair and Comms. Friedman and Herndon are on the Task Force.

d. Com. Franklin stated that there is a possible committee hearing in October concerning the welfare of laboratory animals at UCSF. IDA are planning to fly people in to speak.

e. City Attorney Rosa Sanchez stated that to get some space at City Hall, Comm. Wilson should call DTIS and the city administrator and Ms. Sanchez will assist but it would be helpful if a Supervisor would help us also. Comm. Friedman will speak with the city administrator first.

## **9. New Business**

(Out of order)

C. Eric Mills stated that last year the Grand National Rodeo had 9000 Bay Area children at the Cow Palace on school time and taxpayers expense. Mr. Mills feels that children seeing a rodeo is a form of child abuse and makes children insensitive to animal cruelty. There was much discussion on this issue and the legality of stopping children from seeing cruelty and whether this commission has jurisdiction to do anything about it. Ms. Sanchez will look into the matter.

## **8. Old Business**

A. Ron Cole referred to the draft informational pamphlet/flyer, that the name should also include the city and county of San Francisco. The Commission stated "debarking" will also be added.

B. The Chair decided that she would take public comment on **9B New Business**.



Ron Cole stated that debarking saves a lot of dog's lives. He said that if the dog must stay outside and the neighbors complain because the dog is barking, then it is OK to debark. Comm. Kennedy felt that there were difference ways to stop a dog from barking than cutting its vocal cords. Comm. Friedman stated that a hoarder had over 50 dogs in his house, all debarked so the neighbors wouldn't know. Comm. Wilson stated that many dogs owned by breeders were debarked because of noise and zoning laws. Comm. Jensen is very concerned about debarking and declawing. The commission approved unanimously the pamphlet and also added the debarking issue on the pamphlet. The logo will be available at next meeting.

#### **9. New Business**

A. A lady who was unable to be here tonight, had planned to report that she heard a screeching noise over her fence and saw a neighbor trying to kill a chicken but didn't know how to do it properly.

#### **10. Public Comment**

No public comment

#### **11. Calendar Items**

A person will come next month and speak on "Pigeon Solutions"

#### **12. Adjournment**

The meeting was adjourned at 7.13p.m. motion by Com. Jensen, seconded by Com. Wilson.

Dated: 14<sup>th</sup> September, 2002

Amended: 11<sup>th</sup> October, 2002

Wilson, Secretary

---





10/02  
A.5

# San Francisco Commission of Animal Control and Welfare

**DATE:** October 10, 2002

**TIME:** 5:30 P.M.

**PLACE:** CITY HALL, ROOM 408

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

OCT 7 2002

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

10-07-02 A11.45 RCV

**MAILING ADDRESS:**

1390 MARKET STREET, SUITE 822, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

COMMISSION VOICE MAIL: 415-252-3817

COMMISSION CHAIRPERSON, ELISSA ECKMAN:

(VOICE MAIL): (415) 519-0215

**AGENDA OF MEETING - FOR IMMEDIATE RELEASE:**

**Note:** Public comment will be taken on each Discussion/Action Item

1. Call to Order And Roll Call
2. Public Comment: At this point in the meeting advice or comments on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda may be discussed. Members of the public can choose to speak either at the beginning or end of the meeting but not both.*
3. Approval of draft minutes of September 12, 2002, meeting.  
[Discussion/Action item].
4. Chairperson's report and opening remarks [Discussion item]
  - a. Welcome
  - b. Update on Commission office space
  - c. Issue regarding UCSF treatment of lab animals heard on agenda of Public Works and Protection Committee
  - d. Live Animal Market strategems
5. Commissioner Public Comment



October 7, 2002

**6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendations approved by Commission requesting action by Board of Supervisors [Discussion Item]**

- a. Letter sent to Board regarding Live Animal Markets

**7. Committee Reports / Commissioner's Reports [Discussion item]**

- a. Educational Posters regarding pit bulls
- b. Amending §41.12 of the SF Health Code to provide for duties of "Guardians".
- e. Park and Recreations dog policy
- f. Commission's informational flyer/pamphlet
- e. Report(s)/legal opinion from City Attorney
  - 1. Jurisdictional issue re recommendations to the Board regarding issues in other counties.
  - 2. Other

**8. Old Business (Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.)**

- A. Discussions concerning additional humane treatment concerns caused by live animal markets: Buyers who bring animals home to slaughter them. There will be an invited speaker. [Chairperson Eckman][Discussion/Action Item]

**9. New Business (Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.)**

- A. Discussion concerning pigeon removal services provided by PIGEON SOLUTIONS. There will be an invited speaker. [Commissioner Breslin][Discussion/Action Item].

- B. Should the Commission draft a local version of the Cambridge Ordinance in the form of a recommendation containing suggestions to assist the Board in crafting an ordinance? [Chairperson Eckman][Discussion/Action Item]





October 7, 2002

**10. PUBLIC COMMENT:** At this point in the meeting advice or comments on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda may be discussed. Members of the public can choose to speak either at the beginning or end of the meeting but not both.*

#### **11. CALENDAR ITEMS**

#### **12. ADJOURNMENT**

### **KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**

#### **DISABILITY ACCESS**

**Room 408** is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART Station is Civic Center, three blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #42 Downtown Loop, the #71 Haight/Noriega, the F Line to Market and Van Ness and the Metro stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call 923-6142.

There is accessible parking at the following locations: two (2) designated blue curb spaces on the southwest corner of McAllister Street at Van Ness Avenue; the Performing Arts Garage (entrance on Grove Street between Franklin and Gough Streets), and at Civic Center Plaza Garage.

Large print agendas are available by calling Elissa Eckman at (415) 519-0215. The following services are available upon request at least two working days prior to the meeting: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting, or a sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. For information or to make arrangements, contact Carla Vaughn at 252-2500 (voice) or 252-2550 (TDD).

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals.

#### **POLICY ON CELL PHONE, PAGERS, AND ELECTRONIC DEVICES**

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

### **KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**





October 7, 2002

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco's Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact Donna Hall at the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 409, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683; Office (415) 554-7724; Fax (415) 554-7854; E-mail: Donna\_Hall@ci.sf.ca.us

Citizens interested in obtaining a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance can request a copy from Ms. Hall or by printing Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code on the Internet, at <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/bdsupvrs/sunshine.htm>

**ATTENTION:** Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 554-9510; fax (415) 703-0121 and web site <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/ethics>



55  
10/02  
+  
**COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL AND WELFARE**

Mailing Address: 1390 Market Street, Room 822

San Francisco, CA 94102

Voice Mail: (415) 252-3817

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

NOV 22 2002

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

**Draft Minutes of Meeting - October 10, 2002**

**1. Call to order and roll call**

The meeting was convened at 5.30p.m. by Chair Eckman, who presided during all aspects of the meeting. Seven Commissioners (or their lawful designates) holding valid appointments being present, the quorum requirement of Section 6 of the Commission's Rules & Regulations (50 percent of those eligible to vote) was satisfied.

Commissioners in Attendance: Chair Elissa Eckman, Vice-Chair Sherri Franklin, Secretary June Wilson, Laurie Kennedy, Cheryl Bentley, Jamal Modica, Kelly Jensen DVM, Jack Breslin, Dept of Health, Carl Friedman, Animal Care & Control, Sgt. Bill Herndon, SFPD Rosa Sanchez, City Attorney.

Also, the continued absence of Recreation and Park.

**2. Public Comment**

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment.

Eric Mills, Action for Animals, stated that he had given all commissioners Paw Pac brochures and had written letters to 4 counties of the Unified School District protesting the coming Rodeo for school children.

**3. Approval of the draft minutes of September 12, 2002**

The minutes were amended with minor details and unanimously approved by the Commission.

**7. e. (out of order)**

City attorney Rosa Sanchez told the Commission that the Commission has no authority to recommend that the school district not send children to the coming Rodeo. She suggested writing a letter to the Board of Supes asking them to send a letter to the school district. Ms. Sanchez also made a comment on 9.b to ask the Board to ask a deputy attorney to draft a local version of the Cambridge Ordinance.

Eric Mills asked the Commission to send a letter to the Board about the Rodeo. A requirement by State law to report accidents at Rodeos, none have been reported. Ms. Sanchez advised to write a letter. It was decided to write to the Board asking for a recommendation to ask the Board of Education to stop sending children to the Rodeo.

The vote was unanimous.

Ms. Sanchez left at 6p.m.

**4. Chairperson's report and opening remarks**



- a. The Chair welcomed and thanked everyone for coming to the meeting.
- b. We now have office space with a small cubicle, a computer and a phone at City Hall, Room 453. The Chair thanked Carl Friedman, Jill Learner, Norm Goldwyn and Bill Lee for making this possible. Our email will be [animalcommission@sfgov.org](mailto:animalcommission@sfgov.org) There are several things that need to be ironed out before we actually move in.
- c. The Chair commended the speakers heard at the Public Works and Protection Committee regarding the treatment of lab animals at UCSF. The Head of UCSF did not attend. In Defense of Animals flew in speakers from out of town. Two nurses from UCSF painted a great picture on how the monkeys were treated. The Committee wants to hear more public comment in the future.
- d. The Chair is considering recommending that we hire a political advisor to help us with the live animal market issue.

## **5. Commissioner Public Comment**

None.

## **6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendations approved by Commission requesting action by Board of Supervisors**

- a. Comm. Jensen stated that she did e-mail Sup. Maxwell but had no reply. She has had no reply to her letter regarding the Live Animal Markets.

## **7. Committee Reports/Commissioner's Reports**

- a. Comm. Friedman brought to the Commission the new revised educational posters regarding dog fighting and asked that we pass them out in our neighborhoods.
- b. Com. Franklin stated that "Guardian"/owner was heard by the full Board 2 weeks ago and has yet to be signed to a committee.
- c. Com. Kennedy stated that Rec & Parks dog policy needed an environmental and financial impact analysis done before any move was made. Com. Kennedy also stated that she had heard that the opposition was more vocal than the pro off leash people, so we need to keep the pressure going.

## **8. Old Business**

Theresa Schultz of Visitation Valley stated that around 6p.m. she heard horrible screams coming from 2 houses away, where apparently a woman was trying to kill chickens. She saw 8 to 10 paper bags with feet sticking out. She was very disturbed as she thought that the woman was not killing the chickens humanely or quickly. She called Animal Control. Talking later with an officer, she was told that that it was legal to kill animals on your own property. Animal Control and the Health Dept. will look into the matter. The law allows no more than 4 animals per household. There was considerable discussion on this subject.

## **9. New Business**

- a. Com. Breslin stated that pigeons are a problem in SF, in particular, when there are many of them, it becomes a health problem. He introduced Mr. Clifford Hazelton of Pigeon Solutions of Sacramento. Mr. Hazelton spoke at length about his job of humane



removal of the pigeons. He has a coop at his home in Sacramento, has made his own trap where the pigeons go into eat and drink clean water. It is made so that when the pigeons want to leave, they cannot. He keeps them for about a week, then transports them by air-conditioned van and a boat trailer to sparse countryside where there are trees. It is illegal to kill pigeons in SF. He has been capturing and releasing pigeons since he was 8 years old. Mr. Hazelton has had no complaints doing this job. He stated that he had caught and released about 60,000 pigeons. Com. Breslin stated that they would have to give this a lot of thought, will have to speak to the city attorney's office, will have to talk to Fish and Game.

**b.** Sup. Matt Gonzalez was interested in the Cambridge Ordinance and what we can do and a package was given out by In Defense of Animals. The Creator of this ordinance was Stephen Wise. Cambridge, Mass has the highest number of lab animals in this country. The city of Cambridge passed an ordinance to create an oversight committee of citizens. Hopefully, we could do the same here in SF. Supervisors Gonzalez and Sandoval are very interested in this matter. The Chair read from the Cambridge Ordinance, "The city Manager shall appoint a commissioner of lab animals for the purpose of overseeing the care and use of lab animals in the city". It was moved that we work on a draft letter for this matter and also write a letter to the Public Works and Protection Committee thanking them for their help on UCSF. The vote was unanimous.

**7. d.** The flyer was approved and now Com. Franklin and Kennedy are getting together with a graphics person, as they need a logo.

## **10.Public Comment**

No public comment

## **11.Calendar Items**

Com. Modica is doing animal projects at schools. He wants to do a video on the Commission to show school children.

## **12.Adjournment**

The meeting was adjourned at 7.22p.m. motion by Com. Franklin, seconded by Com. Jensen.

Dated: 12<sup>th</sup> October 2002

Wilson, Secretary

---



5

11/14/02

## San Francisco Commission of Animal Control and Welfare

**DATE:** November 14, 2002

**TIME:** 5:30 P.M.

**PLACE:** CITY HALL, ROOM 408

**MAILING ADDRESS:**

1390 MARKET STREET, SUITE 822, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

COMMISSION VOICE MAIL: 415-252-3817

COMMISSION CHAIRPERSON, ELISSA ECKMAN:

(VOICE MAIL): (415) 519-0215

**AGENDA OF MEETING - FOR IMMEDIATE RELEASE:**

**Note:** Public comment will be taken on each Discussion/Action Item

1. Call to Order And Roll Call
2. Public Comment: At this point in the meeting advice or comments on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda may be discussed. Members of the public can choose to speak either at the beginning or end of the meeting but not both.*
3. Approval of draft minutes of October 10, 2002, meeting. [Discussion/Action item].
4. Chairperson's report and opening remarks [Discussion item]
  - a. Welcome
  - b. Commission office space follow up
  - c. Educational posters regarding dog fighting
5. Commissioner Public Comment

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

NOV 12 2002

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

THE UNIVERSITY OF CHICAGO

LIBRARY

1962

1962

1962

1962

1962

1962

1962

1962

1962

1962

1962

1962

1962

1962

1962

1962

1962

1962

1962

1962

1962

1962

1962

1962



November 11, 2002

**6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendations approved by Commission requesting action by Board of Supervisors [Discussion Item]**

- a. Letter to Board regarding Live Animal Markets
- b. Letter thanking members of Public Works and Protection Committee
- c. Letter regarding rodeos sent to SFUSD

**7. Committee Reports / Commissioner's Reports [Discussion item]**

- a. Amending §41.12 of the SF Health Code to provide for duties of "Guardians".
- b. Park and Recreation's dog policy
- c. Commission's informational flyer/pamphlet/logo
- d. Report(s)/legal opinion from City Attorney
  - 1. Draft of local Cambridge Ordinance
  - 2. Other

**8. Old Business** (Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.)  
**no old business**

**9. New Business** (Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.)

**A. City Hall building scheduling has informed the Chair that room 408 will not be available in the near future and that the Commission will need to think about choosing a day other than Thursday. [Discussion Item][Chairperson Eckman]**

**10. PUBLIC COMMENT:** At this point in the meeting advice or comments on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda may be discussed. Members of the public can choose to speak either at the beginning or end of the meeting but not both.*

**11. CALENDAR ITEMS**

**12. ADJOURNMENT**

**KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**





November 11, 2002

**DISABILITY ACCESS**

**Room 408** is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART Station is Civic Center, three blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #42 Downtown Loop, the #71 Haight/Noriega, the F Line to Market and Van Ness and the Metro stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call 923-6142.

There is accessible parking at the following locations: two (2) designated blue curb spaces on the southwest corner of McAllister Street at Van Ness Avenue; the Performing Arts Garage (entrance on Grove Street between Franklin and Gough Streets), and at Civic Center Plaza Garage.

Large print agendas are available by calling Elissa Eckman at (415) 519-0215. The following services are available upon request at least two working days prior to the meeting: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting, or a sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. For information or to make arrangements, contact Carla Vaughn at 252-2500 (voice) or 252-2550 (TDD).

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals.

**POLICY ON CELL PHONE, PAGERS, AND ELECTRONIC DEVICES**

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

**KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco's Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact Donna Hall at the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 409, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683; Office (415) 554-7724; Fax (415) 554-7854; E-mail: Donna\_Hall@ci.sf.ca.us



*November 11, 2002*

Citizens interested in obtaining a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance can request a copy from Ms. Hall or by printing Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code on the Internet, at <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/bdsupvrs/sunshine.htm>

**ATTENTION:** Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 554-9510; fax (415) 703-0121 and web site <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/ethics>





# COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL AND WELFARE

Mailing Address: 1390 Market Street, Room 822

San Francisco, CA 94102

Voice Mail: (415) 252-3817

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

## Minutes of Meeting - November 14, 2002

DEC 18 2002

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

### 1. Call to order and roll call

The meeting was convened at 5.38p.m. by Chair Eckman, who presided during all aspects of the meeting. Six Commissioners (or their lawful designates) holding valid appointments being present, the quorum requirement of Section 6 of the Commission's Rules & Regulations (50 percent of those eligible to vote) was satisfied.

Commissioners in Attendance: Chair Elissa Eckman, Vice-Chair Sherri Franklin, Secretary June Wilson, Laurie Kennedy, Jamal Modica, Kelly Jensen DVM, Jack Breslin, Dept of Health, Carl Friedman, Animal Care & Control, Sgt. Bill Herndon, SFPD.

Absent with excuse: Rosa Sanchez, City Attorney.

Absent: Cheryl Bentley,

### 2. Public Comment

Eric Mills, Action for Animals, stated that there was an article in the Chronicle newspaper about "bloodless" bullfighting in the Central Valley, which he also attended. Bullfighting is illegal in California since 1957 but the church is exempt. He also spoke about rodeo and the Sierra Club's position on protecting our waterways from factory farming..

### 3. Approval of the draft minutes of October 10, 2002

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment.

The minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission.

### 4. Chairperson's report and opening remarks

- a. The Chair welcomed and thanked everyone for coming to the meeting.
- b. Com. Wilson stated that she had been instructed to get the key for Room 453 from Henny Lee in Room 362 but Mr. Lee was not there but a co-worker stated that Room 453 was open. Com. Friedman said that he would check next week and get in touch with Com. Wilson
- c. Com. Kennedy and Modica stated that they were getting the educational posters out to schools, mom and pop stores etc. The Chair also has put them out in her neighborhood. Com Friedman stated that other counties were interested in the posters.

### 5. Commissioner Public Comment

No comment

### 6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendations approved by Commission requesting action by Board of Supervisors

- a. Com. Jensen stated she had written a letter to Supervisor Maxwell's office and will follow up with phone calls. Sup. Maxwell showed interest in setting up a meeting where commissions could tell the Board of Supes what they had been doing. Com. Breslin told Eric Mills that the Health Dept. had closed down the New Sang Sang Market in Chinatown for health code violations.
- b. The Chair stated that a letter has been sent to Public Works and Protection Committee expressing appreciation for their efforts.
- c. A letter regarding rodeos sent to SF Unified School District. Com. Kennedy stated that she and Com. Franklin wrote a letter to the Board of Supes. Eric Mills stated that 3 people had filed a lawsuit against SFUSD and also 4 counties are being sued. At the Cow Palace, 6700 children attended the rodeo in October.

## **7. Committee Reports/Commissioner's Reports**

- a. Com. Franklin stated that there is a hearing for "Guardians" on November 21<sup>st</sup> at 1p.m. at Health & Human Services Committee.
- b. Com. Franklin stated that the dog policy meeting was cancelled and Rec and Park are now passing out pamphlets stating that they will be enforcing their dog policy, December 6<sup>th</sup> with a list of 13 legal off-leash dog areas. Com. Friedman stated that there is a meeting with the task force on 26<sup>th</sup> November.
- c. Com. Franklin stated that she is waiting for a meeting to be set up with the designer who will be assigned to design the logo of the flyer/pamphlet.
- d. The Chair stated that she had spoken to city attorney, Rosa Sanchez about the Cambridge Ordinance on laboratory animals and was told if we wanted an ordinance passed, we would have to get a supervisor to sponsor it

## **8. Old Business**

No old business

## **9. New Business**

The Chair stated that the Planning Commission now needs Room 408 for their overflow. Com. Friedman will find out the details. Com. Franklin made an announcement that on Nov. 22<sup>nd</sup> at 7p.m. at Women's Building on 18<sup>th</sup> Street, they are presenting Fashion Victims, Women, Animals and Fur. Com. Modica stated that he was doing a camera show and explaining about the Commission to school children.

## **10. Public Comment**

No public comment

## **11. Calendar Items**

No calendar items

## **12. Adjournment**

The meeting was adjourned at 6.25p.m. motion by Com. Franklin, seconded by Com. Kennedy.

Dated: November 18, 2002

Amended: December 13, 2002

Wilson, Secretary

---

5  
12/02

# San Francisco Commission of Animal Control and Welfare

**DATE:** December 12, 2002

**TIME:** 5:30 P.M.

**PLACE:** CITY HALL, ROOM 408

**MAILING ADDRESS:**

1390 MARKET STREET, SUITE 822, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

COMMISSION VOICE MAIL: 415-252-3817

COMMISSION CHAIRPERSON, ELISSA ECKMAN:  
(VOICE MAIL): (415) 519-0215

**AGENDA OF MEETING - FOR IMMEDIATE RELEASE:**

Note: Public comment will be taken on each Discussion/Action Item

1. Call to Order And Roll Call
2. Public Comment: At this point in the meeting advice or comments on items within the Commission's jurisdiction other than the items on the agenda may be discussed. Members of the public can choose to speak either at the beginning or end of the meeting but not both.
3. Approval of draft minutes of November 14, 2002, meeting.  
[Discussion/Action item].
4. Chairperson's report and opening remarks [Discussion item]
  - a. Welcome
  - b. Growing numbers of lawyers are pushing to strengthen--- or at least clarify--- the rights of animals beyond traditional bans on cruelty.
  - c. Highlights of 2002 and the Commission's transition into 2003. A year in review and looking towards 2003.
5. Commissioner Public Comment

DOCUMENTS DEPT

DEC - 9 2002

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY





December 8, 2002

**6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendations approved by Commission requesting action by Board of Supervisors [Discussion Item]**

**7. Committee Reports / Commissioner's Reports [Discussion item]**

- a. Amending §41.12 of the SF Health Code to provide for duties of "Guardians".
- b. Park and Recreations dog policy
- c. Commission's informational flyer/pamphlet/logo
- d. Report(s)/legal opinion from City Attorney
- e. Development of local "Cambridge" type ordinance for submission to a Supervisor sponsor regarding oversight of UCSF live animal testing to implement compliance with 1998 Board of Supervisor's resolution concerning same.
- f. Ongoing concern of Commission for continuing inability of live animal markets to comply with Federal, local, and State law
- g. Update on any proposed Commission meeting rescheduling
- h. Feed back on educational posters concerning dog fights

**8. Old Business** (Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.)

**A. No old business**

**9. New Business** (Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.)

**A. No new business.**

**10. PUBLIC COMMENT:** At this point in the meeting advice or comments on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda may be discussed. Members of the public can choose to speak either at the beginning or end of the meeting but not both.*

**11. CALENDAR ITEMS**

**12. ADJOURNMENT**





December 8, 2002

## **KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**

### **DISABILITY ACCESS**

**Room 408** is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART Station is Civic Center, three blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #42 Downtown Loop, the #71 Haight/Noriega, the F Line to Market and Van Ness and the Metro stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call 923-6142.

There is accessible parking at the following locations: two (2) designated blue curb spaces on the southwest corner of McAllister Street at Van Ness Avenue; the Performing Arts Garage (entrance on Grove Street between Franklin and Gough Streets), and at Civic Center Plaza Garage.

Large print agendas may be arranged by calling Elissa Eckman at (415) 519-0215. The following services are available upon request at least two working days prior to the meeting: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting, or a sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. For information or to make arrangements, contact Carla Vaughn at 252-2500 (voice) or 252-2550 (TDD).

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals.

### **POLICY ON CELL PHONE, PAGERS, AND ELECTRONIC DEVICES**

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

## **KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco's Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact Donna Hall at the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 409, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683; Office (415) 554-7724; Fax (415) 554-7854; E-mail: Donna\_Hall@ci.sf.ca.us



*December 8, 2002*

Citizens interested in obtaining a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance can request a copy from Ms. Hall or by printing Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code on the Internet, at <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/bdsupvrs/sunshine.htm>

**ATTENTION:** Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 554-9510; fax (415) 703-0121 and web site <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/ethics>





SF  
755  
+2  
1/2/02

# COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL AND WELFARE

Mailing Address: 1390 Market Street, Room 822

San Francisco, CA 94102

Voice Mail: (415) 252-3817

## Minutes of Meeting - December 12, 2002

### 1. Call to order and roll call

The meeting was convened at 5.36p.m. by Chair Eckman, who presided during all aspects of the meeting. Five Commissioners (or their lawful designates) holding valid appointments being present, the quorum requirement of Section 6 of the Commission's Rules & Regulations (50 percent of those eligible to vote) was satisfied.

Commissioners in Attendance: Chair Elissa Eckman, Vice-Chair Sherri Franklin, Secretary June Wilson, Laurie Kennedy, Jamal Modica, Jack Breslin, Dept of Health, Sgt. Bill Herndon, SFPD

Absent with excuse: Kelly Jensen DVM, Carl Friedman, Animal Care & Control, Rosa Sanchez, City Attorney.

Absent: Cheryl Bentley.

Also, the continued absence of Recreation and Park.

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

JAN 16 2003

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

### 2. Public Comment

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment.

No comment

### 3. Approval of the draft minutes of November 14, 2002

The minutes were amended with minor details and unanimously approved by the Commission.

### 4. Chairperson's report and opening remarks

a. The Chair welcomed and thanked everyone for coming to the meeting.

b. The Chair stated that she has read in the SF Daily Journal where growing numbers of lawyers are pushing to strengthen or at least clarify the rights of animals beyond traditional bans on cruelty. This is happening in Seattle and other parts of the country and in the universities, where people are becoming more aware of animals as pets instead of property. PETA is suing the Ca. Dairy Commission for their advert. about cows who don't live in sunny green pastures but live in filthy bare lots.

c. The Chair thanked everyone on the Commission for working so hard and felt that we had accomplished a lot. She is also thinking of starting up an office of Humane Education.

### 5. Commissioner Public Comment

None.

### 6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendations approved by Commission requesting action by Board of Supervisors

## **7. Committee Reports/Commissioner's Reports**

**a. Guardian/owner:** Com Franklin stated that the Health and Human Services held a meeting on 21<sup>st</sup> November, 2002 where name change "guardian/owner" was recommended to the Board of Supervisors. The vote on the Board was 6 in favor, 3 voted against. They will hold another vote next Monday, 16<sup>th</sup> December, 2002.

**b. Park and Rec dog policy:** Sgt. Herndon, a member of the Park and Rec off-leash dog advisory committee stated that at a meeting, they were trying to establish off-leash areas in Alamo Square and Douglas park. He was pleased with the proposal that Park and Rec made for Douglas Park. Dr. Ron Cole asked if Sup. Yee's proposal was still under consideration by the Board now that he has gone to Sacramento. Comm. Kennedy stated the environmental and financial impact analysis still needs to be done before any move is made.

**d.** No reports from City Attorney.

**e.** Comm Breslin stated that he received a communiqué from City Attorney's office relating to the pigeon trapping proposal by Mr. Hazelton. There will be a meeting next week to work out details before going to the Director of Public Health.

**e. Cambridge:** The Chair has been in touch with Susan Roy of IDA to get a "Cambridge" type ordinance for submission to a Supervisor sponsor regarding oversight of UCSF live animal testing.

**f. Live animal markets:** The Chair feels that this is an ongoing concern and should be kept alive as there is no need for cruelty in this city. Comm. Kennedy inquired about the live animal markets and the Chair stated that Dr. Gross statement was most compelling. Comm Jensen wrote a letter to the Board incorporating Dr. Gross's statement but got no response and was going to do a follow-up.

**g. Commission rescheduling:** No need now as we still have Room 408.

**h. Dog fight posters:** The Chair stated that she asked if they would put them up in juvenile hall but so far hasn't seen one.

**c. Flyer/logo:** Comm Franklin stated that she had received a phone call from the graphics dept, will talk to them and give a report next month.

## **8. Old Business**

No old business

## **9. New Business**

No new business

## **10. Public Comment**

No public comment

Comm. Franklin stated that November was fur free month and that there was a big rally in Union Square on Friday after Thanksgiving with IDA and API.

## **11. Calendar Items**

No calendar items

## **12. Adjournment**

The meeting was adjourned at 6.24p.m. motion by Com. Wilson, seconded by Com. Franklin.

Dated: 13<sup>th</sup> December 2002

Wilson, Secretary

---

# San Francisco Commission of Animal Control and Welfare

**DATE:** January 9, 2003

**TIME:** 5:30 P.M.

**PLACE:** CITY HALL, ROOM 408

**MAILING ADDRESS:**

1390 MARKET STREET, SUITE 822, SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

COMMISSION VOICE MAIL: 415-554-6074

ON THE WEB: ANIMALCOMMISSION@SFGOV.ORG

COMMISSION CHAIRPERSON, ELISSA ECKMAN:

(VOICE MAIL): (415) 519-0215

**AGENDA OF MEETING - FOR IMMEDIATE RELEASE:**

**Note:** Public comment will be taken on each Discussion/Action Item

1. Call to Order And Roll Call
2. Public Comment: At this point in the meeting advice or comments on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda may be discussed. Members of the public can choose to speak either at the beginning or end of the meeting but not both.*
3. Approval of draft minutes of December 12, 2002, meeting.  
[Discussion/Action item].
4. Chairperson's report and opening remarks [Discussion item]
  - a. Welcome and Happy New Year
5. Commissioner Public Comment

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

JAN 6 2003

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY





January 6, 2003

**6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendations approved by Commission requesting action by Board of Supervisors [Discussion Item]**

- a. All accounted for.

**7. Committee Reports / Commissioner's Reports [Discussion item]**

- a. Amending §41.12 of the SF Health Code to provide for duties of "Guardians".
- b. Park and Recreations dog policy
- c. Commission's informational flyer/pamphlet/logo
- b. Report(s)/legal opinion from City Attorney
- c. Development of local "Cambridge" type ordinance for submission to a Supervisor sponsor regarding oversight of UCSF live animal testing to implement compliance with 1998 Board of Supervisor's resolution concerning same.
- d. Ongoing concern of Commission for continuing inability of live animal markets to comply with Federal, local, and State law

**8. Old Business** (Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.)

**A. No old business**

**9. New Business** (Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.)

**A. Discussion concerning the proposed pigeon trapping project.**

[Commissioners Breslin and Friedman][Discussion/Action Item]

**B. Discussion concerning Commission's formal endorsement of the "Give a Dog A Bone" program. [Commissioner Franklin][Discussion/Action Item]**

**C. Election of Officers for 2003. An election will be held for the position of Chairperson Vice Chair and Secretary.[Full Commission][Discussion/Action Item]**





January 6, 2003

**D. Discussion concerning filling interim vacancy on the Commission due to Cheryl Bentley's move to Florida. [Full Commission][Discussion/Action Item]**

**10. PUBLIC COMMENT:** At this point in the meeting advice or comments on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda may be discussed. Members of the public can choose to speak either at the beginning or end of the meeting but not both.*

**11. CALENDAR ITEMS**

**12. ADJOURNMENT**

**KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**

**DISABILITY ACCESS**

**Room 408** is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART Station is Civic Center, three blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #42 Downtown Loop, the #71 Haight/Noriega, the F Line to Market and Van Ness and the Metro stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call 923-6142.

There is accessible parking at the following locations: two (2) designated blue curb spaces on the southwest corner of McAllister Street at Van Ness Avenue; the Performing Arts Garage (entrance on Grove Street between Franklin and Gough Streets), and at Civic Center Plaza Garage.

Large print agendas may be arranged by calling Elissa Eckman at (415) 519-0215. The following services are available upon request at least two working days prior to the meeting: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting, or a sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. For information or to make arrangements, contact Carla Vaughn at 252-2500 (voice) or 252-2550 (TDD).

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals.

**POLICY ON CELL PHONE, PAGERS, AND ELECTRONIC DEVICES**



January 6, 2003

The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

**KNOW YOUR RIGHTS UNDER THE SUNSHINE ORDINANCE**

Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco's Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact Donna Hall at the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 409, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683; Office (415) 554-7724; Fax (415) 554-7854; E-mail: Donna\_Hall@ci.sf.ca.us

Citizens interested in obtaining a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance can request a copy from Ms. Hall or by printing Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code on the Internet, at <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/bdsupvrs/sunshine.htm>

**ATTENTION:** Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 554-9510; fax (415) 703-0121 and web site <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/ethics>





# COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL AND WELFARE

Mailing Address: 1390 Market Street, Room 822

San Francisco, CA 94102

Voice Mail: (415) 252-3817

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

## Minutes of Meeting - January 9<sup>th</sup>, 2003

FEB 20 2003

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

### 1. Call to order and roll call

The meeting was convened at 5.40p.m. by Chair Eckman, who presided during all aspects of the meeting. Five Commissioners (or their lawful designates) holding valid appointments being present, the quorum requirement of Section 6 of the Commission's Rules & Regulations (50 percent of those eligible to vote) was satisfied.

Commissioners in Attendance: Chair Elissa Eckman, Vice-Chair Sherri Franklin, Secretary June Wilson, Laurie Kennedy, Kelly Jensen DVM, Jack Breslin, Dept of Health, Carl Friedman, Animal Care & Control, Sgt. Bill Herndon, SFPD.

Absent with excuse: Rosa Sanchez, City Attorney, Jamal Modica.

Absent: Cheryl Bentley.

Also, the continued absent of Recreation and Park

### 2. Public Comment

Eric Mills, Action for Animals, stated that the rodeo lawsuit will be heard January 27<sup>th</sup> at 9.30a.m. at 350 McAllister, Dept 301. This lawsuit is about taking 6700 children to the rodeo at the Cow Palace in October on school time and at taxpayers expense.

### 3. Approval of the draft minutes of December 12, 2002

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment.

The minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission.

### 4. Chairperson's report and opening remarks

- a. The Chair wished everyone a happy New Year and thanked everyone for coming to the meeting.

### 5 Commissioner Public Comment

Com. Wilson reported that she was at a meeting where the VA hospital is proposing to add a new \$24 million, 200,000 sq. ft. research facility. There was strong opposition from the neighbors due to zoning and traffic issues. Four animal people also voiced their opposition. It was the first meeting and details were very vague.

### 9. New Business (out of order)

- A. Pigeon Trapping.

Comm. Breslin stated that he wanted to try and solve the pigeon problem as the pigeons are creating public health and nuisance problems. He read a part of the health code. He showed a list of complaints since October, 1998 with approx. 750 complaints. The cost of investigating these complaints was approx. \$240,000. At a hearing they recently heard on a property at 29<sup>th</sup> Avenue, the investigators had made 12 visits to the site. Another site at 46<sup>th</sup> Avenue, an elderly Russian man was feeding the pigeons about 4 blocks from his home. Through his niece, they were able to stop the man before any action was taken. Mr. Hazelton approached us and said that he would trap them humanely and relocate them. Comm. Breslin would like Mr. Hazelton to at first trap on a trial basis. Comm. Friedman stated that pigeon trapping and relocation doesn't work as pigeons have the homing instinct. ACC have had a number of complaints about Mr. Hazelton. Recently, Mr. Hazelton was trapping across from SPCA. The trap was in the sun, full of pigeons and Mr. Hazelton was nowhere to be seen. He said that he had permission from the Health Dept. which was untrue. Lt. Michael Scott from ACC explained the two traps that he had with him. One, the bird walks in for the food and the door shuts behind him and the bird cannot get out. The second cage, he thought was a holding cage and the gauge of the holes was disturbing as some birds had their heads out, some had their wings out. ACC released the birds. No one knows if anyone had hired Mr. Hazelton in this industrial area. Comm. Friedman stated that in some cities, they have built pigeon condominiums with water, where everyone who wants, can feed the birds. Avatrol, a birth control in their food doesn't work. Comm. Breslin stated that the main problem with the birds, is with the people who feed them. There was a unanimous vote, Comm. Franklin, Eckman, Wilson, Jensen, Kennedy, rejected Mr. Hazelton proposal.

B. "Give a Dog a Bone" program

Comm. Franklin introduced Corinne Dowling of "Give a Dog a Bone" program, asking for the formal endorsement of the Commission. Corinne Dowling stated that she is the founder, director and dog handler of this program founded in December, 1999. Due to safety and medical the regular volunteers were not allowed to socialize with custody dogs. She volunteered and worked with custody dogs for 2 years. She, now, has 7 active volunteers. Custody dogs include medical, quarantine and isolation cases, victims of dog fighting, abuse, fire, evictions, etc. are all part of this program. The dogs that are allowed out of their cages, they give these dogs, dog training, love and care maybe for the first time in their lives, take them for walks in the park etc. The dogs that cannot be allowed out of their cages, for example, biters and fighters, that will end up at a vicious dog hearing or in the courts, the volunteers talk to them with love, give them treats, play ball etc. to stimulate their minds as many of these dogs are at ACC for a very long time. Also in the program have been sheep, goats and a duck. Last year, they handled 357 dogs, the prior year, they handled 364 dogs. They also work on getting dogs adopted and last year was 20%. They are a non-profit organization that rely on donations. The program has been a recipient of several awards and passing the information on to other shelters, these shelters hope to follow in their footsteps. Comm. Friedman thanked Corinne for all her good work. Before she came it was 100% euthanasia. Many dogs are held as evidence and as the courts are usually very slow, some dogs are at ACC for over a year. A unanimous vote by all Commissioners was past to give our support and endorsement to "Give a Dog a Bone" program.

D. Comm. Bentley's move to Florida

No one on the Commission was informed that Comm. Bentley had moved so Comm. Wilson asked a friend who worked with Comm. Bentley at her school to find out. The Director of the school stated that Comm. Bentley's building had been sold and she was not allowed pets. She took it to court, received some money and moved to Florida.

**C. Election of Officers for 2003**

Laurie Kennedy was elected Chair (Wilson, Jensen, Eckman, Kennedy, Franklin voting)

Sherri Franklin was elected vice-Chair (Wilson, Jensen, Eckman, Kennedy, Franklin voting)

June Wilson (temporary secretary)

**6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendations approved by Commission requesting action by Board of Supervisors**

a. All counted for. .

**7. Committee Reports/Commissioner's Reports**

- a. Com. Franklin stated that the Board of Supervisors will be voting on "Guardians" on January 13<sup>th</sup> 2003. Chair Kennedy stated that SF/SPCA will also support it.
- b. No update on Park and Recreation's dog policy
- c. Com. Franklin stated that she met with the graphics dept. 3 times. She stated that the flyer/pamphlet/logo will cost approx. \$1000 for 1000 copies. The logo will be in color.
- b. No reports from City Attorney
- c. Comm. Eckman stated that now that the holidays were over, she will get in touch with In Defence of Animals about the "Cambridge" type ordinance.
- d. Comm. Jensen stated that she had lost touch with Supe Maxwell during the holidays but she will start making phone calls to her office about the continued inability of live animal markets to comply with Federal, local and State law. Comm. Eckman stated that Supe Maxwell was also interested in meeting with different commissions.

**8. Old Business**

No old business

**10. Public Comment**

No public comment

**11. Calendar Items**

Comm. Wilson asked that the election of officers be held in June instead of January.

Comm. Herndon suggested to enforce restrictions on the pigeon feeders.

**12. Adjournment**

The meeting was adjourned at 7.28p.m. motion by Com. Franklin, seconded by Com. Wilson.

Dated: 12<sup>th</sup> January, 2003

Wilson, Secretary

---





# COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL AND WELFARE

Mailing Address: 1390 Market Street, Room 822

San Francisco, CA 94102

Voice Mail: (415) 252-3817

## Minutes of Meeting - January 9<sup>th</sup>, 2003

### 1. Call to order and roll call

The meeting was convened at 5.40p.m. by Chair Eckman, who presided during all aspects of the meeting. Five Commissioners (or their lawful designates) holding valid appointments being present, the quorum requirement of Section 6 of the Commission's Rules & Regulations (50 percent of those eligible to vote) was satisfied.

Commissioners in Attendance: Chair Elissa Eckman, Vice-Chair Sherri Franklin, Secretary June Wilson, Laurie Kennedy, Kelly Jensen DVM, Jack Breslin, Dept of Health, Carl Friedman, Animal Care & Control, Sgt. Bill Herndon, SFPD.

Absent with excuse: Rosa Sanchez, City Attorney, Jamal Modica.

Absent: Cheryl Bentley.

Also, the continued absent of Recreation and Park

### 2. Public Comment

Eric Mills, Action for Animals, stated that the rodeo lawsuit will be heard January 27<sup>th</sup> at 9.30a.m. at 350 McAllister, Dept 301. This lawsuit is about taking 6700 children to the rodeo at the Cow Palace in October on school time and at taxpayers expense.

### 3. Approval of the draft minutes of December 12, 2002

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment.  
The minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission.

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

FEB 20 2003

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

### 4. Chairperson's report and opening remarks

- a. The Chair wished everyone a happy New Year and thanked everyone for coming to the meeting.

### 5 Commissioner Public Comment

Com. Wilson reported that she was at a meeting where the VA hospital is proposing to add a new \$24 million, 200,000 sq. ft. research facility. There was strong opposition from the neighbors due to zoning and traffic issues. Four animal people also voiced their opposition. It was the first meeting and details were very vague.

### 9. New Business (out of order)

- A. Pigeon Trapping.



Comm. Breslin stated that he wanted to try and solve the pigeon problem as the pigeons are creating public health and nuisance problems. He read a part of the health code. He showed a list of complaints since October, 1998 with approx. 750 complaints. The cost of investigating these complaints was approx. \$240,000. At a hearing they recently heard on a property at 29<sup>th</sup> Avenue, the investigators had made 12 visits to the site. Another site at 46<sup>th</sup> Avenue, an elderly Russian man was feeding the pigeons about 4 blocks from his home. Through his niece, they were able to stop the man before any action was taken. Mr. Hazelton approached us and said that he would trap them humanely and relocate them. Comm. Breslin would like Mr. Hazelton to at first trap on a trial basis. Comm. Friedman stated that pigeon trapping and relocation doesn't work as pigeons have the homing instinct. ACC have had a number of complaints about Mr. Hazelton. Recently, Mr. Hazelton was trapping across from SPCA. The trap was in the sun, full of pigeons and Mr. Hazelton was nowhere to be seen. He said that he had permission from the Health Dept. which was untrue. Lt. Michael Scott from ACC explained the two traps that he had with him. One, the bird walks in for the food and the door shuts behind him and the bird cannot get out. The second cage, he thought was a holding cage and the gauge of the holes was disturbing as some birds had their heads out, some had their wings out. ACC released the birds. No one knows if anyone had hired Mr. Hazelton in this industrial area. Comm. Friedman stated that in some cities, they have built pigeon condominiums with water, where everyone who wants, can feed the birds. Avatrol, a birth control in their food doesn't work. Comm. Breslin stated that the main problem with the birds, is with the people who feed them. There was a unanimous vote, Comm. Franklin, Eckman, Wilson, Jensen, Kennedy, rejected Mr. Hazelton proposal.

B. "Give a Dog a Bone" program

Comm. Franklin introduced Corinne Dowling of "Give a Dog a Bone" program, asking for the formal endorsement of the Commission. Corinne Dowling stated that she is the founder, director and dog handler of this program founded in December, 1999. Due to safety and medical the regular volunteers were not allowed to socialize with custody dogs. She volunteered and worked with custody dogs for 2 years. She, now, has 7 active volunteers. Custody dogs include medical, quarantine and isolation cases, victims of dog fighting, abuse, fire, evictions, etc. are all part of this program. The dogs that are allowed out of their cages, they give these dogs, dog training, love and care maybe for the first time in their lives, take them for walks in the park etc. The dogs that cannot be allowed out of their cages, for example, biters and fighters, that will end up at a vicious dog hearing or in the courts, the volunteers talk to them with love, give them treats, play ball etc. to stimulate their minds as many of these dogs are at ACC for a very long time. Also in the program have been sheep, goats and a duck. Last year, they handled 357 dogs, the prior year, they handled 364 dogs. They also work on getting dogs adopted and last year was 20%. They are a non-profit organization that rely on donations. The program has been a recipient of several awards and passing the information on to other shelters, these shelters hope to follow in their footsteps. Comm. Friedman thanked Corinne for all her good work. Before she came it was 100% euthanasia. Many dogs are held as evidence and as the courts are usually very slow, some dogs are at ACC for over a year. A unanimous vote by all Commissioners was past to give our support and endorsement to "Give a Dog a Bone" program.

D. Comm. Bentley's move to Florida

No one on the Commission was informed that Comm. Bentley had moved so Comm. Wilson asked a friend who worked with Comm. Bentley at her school to find out. The Director of the school stated that Comm. Bentley's building had been sold and she was not allowed pets. She took it to court, received some money and moved to Florida.

**C. Election of Officers for 2003**

Laurie Kennedy was elected Chair (Wilson, Jensen, Eckman, Kennedy, Franklin voting)

Sherri Franklin was elected vice-Chair (Wilson, Jensen, Eckman, Kennedy, Franklin voting)

June Wilson (temporary secretary)

**6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendations approved by Commission requesting action by Board of Supervisors**

a. All counted for. .

**7. Committee Reports/Commissioner's Reports**

- a. Com. Franklin stated that the Board of Supervisors will be voting on "Guardians" on January 13<sup>th</sup> 2003. Chair Kennedy stated that SF/SPCA will also support it.
- b. No update on Park and Recreation's dog policy
- c. Com. Franklin stated that she met with the graphics dept. 3 times. She stated that the flyer/pamphlet/logo will cost approx. \$1000 for 1000 copies. The logo will be in color.
- b. No reports from City Attorney
- c. Comm. Eckman stated that now that the holidays were over, she will get in touch with In Defence of Animals about the "Cambridge" type ordinance.
- d. Comm. Jensen stated that she had lost touch with Supe Maxwell during the holidays but she will start making phone calls to her office about the continued inability of live animal markets to comply with Federal, local and State law. Comm. Eckman stated that Supe Maxwell was also interested in meeting with different commissions.

**8. Old Business**

No old business

**10. Public Comment**

No public comment

**11. Calendar Items**

Comm. Wilson asked that the election of officers be held in June instead of January.

Comm. Herndon suggested to enforce restrictions on the pigeon feeders.

**12. Adjournment**

The meeting was adjourned at 7.28p.m. motion by Com. Franklin, seconded by Com. Wilson.

Dated: 12<sup>th</sup> January, 2003

Wilson, Secretary

---



1/03

# SAN FRANCISCO COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL & WELFARE

---

## MEETING AGENDA

Thursday, February 13, 2003  
5:30 PM

Room 408  
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

---

Laurie Kennedy, Sherri Franklin, June Wilson,  
Elissa Eckman, Kelly Jensen, Jamal Modica,  
Carl Friedman, Jack Breslin, William Herndon

---

MAILING ADDRESS: 1390 Market Street, Suite 822, San Francisco, CA 94102  
COMMISSION VOICEMAIL: (415) 554-6074  
WEBSITE: [www.sfgov.org/awcc](http://www.sfgov.org/awcc)  
COMMISSION CHAIRPERSON: Laurie Kennedy

---

*(Note: Public comment will be taken on each discussion/action item.)*

### **1. Call to Order and Roll Call**

### **2. Open Public Comment**

- Members of the public may address the Commission with comments or recommendations on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda* at the beginning or end of the meeting, but not both.

### **3. Approval of Draft Minutes from the January 9, 2003 Meeting**

[Discussion/Action Item]

### **4. Chairperson's Opening Remarks**

[Discussion Item]

#### **a. Role clarification**

- i. Commission Role
- ii. Commissioner Role
- iii. Chair Role
- iv. Vice-Chair Role
- v. Secretary Role

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

FEB 11 2003

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY



# SAN FRANCISCO COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL & WELFARE

## OFFICE OF THE COMMISSIONER

1000 Market Street, Suite 1000  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Phone: (415) 398-1234

Telex: (415) 398-1234

Fax: (415) 398-1234

Internet: <http://www.sfdaw.org>

E-mail: [info@sfdaw.org](mailto:info@sfdaw.org)

San Francisco Animal Control & Welfare  
Commission  
1000 Market Street, Suite 1000  
San Francisco, CA 94102  
Phone: (415) 398-1234  
Telex: (415) 398-1234  
Fax: (415) 398-1234  
Internet: <http://www.sfdaw.org>  
E-mail: [info@sfdaw.org](mailto:info@sfdaw.org)

San Francisco Animal Control & Welfare Commission

1000 Market Street, Suite 1000

San Francisco, CA 94102

Phone: (415) 398-1234  
Telex: (415) 398-1234  
Fax: (415) 398-1234  
Internet: <http://www.sfdaw.org>  
E-mail: [info@sfdaw.org](mailto:info@sfdaw.org)

San Francisco Animal Control & Welfare Commission  
1000 Market Street, Suite 1000  
San Francisco, CA 94102  
Phone: (415) 398-1234  
Telex: (415) 398-1234  
Fax: (415) 398-1234  
Internet: <http://www.sfdaw.org>  
E-mail: [info@sfdaw.org](mailto:info@sfdaw.org)

San Francisco Animal Control & Welfare Commission  
1000 Market Street, Suite 1000  
San Francisco, CA 94102  
Phone: (415) 398-1234  
Telex: (415) 398-1234  
Fax: (415) 398-1234  
Internet: <http://www.sfdaw.org>  
E-mail: [info@sfdaw.org](mailto:info@sfdaw.org)

San Francisco, CA 94102

Phone: (415) 398-1234

Telex: (415) 398-1234

Fax: (415) 398-1234

Internet: <http://www.sfdaw.org>

E-mail: [info@sfdaw.org](mailto:info@sfdaw.org)



- b. Process clarification
  - i. Item research and preparation
  - ii. Meeting discussions
  - iii. Follow-up on meeting discussions
  - iv. Follow-up on meeting action items

**5. Commissioner Public Comment**

**6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendation approved by the Commission, requesting action by the Board of Supervisors**  
[Discussion Item]

- a. All accounted for

**7. Committee Reports/Commissioner's Reports**  
[Discussion Item]

- a. Commission's informational flyer/pamphlet/logo [Commissioner Franklin]
- b. Report(s)/legal opinion from the City Attorney
- c. Animal Care & Control Budget Update [Commissioner Friedman]
- d. Development of local "Cambridge-type" ordinance for submission to a Supervisor sponsor regarding oversight of UCSF live animal testing to ensure UCSF compliance with the 1998 Board of Supervisor's resolution concerning same.  
[Commissioner Eckman]
- e. Status of Supervisor support/acknowledgment of the need to prioritize sufficient enforcement of Federal, State, and local law as it applies to entrepreneurs of live animal markets [Commissioner Jensen]
- f. Status of Commission vacancy and calendar date for new appointment  
[Commissioner Kennedy]
- g. Status of finding a city worker to be our transcriptionist and be responsible for our meeting minutes  
[Commissioner Wilson]
- h. Report on updates made to Commission website and letterhead  
[Commissioner Kennedy]



## **8. Old Business**

- Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment, the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.
- a. Presentation of a Certificate of Honor for Coreen Dowling, Founder and Director of the "Give A Dog A Bone" Program  
[Commissioners Friedman, Franklin, and Kennedy]

## **9. New Business**

- Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment, the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.
- a. Discussion by guest speaker, SFPD Officer Arroyo. Noise abatement regarding enforceability of dog barking complaints  
[Commissioner Eckman] [Discussion/Action Item]
- b. Potential opportunities and constraints with regard to allowing joint access to homeless shelters by both homeless people and their dogs  
[Commissioner Franklin] [Discussion Item]
- c. Change date of elections for new officers from the month of January to the month of June  
[Commissioner Wilson] [Discussion Item/Action Item]
- d. Change monthly meeting time from 5:30 to 6:00  
[Commissioner Wilson] [Discussion Item/Action Item]
- e. Election of Secretary for 2003  
[Full Commission] [Discussion Item/Action Item]

## **10. Open Public Comment**

- Members of the public may address the Commission with comments or recommendations on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda* at the beginning or end of the meeting, but not both.

## **11. Calendar Items**

- Commissioners may provide a brief description of item(s) they request be on next month's agenda. Discussion and comprehensive narrative of new calendar submissions will take place during the next meeting. Commissioners need to follow-up on their calendar item submissions via email to the Chair at least one week in advance of the next monthly meeting.

## **12. Closing review of task allotment and next steps**

[Commissioner Franklin] [Review Item]

## **13. Adjournment**





.....

**Disability Access:** Room 408 is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART Station is Civic Center, three blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #42 Downtown Loop, the #71 Haight/Noriega, the F Line to Market and Van Ness, and the Metro stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call 923-6142.

There is accessible parking at the following locations: two (2) designated blue curb spaces on the southwest corner of McAllister Street at Van Ness Avenue; the Performing Arts Garage (entrance on Grove Street between Franklin and Gough Streets), and at Civic Center Plaza Garage.

Large print agendas may be arranged by calling Laurie Kennedy at (415) 522-3524.

The following services are available upon request at least two working days prior to the meeting: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting, or a sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. For information or to make arrangements, contact Carla Vaughn at 252-2500 (voice) or 252-2550 (TDD).

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals.

**Policy on Cell Phones, Pagers, and Electronic Devices:** The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers, and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

**Know Your Rights Under the Sunshine Ordinance:** Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco's Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact Donna Hall at the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 409, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683; Office (415) 554-7724; Fax (415) 554-7854; E-mail: Donna\_Hall@ci.sf.ca.us

Citizens interested in obtaining a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance can request a copy from Ms. Hall or by printing Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code on the Internet, at <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/bdsupvrs/sunshine.htm>





**Attention:** Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 554-9510; fax (415) 703-0121 and web site <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/ethics>



# COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL AND WELFARE

Mailing Address: 1390 Market Street, Room 822

San Francisco, CA 94102

Voice Mail: (415) 554-6074

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

MAR 17 2003

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

## Minutes of Meeting - February 13<sup>th</sup> 2003

### 1. Call to order and roll call

The meeting was convened at 5.40p.m. by Chair Kennedy, who presided during all aspects of the meeting. Five Commissioners (or their lawful designates) holding valid appointments being present, the quorum requirement of Section 6 of the Commission's Rules & Regulations (50 percent of those eligible to vote) was satisfied.

Commissioners in Attendance: Chair Laurie Kennedy, Vice-Chair Sherri Franklin, Secretary June Wilson, Elissa Eckman, Kelly Jensen DVM, Jack Breslin, Dept of Health, Sgt. Bill Herndon, SFPD, Carl Friedman, Animal Care & Control

Absent without excuse: Jamal Modica

Absent with excuse: Rosa Sanchez, City Attorney.

Also, the continued absence of Recreation and Park.

### 2. Public Comment

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment.

Eric Mills spoke about a package he had including scientific live market practices, rodeos, exotic animal acts, Bus & animal abuse, and an exhibit coming up for SF/SPCA. Elliot Katz thanked everyone for supporting "guardian" and suggested we reintroduce cat declawing. Bob O'Brien spoke on animal experiments at UCSF and handed out fliers.

### 3. Approval of the draft minutes of January 9<sup>th</sup>, 2003

The minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission.

### 4. Chairperson's Opening remarks

a. The Chair welcomed and thanked everyone for coming to the meeting.

- a. Role clarification i. The Chair stated that the Commission has an advisory role about all animal issues to the Board of Supervisors.
- ii. At Commission meetings, the general public has a chance to voice their opinions on all animal issues.
- iii. The Chair role is to preside over the meeting and send agenda to everyone concerned.
- iv. Vice Chair role is to preside over meeting when the Chair is absent.
- v. The Secretary role is to record and type minutes, e-mail commissioners and depts. Make copies of agenda and minutes for the meeting.
- Process clarification It was decided to look them over and give comments and ideas at the next meeting.

### 5. Commissioner Public Comment

Comm. Friedman stated that together with Peninsula and Marin Humane Soc. They will hold a telethon on 19<sup>th</sup> April, 2003.



Comm. Wilson suggested advertising on the news media about pigeon feeding places, asking people to come into Animal Control to find out where they are and fining them if they feed outside these designated places but Comm. Friedman stated that this is not a good idea since many of these people have medical problems.

**8. Old Business** (out of order)

Coreen Dowling was presented with a Certificate of Honor signed by the Board of Supervisors for her work with "Give a Dog a Bone" program.

**9. New Business** (out of order)

- a. SFPD Officer Anzore of Noise Abatement Unit briefed the Commission on the barking dog problems in San Francisco. He stated that his unit would be eliminated in July, 2003 due to a lack of funding.

**7. Committee Reports/Commissioner's Reports** (out of order)

- c. Comm. Friedman stated due to budget cuts, he may have to lay off 3 to 7 people. Each city dept. is asked to cut their budget by 10%. He expects that many services will be eliminated. Later on, he may have to cut another 10%. SPCA has raised their fee for a female spays from \$35 to \$100. Comm. Friedman also stated that if he doesn't make necessary cuts that the city wants him too, the City will find a new director who will.

**6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendations approved by Commission requesting action by Board of Supervisors**

- a. All accounted for

**7. Committee Reports/Commissioner's Reports**

**a. Flyer/pamphlet/logo** Comm. Franklin distributed copies of proposed logos. The Commission liked No.5 and will make their choice next month.

**b.** No reports from City Attorney.

**d. Cambridge:** Comm. Eckman has been in touch with Susan Roy of IDA to get a "Cambridge" type ordinance regarding oversight of UCSF live animal testing. Supervisor Gonzalez is interested in this matter.

**g. Finding a city employee to take the minute's etc.** Comm. Friedman has offered to help us with this problem.

Commissioner's Herndon, Friedman and Breslin had to leave at 7p.m. to attend another meeting.

**e. Live animal markets:** Comm. Jensen has not been able to get in touch with any Supervisors but will write letters to all the Supervisors on what we had discussed.

**f. Commission vacancy:** The Chair posted the vacancy at the Clerk's office and on the website on 13<sup>th</sup> February, 2003

**h. Commission website & letterhead:** The Chair will change the mailing address and Comm. Wilson will put a sign up in city hall office.

**9. New Business**

**b. Homeless people with their dogs:** Comm. Franklin stated that she checked around and found out that there are 4 homeless shelters in the city which will allow pets. (lottery drawing).



c. Change date of elections: Comm. Franklin made a motion, seconded by Comm. Eckman to change the election of new officers to July, 2004. The vote was unanimous with Wilson, Jensen, Kennedy, Franklin and Eckman voting.

d. Change meeting time: Comm. Wilson stated that the proposed change was to encourage more of the public to attend our meeting especially those who work till 5p.m. and have a long way to travel. Four voted to keep the same time, Franklin, Eckman, Kennedy, Jensen - Yes. Wilson - No.

e. Election of Secretary for 2003: After considerable discussion, it was decided to reduce the scope of the Secretary's duties with each Commissioner assuming a portion of the duties.

## **10. Public Comment**

No public comment

## **11. Calendar Items**

No calendar item

## **12. Closing review of task allotment and next steps**

Comm. Franklin stated Comm. Friedman will be meeting with Officer Anzore and city attorney to talk about dog legislation, IDA will bring some logo ideas to next meeting, Comm. Eckman's draft of the Cambridge ordinance, make a call to Supe Gonzalez's office, Comm. Jensen is going to send the article about live animal markets to the Board of Supes. Chair Kennedy will talk to the Rules Committee Clerk about postings for Commission vacancies and update website, in addition to changing the bylaws for the elections of officers.

## **12. Adjournment**

The meeting was adjourned at 7.46p.m. motion by Com. Franklin, seconded by Com. Eckman.

Dated: 15<sup>th</sup> February, 2003

Wilson, Secretary

---



# SAN FRANCISCO COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL & WELFARE

## MEETING AGENDA

Thursday, March 13, 2003  
5:30 PM

Room 408  
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

.....  
Laurie Kennedy, Sherri Franklin, June Wilson,  
Elissa Eckman, Kelly Jensen, Jamal Modica,  
Carl Friedman, Jack Breslin, William Herndon  
.....

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

MAR 18 2003

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

MAILING ADDRESS: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 453  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689  
COMMISSION VOICEMAIL: (415) 554-6074  
WEBSITE: [www.sfgov.org/awcc](http://www.sfgov.org/awcc)  
COMMISSION CHAIRPERSON: Laurie Kennedy

.....  
(Note: Public comment will be taken on each discussion/action item.)

### **1. Call to Order and Roll Call**

### **2. Public Comment**

- Members of the public may address the Commission with comments or recommendations on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda* at the beginning or end of the meeting, but not both.

### **3. Approval of Draft Minutes from the February 13, 2003 Meeting** [Discussion/Action Item]

### **4. Chairperson's report and opening remarks** [Discussion Item]

- a. Welcome

### **5. Commissioner Public Comment**

### **6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendation approved by the Commission, requesting action by the Board of Supervisors** [Discussion Item]

- a. All accounted for



## **7. Committee Reports/Commissioner's Reports**

[Discussion Item]

- a. Report(s)/legal opinion from the City Attorney
- b. Development of local "Cambridge-type" ordinance for submission to a Supervisor sponsor regarding oversight of UCSF live animal testing to ensure UCSF compliance with the 1998 Board of Supervisor's resolution concerning same. Update on communication efforts. [Commissioner Eckman]
- c. Status of Supervisor support/acknowledgment of the need to prioritize sufficient enforcement of Federal, State, and local law as it applies to entrepreneurs of live animal markets. Update on mailing of Dr. Gross's article. [Commissioner Jensen]
- d. Commission's informational logo – logo options to be provided by the City Graphic Department and IDA [Commissioner Franklin]
- e. Status of Commission vacancy and calendar date for new appointment [Commissioner Kennedy]

## **8. Old Business**

- Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment, the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.
- a. All accounted for

## **9. New Business**

- Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment, the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.
- a. Discontinuation of December Commission meetings [Commissioner Wilson] [Discussion Item/Action Item]

## **10. Public Comment**

- Members of the public may address the Commission with comments or recommendations on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda* at the beginning or end of the meeting, but not both.

## **11. Calendar Items**

- Commissioners may provide a brief description of item(s) they request be on next month's agenda. Discussion and comprehensive narrative of new calendar submissions will take place during the next meeting. Commissioners need to follow-up on their calendar item submissions via email to the Chair at least one week in advance of the next monthly meeting.

## **12. Closing review of task allotment and next steps**

[Commissioner Franklin] [Review Item]

## **13. Adjournment**





.....

**Disability Access:** Room 408 is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART Station is Civic Center, three blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #42 Downtown Loop, the #71 Haight/Noriega, the F Line to Market and Van Ness, and the Metro stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call 923-6142.

There is accessible parking at the following locations: two (2) designated blue curb spaces on the southwest corner of McAllister Street at Van Ness Avenue; the Performing Arts Garage (entrance on Grove Street between Franklin and Gough Streets), and at Civic Center Plaza Garage.

Large print agendas may be arranged by calling Laurie Kennedy at (415) 522-3524.

The following services are available upon request at least two working days prior to the meeting: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting, or a sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. For information or to make arrangements, contact Carla Vaughn at 252-2500 (voice) or 252-2550 (TDD).

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals.

**Policy on Cell Phones, Pagers, and Electronic Devices:** The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers, and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

**Know Your Rights Under the Sunshine Ordinance:** Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco's Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact Donna Hall at the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 409, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683; Office (415) 554-7724; Fax (415) 554-7854; E-mail: Donna\_Hall@ci.sf.ca.us

Citizens interested in obtaining a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance can request a copy from Ms. Hall or by printing Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code on the Internet, at <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/bdsupvrs/sunshine.htm>

**Attention:** Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 554-9510; fax (415) 703-0121 and web site <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/ethics>



MAY 19 2003

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

**COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL AND WELFARE**

Mailing Address: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 453

San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Voice Mail: (415) 554-6074

Website: www.sfgov.org/awcc

**Minutes of Meeting - March 13<sup>th</sup> 2003**

**1. Call to order and roll call**

The meeting was convened at 5.44p.m. by Chair Kennedy, who presided during all aspects of the meeting. Five Commissioners (or their lawful designates) holding valid appointments being present, the quorum requirement of Section 6 of the Commission's Rules & Regulations (50 percent of those eligible to vote) was satisfied.

Commissioners in Attendance: Chair Laurie Kennedy, Secretary June Wilson, Elissa Eckman, Jamal Modica, Kelly Jensen DVM, Sgt. Bill Herndon, SFPD, Carl Friedman, Animal Care & Control

Absent with excuse: Vice-Chair Sherri Franklin, Jack Breslin, Dept of Health, Rosa Sanchez, City Attorney.

Also, the continued absence of Recreation and Park.

**2. Public Comment**

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment

Eric Mills stated that there is a lawsuit next week concerning school children attending rodeos. He also stated that Assemblyman Leland Yee introduced a bill that the live animal markets can do their reports on what they import in Chinese only. He asked for letters on animal issues to be sent to the State Assembly. Dr. Mills was also awarded commendation (Humane Education) by the Peninsula Humane Society. Com. Herndon arrived at 5.50p.m.

**3. Approval of the draft minutes of February 13<sup>th</sup>, 2003**

The minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission.

**4. Chairperson's Opening remarks**

a. The Chair welcomed and thanked everyone for coming to the meeting.

The Chair stated that at the last meeting, each commissioner was going to do a part of the minutes but City Attorney said that that was not possible and in the meantime Com. Friedman and Wilson have found a secretary who is a city employee. There was no objection to this. Also at the last meeting, we discussed changing the election of officers from January to July and need to revote on it next meeting.

**5. Commissioner Public Comment**

The Chair thanked Com. Friedman and Wilson for finding a secretary.





**6. Status and tracking of recommendations approved by Commission requesting action by Board of Supervisors**

- a. All accounted for

**7. Committee Reports/Commissioner's Reports**

- a. No reports from the City Attorney
- b. Cambridge: Com. Eckman stated that she, with Eliot Katz and Susan Roy was at a meeting with Supe Matt Gonzalez discussing how they would approach UCSF on animal testing. Dr. Katz handed out a package concerning animal research that was obtained through Public Records Act.
- c. Live animal markets: Com. Jensen stated that she wrote a new letter and delivered it to all the Supervisors about Dr. Gross's findings.
- d. Flyer/pamphlet/logo: Linda Fisher from IDA passed out her logos and we will wait till next meeting to vote on them
- e. Vacancy: There is one vacancy on this commission but the Rules Committee has decided to wait until next month before naming new appointments when there will be three more vacancies

**8. Old Business**

- a. All accounted for

**9. New Business**

- a. Discontinuation of December Commission meetings: Com. Wilson introduced a motion to cancel a meeting in December since many people are busy with shopping, parties etc. and many other commissions do not meet in December. That will be voted on next month

**10. Public Comment**

No public comment

**11. Calendar Items**

The Chair received a letter from Chin Chi, a former commissioner, asking the commission to address the feral cats and the Natural Areas Program. NAP is working with the Board of Supervisors concerning the management of our parks. Com. Eckman felt that these issues have been sufficiently discussed in the past. Com. Friedman also congratulated the Chair as she was appointed to Rec and Park Dog Advisory Committee. Com. Herndon stated that the Rec and Park has now chosen to go from the education phase to the enforcement phase. Dr. Katz spoke about the problem of the elephants at the Zoo which are housed on concrete. Instead of exhibits as they are now called, he wants a change to their habitat.

**12. Closing review of task allotment and next steps**

The Chair will make a report

**13. Adjournment**

The meeting was adjourned at 6.36p.m. motion by Com. Eckman, seconded by Com. Wilson.

Dated: 17<sup>th</sup> March, 2003

Wilson, Secretary

---



F  
55  
1  
/10/03  
2

# SAN FRANCISCO COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL & WELFARE

---

## MEETING AGENDA

Thursday, April 10, 2003  
5:30 PM

Room 408  
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

.....  
Laurie Kennedy, Sherri Franklin, June Wilson,  
Elissa Eckman, Kelly Jensen, Jamal Modica,  
Carl Friedman, Jack Breslin, William Herndon  
.....

MAILING ADDRESS: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 453  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689  
COMMISSION VOICEMAIL: (415) 554-6074  
WEBSITE: [www.sfgov.org/awcc](http://www.sfgov.org/awcc)  
COMMISSION CHAIRPERSON: Laurie Kennedy

---

*(Note: Public comment will be taken on each discussion/action item.)*

### 1. Call to Order and Roll Call

- Vote taken on excused absences

### 2. Public Comment

- Members of the public may address the Commission with comments or recommendations on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda* at the beginning or end of the meeting, but not both.

### 3. Approval of Draft Minutes from the March 13, 2003 Meeting [Discussion/Action Item]

### 4. Chairperson's report and opening remarks [Discussion Item]

- a. Welcoming remarks

### 5. Commissioner Public Comment

### 6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendation approved by the Commission, requesting action by the Board of Supervisors [Discussion Item]

- a. All accounted for

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

APR 10 2003

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY



## **7. Committee Reports/Commissioner's Reports**

[Discussion Item]

- a. Report(s)/legal opinion from the City Attorney
- b. Development of local "Cambridge-type" ordinance for submission to a Supervisor sponsor regarding oversight of UCSF live animal testing to ensure UCSF compliance with the 1998 Board of Supervisor's resolution concerning same. [Commissioner Eckman]
- c. Status of Supervisor support/acknowledgment of the need to prioritize sufficient enforcement of Federal, State, and local law as it applies to entrepreneurs of live animal markets. [Commissioner Jensen]
- d. Status of Commission vacancies and calendar date for new appointments. [Commissioner Kennedy]

## **8. Old Business**

- Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment, the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.
- a. Commission's informational logo – updated logo options to be provided by the City Graphic Department and IDA. [Commissioner Franklin]

## **9. New Business**

- Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment, the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.
- a. Discontinuation of December Commission meetings – Change of Article 4.3 of the Commission's Rules and Regulations. [Commissioner Wilson] [Discussion Item/Action Item]
- b. Hold officer election dates in the month of July as opposed to the month of January, as of 2004 – Change of Article 3.1 of the Commission's Rules and Regulations. [Commissioner Wilson] [Discussion Item/Action Item]
- c. Cat declawing issue [Commissioner Franklin] [Discussion Item/Action Item]

## **10. Public Comment**

- Members of the public may address the Commission with comments or recommendations on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda* at the beginning or end of the meeting, but not both.

## **11. Calendar Items**

- Commissioners may provide a brief description of item(s) they request be on next month's agenda. Discussion and comprehensive narrative of new calendar submissions will take place during the next meeting. Commissioners need to follow-up on their calendar item submissions via email to the Chair at least one week in advance of the next monthly meeting.





## 12. Closing review of task allotment and next steps

[Commissioner Franklin] [Review Item]

## 13. Adjournment

.....

**Disability Access:** Room 408 is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART Station is Civic Center, three blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #42 Downtown Loop, the #71 Haight/Noriega, the F Line to Market and Van Ness, and the Metro stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call 923-6142.

There is accessible parking at the following locations: two (2) designated blue curb spaces on the southwest corner of McAllister Street at Van Ness Avenue; the Performing Arts Garage (entrance on Grove Street between Franklin and Gough Streets), and at Civic Center Plaza Garage.

Large print agendas may be arranged by calling Laurie Kennedy at (415) 522-3524.

The following services are available upon request at least two working days prior to the meeting: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting, or a sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. For information or to make arrangements, contact Carla Vaughn at 252-2500 (voice) or 252-2550 (TDD).

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals.

**Policy on Cell Phones, Pagers, and Electronic Devices:** The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers, and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

**Know Your Rights Under the Sunshine Ordinance:** Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco's Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact Donna Hall at the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 409, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683; Office (415) 554-7724; Fax (415) 554-7854; E-mail: Donna\_Hall@ci.sf.ca.us

Citizens interested in obtaining a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance can request a copy from Ms. Hall or by printing Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code on the Internet, at <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/bdsupvrs/sunshine.htm>

**Attention:** Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 554-9510; fax (415) 703-0121 and web site <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/ethics>



F  
55  
2  
1/10/03  
**COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL & WELFARE**

Mailing Address: City Hall #1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 453

San Francisco, CA 94102

Voice Mail: (415) 554-6074

Website: [www.sfgov.org/awcc](http://www.sfgov.org/awcc)

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

MAY 19 2003

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

**MINUTES OF MEETING – April 10, 2003**

**1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL**

Chair Kennedy, who presided during all aspects of the meeting, convened the meeting at 5:35 p.m. Six Commissioners (or lawful designates) holding valid appointments being present, the quorum requirement of Section 6 of the Commission's Rules & Regulations (50 per cent of those eligible to vote) was satisfied.

Commissioners in Attendance: Chair, Laurie Kennedy, Vice-Chair, Sherri Franklin, Secretary, Evonne Arita, Jack Breslin, Department of Health, Carl Friedman, Animal Care & Control, Elissa Eckman, Kelly Jensen, DVM, Jamal Modica, June Wilson

Absent with excuse: Sgt. William Herndon

Also, the continued absence of Recreation and Park

**2. Public Comment**

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment:

Gloria Rogan, Commissioner hopeful, affirmed her desire to fill the upcoming vacancy of Commissioner for the Animal Control Welfare Commission. Commissioner Friedman asked Ms. Rogan to state the reason she wanted to become a Commissioner. Ms. Rogan's reply was in honor of her dog.

Eric Mills provided current information on legislation regarding animals: The hounding bill, which was the ban on hounds hunting bears and bobcats was defeated, there is a possibility of its return in another form. The bill to raise penalty for cock fighting was passed out of Committee, the next step is Appropriations Committee. Assemblyman Leland Yee, introduced a bill to allow the live animal market owners to do their reports in Chinese only. The bill was withdrawn without opposition. The rodeo bill AB 885, carried by Mark Leno, would have expanded the current state law which requires current veterinarians on site or on call at most rodeos in the state to include the charreadas, the Mexican-style rodeos which are now exempt was defeated. Mr. Mills also spoke on using animals in the war and distributed flyers. GOP has given up on Artie bill. The UCSF April 24<sup>th</sup> agenda will include animal research issues. Gestation crates, veal crates, crated calves for replacement heifers passed out of Public Safety Committee 6-2 and will go to double hearing in the Agriculture Committee. Brad Miller, Humane Farming Association has filled ballot initiative to outlaw gestation crates for hogs and sows throughout California for the fall of 2004.

Chin Chi, a former Commissioner reported that she informed the Fort Miley Veterans Administration that the SF Animal Commission, presided over by the Board of Supervisors held hearings concerning animal violations. Ms. Chi requested that the Commission consider holding a hearing within the next three to four months concerning homeless cats where both sides would be able to state their case. The results of hearing could then be



provided to the Natural Areas Program Citizens Advisory Committee for consideration and/or inclusion in the management plans now being constructed for homeless cats. Ms. Chi's concern was that if no input was provided from animal advocates, whatever plan was established by Recreation and Park would become written law. The objective with the hearing would be to get information to this group?

The Chair asked what information was NAP currently receiving? What power did group have and were they responsible for making final decisions with regards to the feral cats or were they advisory? The Chair stated that if any of the Commissioners wanted to sponsor this issue during discussion of agenda items it could be taken up at that time. The Chair thanked Ms. Chi.

L'Danyielle Yacobucci, feral cat advocate, seconded Chin Chi's request. Requested the Commission support them with animal issues. Ms. Yacobucci further requested all animal issues come through this Commission in order to keep up with all the animal issues. The State of California is sponsoring a bill on the declawing issue. She had concerns regarding the health of declawed animals.

Bob O'Brien stated he was organizing demonstration on April 24<sup>th</sup> at UCSF against the use of animals for medical research. A total of 2,768 various animals were listed according to their annual Report of Research dated September 2002. Mr. O'Brien stated his particular concern of the experimentation on owl monkeys provided by Pan-Americans.

Comm. Eckman asked Mr. O'Brien what organization he was representing? Mr. O'Brien stated that he is a member of Fund for Animals and was formerly with Vigil for Animals and is hoping to resurrect the same group and vigil at UCSF as done 10 years ago.

Commissioner Eckman cautioned other Commissioners that although public comments provided at meetings concerning animals are upsetting, information provided must be validated as factual before accepting statements or taking any action.

Chair informed public that any information they wanted to provide to committee can be left on the table.

**3. Approval of the draft minutes of Marth 13, 2003:**

The Commission unanimously approved the minutes.

**4. Chairperson's Report and Opening remarks**

The Chair welcomed and thanked everyone for coming to the meeting. Chair further stated it was good to see public participation and enthusiasm.

**5. Commissioner Public Comment** No public comment

**6. Status and tracking of recommendations approved by Commission requesting action by Board of Supervisors.**

A. All accounted for

**7. Committee Reports/Commissioner's Reports**



- A. No report from the City Attorney, Rosa Sanchez was not present.
- B. **Cambridge**: Commissioner Eckman – Nothing new to report

**Public Comment:** No public comment

- C. **Live animal markets**: Nothing new to report

**Public Comment**: Eric Mills found female western pond turtle, threatened specie found in Oakland. Called bird sanctuary in Cordellia where it would be released in swamp where they have a colony of turtles.

- D. **Vacancy and Calendar Date for Appointments to the Commission**:

Rules Committee Secretary, Deborah Muccino, has received five applications for vacancies and has tentatively scheduled hearing for applicants to be heard by Rules Committee in mid-May. Chair encouraged anyone that has applied or knows of anyone who has applied to contact Ms. Muccino to ensure they have received their application.

**Public Comment:** No public comment

**Commissioner Comment:** Comm. Wilson stated that the Rules Committee would be held on May 13, 2003 and the Animal Control Commission meeting is scheduled for May 10, 2003. In order for there to be a quorum, Comm. Wilson volunteered to sit at the May 10, 2003 meeting. The Chair thanked Comm. Wilson.

## 8. **Old Business**

- A. **Logo**: Commissioner Eckman stated that Linda Fischer or Eliot Katz from IDA was unable to attend meeting.

**Public Comment:** No public comment

Chair stated item would be held till the end of meeting in order to give all Commissioners a chance to view the different logos provided.

## 9. **New Business**

- A. **Discontinuation of December Commission meetings**: This would be a change of Article 4.3 of the Commission's Rules and Regulations.

**Public Comment:** No public comment

**Commissioner Comment:** Comm. Eckman requested language be specified before voting. Chair suggested the following language:

Accept as otherwise determined by the Commission, regular meetings of the Commission shall be held at 5:30 every second Thursday of the month **with the exception of December in City Hall.**

Vote: Modica, approve, Eckman-approve, Franklin-approve, Kennedy-approve, Wilson-approve, Jensen-approve. Motion: passed

- B. Hold officer election dates in the month of July as opposed to the month of January as of 2004 – Change of Article 3.1 of the Commission's Rules and Regulations.

Current language: The Officers of the Committee shall be a Chairperson, Vice Chairperson and Secretary. The Chairperson, Vice Chairperson and Secretary shall be members of the Commission and shall be elected by the Commission. The terms shall expire on January 1, following the date of their election. In the event of a resignation an election to select a new member to serve the unexpired balance of the term shall be heard at the next regular meeting.

Chair suggested the following changes: **Their terms shall expire on July 1<sup>st</sup>.**

**Public Comment:** No public comment

Vote: Modica-approve, Eckman-approve, Franklin-approve, Kennedy-approve, Wilson-approve, Jenson-approve      Motion: passed

- C. Cat declawing issue: Comm. Franklin was contacted by the PAW Project in LA, advocates for animals working on measure to band declawing. Also informed Commission there is current legislation, AB375 to band declawing. Queried Commission as to how they wanted to proceed for the City, i.e., ask for Board of Supervisors to endorse AB 375, or bring West Hollywood measure to SF. Comm. Jensen questioned if there was specific State Legislation language.

Com. Friedman: Expressed concern regarding issues that are mandated by both local and state laws. If State does not specifically refer that City can enforce restrictive or less restrictive laws this can cause complicated legal issues as evidence by the vicious and dangerous dogs ordinance. Comm. Friedman suggested that Commission observe the state bill progress before involving the Board of Supervisors and passing any local legislation. If the bill fails at the State level Commission can then try to pass local regulation.

**Public Comment:** Eric Mills, Action for Animals, Assem. Korets is considering an amendment to allow exemptions for medical therapeutic association. Currently the California. Veterans Association is opposed and would it would be good to have them on board. Next hearing is April 22nd. The Pound Seizure Bill may be dropped and carried on a local level. UC Davis Medical School is still using animals for various testing. Shelters are not set up to be repository for medical research. Sacramento trying to pass local Ordinance to stop use shelter animals.

Dr. Ron Cole objected to the way item for declawing was placed on the agenda. He requested more specific language. Bob O'Brien, unless for a cat's well being, declawing procedure should not be done.

Comm. Eckman: Received call from Cindy Galli, Inside Addition regarding declawing issue. Invited her to meeting since item would be considered at today's meeting. Ms. Galli wanted to know both sides. Also wanted to know what if veterinarians were supportive of issue. Directed Ms. Galli to Comm Jensen and website. Further informed media of current major topics being discussed by Commission; UC Live Animals and Cambridge ordinance.

Comm. Jensen: Spoke briefly to someone named Julie who actually referred to declawing as cosmetic surgery for animals. Com. Eckman referred them to API, Jean Hovey. Chair asked Com. Jensen if she has a feel of how veterinary community felt about issue. Comm. Jensen, speaking for her hospital only, stated their stand is that it is done only for therapeutic reasons. It is not a common process.

Com. Eckman: Questioned what is considered therapeutic. Comm. Jensen provided example. Com Eckman: What are the code of ethics for veterinarians, and could the State legislate what veterinarians do? If legislation were passed, how would it effect veterinarians licensing. Comm. Jensen stated she was unsure of the actual language, but the State could legislate what veterinarians do. As far as declawing there is no precedent. Comm Jensen, yes, Amer. Vet Assoc. has not yet taken a stand on it.

Comm Friedman: State legislates how animals are treated. Animals are considered as property so they can pass any ordinance or laws on how to treat animals. Chair asked Comm. Jensen how prevalent this procedure is in this City? Comm Jensen was unsure of the number of cases.

Comm. Friedman suggested a letter be sent to the SF Veterinarians Medical Association asking them to poll all their members to see if they would support legislation.

Comm. Franklin responded to Dr. Cole that the reason for brief description in the agenda because she was not sure about where discussion would lead.

Chair questioned when is issue going before the state. Comm. Franklin responded it was going before the State very soon and she would like the Commission to make a statement or write a letter.

Comm. Friedman stated that the process for all state bills that effect the City & County should go to the Board of Supervisors to encourage the State Legislative Analyst to support bill, support with amendments or oppose. The proper procedure is to request the Legislative Analyst to go on record for the bill.

Comm. Franklin proposed the Commission do two things. 1) Contact State Legislative Analyst for the City in order to go on record endorsing AB395 Koret's anti-declawing bill.

Comm. Friedman suggested all Commissioners read and become familiar with legislation.

**Public Comment:** Dr. Cole stated Commission could not support bill, a letter must be written to the Board of Supervisors. According to Sunshine Ordinance, item has to be absolutely specific. If unsure what was to be voted on it should have been listed as discussion only not discussion/action. Comm. Friedman asked that Eric Mills to check status of bill.

Eric Mills will check with author of bill and see what is being proposed as far as an amendment. Hearing could have been postponed. Dr. Mills will report findings to the Vice Chair since Chair will not be available.

Chair: Item will be continued as Old Business for the next meeting. Chair suggested Commissioners read bill and become familiar with verbiage.

Call Comm. Franklin. Comm. Franklin wanted to poll (as 1 above) for declawing issue.



**8. Old Business** (out of order) – Back to last voting issue, 8A, vote on logo that was submitted.

**Motion approving Logo sample #2 as the Commission's official logo.**

Vote: Modica, approve, Eckman-approve, Franklin-approve, Kennedy-approve.  
Friedman-approve, Wilson-approve, Jensen-approve, Breslin-approve.  
Motion: passed

Comm Friedman suggested Commission thank IDA. Comm. Franklin suggested a letter to Linda Fischer. Chair responded that she will bring card for next meeting to thank IDA staff. Chair thanked Comm. Franklin for follow-up on logo.

**10. Public Comment:** No public comment.

**11. Calendar items** – any Commissioner wanting to sponsor item

Comm. Wilson motion on feral fix cats. She states NAP is an advisory Board and will not be voted on until November if Board is to continue. Suggested a hearing where Elizabeth Goldstein, Recreation & Park be invited to attend hearing.  
Chair suggested Comm. Wilson email her language for next months agenda.  
Com. Breslin, stated that the feeding of feral cats constitutes a violation of law, he suggested running the legalities of this issue by Rosa Sanchez, City Attorney before next meeting.  
Chair requested Comm. Wilson run the legalities through Rosa Sanchez, City Attorney.

Dr. Cole stated the Commission has missed a representative from the Recreation & Park Department for almost a year. Dr. Cole suggested a letter be written to Recreation & Park requesting they send a representative for their input.

**Public Comment:** None

**12. Closing review of task allotment and next steps**

1. Comm. Kennedy to bring card for Linda Fisher and Denise to thank for logo.
2. Commission to thoroughly read AB 395 anti-declawing Korets bill
3. Comm Friedman to call Elizabeth Goldstein regarding item that concerns department and if they could send a representative to next Comm meeting to address. Will also remind them that seat has not been represented at past meetings
4. Comm Franklin and Jensen will write letter to poll SF Veterinarians on their thoughts on declawing.

Chair Adjourned meeting at 6:58

Dated: 21<sup>st</sup> April, 2003  
Amended: 14<sup>th</sup> May, 2003  
Arita, Secretary

55  
1  
8/03  
✓

# SAN FRANCISCO COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL & WELFARE

---

## MEETING AGENDA

Thursday, May 8, 2003

5:30 PM

Room 408

City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

.....  
Laurie Kennedy, Sherri Franklin, June Wilson,  
Elissa Eckman, Kelly Jensen, Jamal Modica,  
Carl Friedman, Jack Breslin, William Herndon  
.....

MAILING ADDRESS: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 453  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689  
COMMISSION VOICEMAIL: (415) 554-6074  
WEBSITE: [www.sfgov.org/awcc](http://www.sfgov.org/awcc)  
COMMISSION CHAIRPERSON: Laurie Kennedy

---

*(Note: Public comment will be taken on each discussion/action item.)*

**1. Call to Order and Roll Call**

- Vote taken on excused absences

**2. Public Comment**

- Members of the public may address the Commission with comments or recommendations on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda* at the beginning or end of the meeting, but not both.

**3. Approval of Draft Minutes from the April 10, 2003 Meeting**  
[Discussion/Action Item]

**4. Chairperson's report and opening remarks**  
[Discussion Item]

- a. Welcoming remarks

**5. Commissioner Public Comment**

**6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendation approved by the Commission, requesting action by the Board of Supervisors**  
[Discussion Item]

- a. All accounted for

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

MAY 6 2003

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY





## **7. Committee Reports/Commissioner's Reports**

[Discussion Item]

- a. Report(s)/legal opinion from the City Attorney
- b. Development of local "Cambridge-type" ordinance for submission to a Supervisor sponsor regarding oversight of UCSF live animal testing to ensure UCSF compliance with the 1998 Board of Supervisor's resolution concerning same. [Commissioner Eckman]
- c. Status of Supervisor support/acknowledgment of the need to prioritize sufficient enforcement of Federal, State, and local law as it applies to entrepreneurs of live animal markets. [Commissioner Jensen]
- d. Status of Commission vacancies and calendar date for new appointments. [Commissioner Kennedy]

## **8. Old Business**

- Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment, the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.
- a. Commission's informational logo – updated logo options to be provided by the City Graphic Department and IDA. [Commissioner Franklin]
- b. Examine the possibility of Commission endorsement for proposed State legislation AB 395. AB 395 will prohibit veterinarians from declawing cats. The legislation inserts a ban into the state's veterinary medical practice act that will prohibit the declawing surgical procedures known as onychectomy and tendonectomy. The bill does allow for declawing for therapeutic purposes only – when the procedure is medically necessary to protect the cat's health. [Commissioner Franklin] [Discussion Item/Action Item]

## **9. New Business**

- Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment, the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.
- a. Explore and research the potential development of a local ordinance that would outline humane and responsible guidelines for the welfare, care, and maintenance of dogs who are housed primarily outdoors. [Commissioner Franklin] [Discussion Item]

## **10. Public Comment**

- Members of the public may address the Commission with comments or recommendations on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda* at the beginning or end of the meeting, but not both.

## **11. Calendar Items**

- Commissioners may provide a brief description of item(s) they request be on next month's agenda. Discussion and comprehensive narrative of new calendar submissions will take place during the next meeting. Commissioners need to follow-up on their calendar item submissions via email to the Chair at least one week in advance of the next monthly meeting.



## 12. Closing review of task allotment and next steps

[Commissioner Franklin] [Review Item]

## 13. Adjournment

.....

**Disability Access:** Room 408 is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART Station is Civic Center, three blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #42 Downtown Loop, the #71 Haight/Noriega, the F Line to Market and Van Ness, and the Metro stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call 923-6142.

There is accessible parking at the following locations: two (2) designated blue curb spaces on the southwest corner of McAllister Street at Van Ness Avenue; the Performing Arts Garage (entrance on Grove Street between Franklin and Gough Streets), and at Civic Center Plaza Garage.

Large print agendas may be arranged by calling Laurie Kennedy at (415) 522-3524.

The following services are available upon request at least two working days prior to the meeting: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting, or a sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. For information or to make arrangements, contact Carla Vaughn at 252-2500 (voice) or 252-2550 (TDD).

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals.

**Policy on Cell Phones, Pagers, and Electronic Devices:** The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers, and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

**Know Your Rights Under the Sunshine Ordinance:** Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco's Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact Donna Hall at the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 409, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683; Office (415) 554-7724; Fax (415) 554-7854; E-mail: Donna\_Hall@ci.sf.ca.us

Citizens interested in obtaining a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance can request a copy from Ms. Hall or by printing Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code on the Internet, at <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/bdsupvrs/sunshine.htm>

**Attention:** Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 554-9510; fax (415) 703-0121 and web site <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/ethics>





55  
2  
4  
/8/03

# COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL AND WELFARE

Mailing Address: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 453

San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Voice Mail: (415) 554-6074

Website: www.sfgov.org/awcc

## Draft Minutes of Meeting - May 8<sup>th</sup> 2003

### 1. Call to order and roll call

The meeting was convened at 5.37p.m. by Chair Kennedy, who presided during all aspects of the meeting. Five Commissioners (or their lawful designates) holding valid appointments being present, the quorum requirement of Section 6 of the Commission's Rules & Regulations (50 percent of those eligible to vote) was satisfied.

Commissioners in Attendance: Chair Laurie Kennedy, Vice-Chair Sherri Franklin, Secretary June Wilson, Elissa Eckman, Kelly Jensen DVM, Sgt. Bill Herndon, SFPD, Capt. Vicky Guldbech, ACC Supervisor

Absent with excuse: Jamal Modica, Jack Breslin, Dept of Health, Carl Friedman, Animal Care & Control Rosa Sanchez, City Attorney.

Also, the continued absence of Recreation and Park.

### 2. Public Comment

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment

Eric Mills stated that there was an article in the newspaper tying live animal markets in China to SARS. Also trouble in their budget at the Zoo.

### 3. Approval of the draft minutes of April 10<sup>th</sup>, 2003

The Commission unanimously approved the minutes with a few minor corrections.

### 4. Chairperson's Opening remarks

a. The Chair welcomed and thanked everyone for coming to the meeting.

### 5. Commissioner Public Comment

None.

### 6. Status and tracking of recommendations approved by Commission requesting action by Board of Supervisors

a. All accounted for

### 7. Committee Reports/Commissioner's Reports

a. No reports from the City Attorney

b. Cambridge: Com. Eckman stated that she had sent a draft concerning the ordinance to In Defense of Animals for their input.

- c. **Live animal markets:** Com. Jensen stated that she had nothing knew to report. It was suggested to contact John Duran of West Hollywood for his input. It was also suggested that the Health Dept. become more involved in monitoring the import of live animals.
- d. **Vacancy/Appointments:** There are 11 people applying for 4 seats on the Commission which will be heard at the Rules Committee on May 14<sup>th</sup>.

## **8. Old Business**

- a. **Flyer/pamphlet/logo:** Com. Franklin stated that the logos would be ready very soon.
- b. **Cat Declawing:** AB395 failed in committee in Sacramento and will probably be introduced again next January. While the Vet Assn. has not yet taken a position on this issue, many vets do oppose this procedure. This item is continued.

## **9. New Business**

- a. Capt. Guldbeck from ACC wants an amendment to the Code that would outline humane and responsible guidelines for the welfare, care and maintenance of dogs that are housed outdoors, which includes guard dogs and tethered dogs. At ACC, there are 9 animal control officers when there should be 20. This item is continued.

## **10.Public Comment**

No public comment

## **11.Calendar Items**

None.

## **12.Closing review of task allotment and next steps**

Com Eckman will contact IDA about language for Cambridge style ordinance pertaining to UC laboratory animals. Contact John Duran of West Hollywood City Council to find out how they passed their anti cat declawing ordinance.

Com. Kennedy - find out who we should approach to test the live animals, being sold as food, regarding disease, Health Dept. or Board of Supervisors?

Com. Jensen - communicate with Com. Breslin about above

Com. Franklin - Contact Linda at IDA about artwork for our logo, plus work with Capt. Guldbeck to make a working SF ordinance pertaining to Dog Maintenance & Care

All Commissioners - email Com. Franklin with any suggestions about dog ordinance, also think of any possible objections about cat declawing and recommended solutions.

## **13.Adjournment**

The meeting was adjourned at 7.02p.m. motion by Com. Eckman, seconded by Com. Jensen.

Dated: 11<sup>th</sup> May, 2003

Arita, Secretary

---

F  
55  
6/12/03  
C-2

# SAN FRANCISCO COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL & WELFARE

## MEETING AGENDA

Thursday, June 12, 2003  
5:30 PM

Room 408  
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

JUN 13 2003

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

.....  
Laurie Kennedy, Sherri Franklin, Elissa Eckman,  
Kelly Jensen, Jamal Modica, Susan Wheeler, Chin Chi  
Carl Friedman, Jack Breslin, William Herndon  
.....

MAILING ADDRESS: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 453  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689  
COMMISSION VOICEMAIL: (415) 554-6074  
WEBSITE: [www.sfgov.org/awcc](http://www.sfgov.org/awcc)  
COMMISSION CHAIRPERSON: Laurie Kennedy

*(Note: Public comment will be taken on each discussion/action item.)*

### 1. Call to Order and Roll Call

- Vote taken on excused absences

### 2. Public Comment

- Members of the public may address the Commission with comments or recommendations on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda* at the beginning or end of the meeting, but not both.

### 3. Approval of Draft Minutes from the May, 8, 2003 Meeting [Discussion/Action Item]

### 4. Chairperson's report and opening remarks [Discussion Item]

- a. Welcoming remarks.
  - i. Welcome Susan Wheeler and Chin Chi to the Commission
  - ii. Thank you to June Wilson for serving on the Commission

### 5. Commissioner Comment

### 6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendation approved by the Commission, requesting action by the Board of Supervisors [Discussion Item]

- a. All accounted for





## **7. Committee Reports/Commissioner's Reports** [Discussion Item]

- a. Report(s)/legal opinion from the City Attorney
- b. Status of Supervisor support/acknowledgment of the need to prioritize sufficient enforcement of Federal, State, and local law as it applies to entrepreneurs of live animal markets. [Commissioner Jensen]
- c. Update on the Commission's informational pamphlet [Commissioner Kennedy]

## **8. Old Business**

- Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment, the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.
- a. Development of local "Cambridge-type" ordinance for submission to a Supervisor sponsor regarding oversight of UCSF live animal testing to ensure UCSF compliance with the 1998 Board of Supervisor's resolution concerning same.
  - i. Special address by the President of the Board of Supervisors, Matt Gonzales [Commissioner Eckman or Franklin] [Discussion/Action Item]
- b. Development of a local ordinance to outline/define humane and responsible guidelines for the welfare, care, and maintenance of dogs who are housed primarily outdoors.  
[Commissioner Friedman and Franklin] [Discussion/Action Item]
- c. Examine the possibility of Commission endorsement for proposed State legislation AB 395. AB 395 will prohibit veterinarians from declawing cats. The legislation inserts a ban into the state's veterinary medical practice act that will prohibit the declawing surgical procedures known as onychectomy and tendonectomy. The bill does allow for declawing for therapeutic purposes only – when the procedure is medically necessary to protect the cat's health.  
[Commissioner Franklin] [Discussion Item/Action Item]

## **9. New Business**

- Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment, the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.
- a. Discuss establishment of a "responsible dog guardianship" legislation package to include:
  - i. Amending Section 40 of the San Francisco Health Code - Increasing the penalty for individuals who fail to remove and properly dispose of their dog's feces on public property of this City or upon the private property of another.  
[Commissioner Herndon and Franklin] [Discussion Item]
  - ii. Amending San Francisco Health Code – Add Section 39: Requiring dog guardians, or those responsible for the supervision of a said dog, to exchange personal identification information and rabies shot verification when dog bites occur.  
[Commissioner Herndon and Franklin] [Discussion Item]





- iii. (Old Business item 8b to also be included in the responsible dog guardianship legislation package.)
- b. Consider eradicating "Commissioner Comment" as an official item on the Commission's monthly agenda.  
[Commissioner Eckman] [Discussion Item/Action Item]

## 10. Public Comment

- Members of the public may address the Commission with comments or recommendations on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda* at the beginning or end of the meeting, but not both.

## 11. Calendar Items

- Commissioners may provide a brief description of item(s) they request be on next month's agenda. Discussion and comprehensive narrative of new calendar submissions will take place during the next meeting. Commissioners need to follow-up on their calendar item submissions via email to the Chair at least one week in advance of the next monthly meeting.

## 12. Closing review of task allotment and next steps

[Commissioner Franklin] [Review Item]

## 13. Adjournment

.....

**Disability Access:** Room 408 is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART Station is Civic Center, three blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #42 Downtown Loop, the #71 Haight/Noriega, the F Line to Market and Van Ness, and the Metro stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call 923-6142.

There is accessible parking at the following locations: two (2) designated blue curb spaces on the southwest corner of McAllister Street at Van Ness Avenue; the Performing Arts Garage (entrance on Grove Street between Franklin and Gough Streets), and at Civic Center Plaza Garage.

Large print agendas may be arranged by calling Laurie Kennedy at (415) 522-3524.

The following services are available upon request at least two working days prior to the meeting: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting, or a sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. For information or to make arrangements, contact Carla Vaughn at 252-2500 (voice) or 252-2550 (TDD).

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals.

**Policy on Cell Phones, Pagers, and Electronic Devices:** The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers, and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

**Know Your Rights Under the Sunshine Ordinance:** Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other



agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco's Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact Donna Hall at the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 409, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683; Office (415) 554-7724; Fax (415) 554-7854; E-mail: Donna\_Hall@ci.sf.ca.us

Citizens interested in obtaining a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance can request a copy from Ms. Hall or by printing Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code on the Internet, at <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/bdsupvrs/sunshine.htm>

**Attention:** Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 554-9510; fax (415) 703-0121 and web site <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/ethics>





155  
2  
6/12/03

**COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL & WELFARE**

Mailing Address: City Hall #1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 453

San Francisco, CA 94102

Voice Mail: (415) 554-6074

Website: www.sfgov.org/awcc

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

JUN 25 2003

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

**MINUTES OF MEETING – June 12, 2003**

**1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL**

Chair Kennedy, who presided during all aspects of the meeting, convened the meeting at 5:32 p.m. Eight Commissioners (or lawful designates) holding valid appointments being present, the quorum requirement of Section 6 of the Commission's Rules & Regulations (50 per cent of those eligible to vote) was satisfied.

Commissioners in Attendance: Chair, Laurie Kennedy, Vice-Chair, Sherri Franklin, Secretary, Evonne Arita, Carl Friedman, Animal Care & Control, Elissa Eckman, Kelly Jensen, DVM, Chin Chi, Susan Wheeler, Sgt. William Herndon (arrived at 5:50 p.m.), Absent with excuse: Jack Breslin, Department of Health, Jamal Modica

Also, the continued absence of Recreation and Park

**2. Public Comment**

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment.

Eric Mills, Action for Animals stated concerns regarding live animal markets and their relations to SARS and other communicable disease.

Elliot Katz congratulated the new Commissioners Chin Chee and Susan Wheeler

**3. Approval of the draft minutes of May 8<sup>th</sup>, 2003**

The Commission unanimously approved the minutes with a few minor corrections.

**4. Chairperson Opening remarks**

The Chair welcomed the new Commissioners Chin Chee and Susan Wheeler and also the congratulated Commissioners Eckman and Franklin on their continued appointment. The Chair, on behalf of the Commission expressed sincere appreciation to June Wilson, former Commissioner and Comm. Secretary, for her many years of dedication and service to the Commission.

**5. Public Comment**

President of the Board of Supervisors, Matt Gonzalez stated his continued concerns with the live animal testing at UCSF. The Supervisor requested that the Commission investigate the possibilities of a municipality imposing rules and regulations on institutions such as UCSF, and upon completion of their investigation, make their recommendations to the Board of Supervisors. Supervisor Gonzalez referred to the Cambridge Ordinance as an example, and also made note of a recently passed Berkeley City Ordinance relating to live animal testing. Supervisor Gonzales further urged the Commission meet with all parties involved, i.e., UCSF, City Attorney's office, to



discuss improved performance at UCSF. Supervisor Gonzalez further stated that because of the Commission's current notable status, continued work on this issue would bring a heightened level of awareness to the community.

## **6. Old Business**

### **A. Animal Testing**

Comm. Eckman discussed model ordinance received, Commission on Animals and Laboratories (CAL) and stated that it could be used as a starting point of a new proposed ordinance for SF. Comm. Franklin stated that this item should be agendaized and that UCSF should be invited and informed that the Commission intends to hold meetings with the purpose of establishing a City ordinance regulating live animal testing.

### **Public Comment**

Eric Mills stated UCSF is state-supported institution but the public is not allowed to attend their Animal Care and Use Committee meetings. Dr. Mills felt a member of the Commission should be present at these meetings. Bobby O'Brien distributed literature from UCSF animal testing. Elliot Katz stated that if ordinance is to be effective and supported by the Board of Supervisors, UCSF and the public must be included for their input at the hearings. Dr. Katz felt the ultimate goal should be to move away from using live animal research.

Comm. Friedman stated that it is imperative that the goal of the Commission be clear and precise; is the goal to be a gradual decrease in animal testing and eventually stopping, or for the animals that are experimented on treated in with careful and humane consideration.

Comm. Herndon suggested the meeting with the City Attorney would be to inform them of the Commission's proposed course of action and obtain their opinion as the best course of action to take.

Chair stated that all Commissioners obtain copy of draft ordinance and familiarize themselves with content. Comm. Eckman, Franklin, Jensen and Wheeler will meet with the City attorney to ask specific questions and obtain legal opinion.

### **Commissioner Comment**

Comm. Friedman informed the Commission that due to his numerous other commitments, and demands on his time, he would not regularly attend future meetings. He has served on the Commission for approximately 30 years but has found it increasingly difficult to attend. Capt. Vicky Guldbeck, Department of Animal Care and Control will attend future meeting in Comm. Friedman's place. If for any reason Capt. Guldbeck were unable to attend, Comm. Friedman would attend the meeting. The Chair thanked Comm. Friedman for his continued help and support with the Commission and welcomed Capt. Guldbeck.





## **Public Comment**

Eric Mills, Ellia Yakabuchi and Billy Creighton thanked Commissioner Friedman for all his work with the Commission.

### **B. Dog Maintenance & Care**

Capt. Guldbech stated that the amendment to the current ordinance would provide ACC the ability to enforce better care and maintenance for dogs that are housed outdoors.

Discussion on the penalty section followed. Comm. Franklin stated that the fine for not maintaining proper care for their dog should be higher. Capt. Guldbech's concern with charging too high a fine was that owners would elect to surrender their animals rather than pay fine. Comm. Herndon stated that the fine should be paid whether or not they have surrendered their dog. Amendment to the ordinance is mainly for the education of maintenance for their animal.

## **Public Comment**

Anita Griswald, suggested that a list of possible choices, depending on owners living situation, be added to provide for social needs of dogs. Lisa Vitore suggested that language be specific when referring to space of confinement, exercise and socialization. Ms. Vitore also suggested fines should be proportionate to offense. Eliot Katz suggested that owners surrendering their dog to avoid paying a fine should not be allowed to have another dog.

## **7. New Business**

### **A. Responsible Dog Guardianship**

Comm. Herndon discussed two amendments to legislation:

i. Amending S.F. Health Code, Sec. 40: Increasing the penalty for individuals who fail to remove and properly dispose of their dog's feces. It is the number one complaint that turns public opinion on the entire dog community. If increase in penalty is implemented it would help improve relations for dog community. Fees would be increased \$100 for first offense, \$150 for the second offense, and \$250 for third offense.

ii. Amending S.F. Health Code, Sec. 39: referred to as Bite-and-Run, requires dog guardians to exchange personal identification information in cases of dog bites. This legislation would aid in police investigations.

## **8. Public Comment**

Dr. Ron Cole stated dog owners should not be allowed to let their dogs poop on any public-location, also pickup is important.

Lisa Vitore stated dog poop is a waste management problem. Eliot Katz supported increase in poop fines. The increase would make owners more responsible for their animal, and in turn better for entire community. Officer John Denny supported Bite-and-Run ordinance. Legislation is not meant to punish the dog but to aid the SFPD identify the owner in cases where follow-up information is needed.





## **Commissioner Comment**

Comm. Franklin proposed the three legislation items be packaged together. Comm Herndon stated increased fine would be the best incentive to observe laws. Comm. Chi stated that incorporating an alternative to paying a fine would be volunteering at a shelter. Comm. Franklin will incorporate suggestions if appropriate and have the three legislations packaged together by next meeting in preparation for submission to the Board of Supervisors. The Chair stated concern regarding Agenda Items 9a,i and ii with regards to volunteers not serving enough time, since SPCA requires a longer training period.

The Chair stated for the record: Commissioners Jenson, Friedman, Herndon and Eckman had to be excused for appointments. The Chair motioned to have Items carried over to the next meeting. Seconded by Comm. Franklin. Item b carried forward to next meeting.

## **C. AB 395 Declawing Issue**

### **9. Public Comment**

Anita Griswald worked with authors of West Hollywood's ban on cat declawing. She has contact with people who worked on ordinance and offered support if needed.

Lana Basel – Currently works at veterinary office, stated that the problem was that the public not educated about declawing procedure.

The Chair requested Ms. Basel to help gather data from other veterinarians: What percentage of revenue comes from declawing procedure? Ms. Basel will forward information to Comm. Wheeler.

Linda Fisher stated she opposed procedure and felt the real problem was education. More outreach is needed. Dr. Katz stated legislation would not prevent owners from declawing cats, if prohibited in SF, they would go to another city.

Comm. Chi suggested legislation be sent as package.

Agenda Items (taken out of order):

Item 7A: Not applicable

Item 7B: Carried to next month's agenda

Item 7C: Linda Fisher, IDA final text for pamphlet ready to print by next month

### **10. Public Comment**

June Wilson expressed concern regarding the request for additional funds, 30 million Zoo Bonds that may not be used for animals. Ms. Wilson suggested representative from AC&W attend sub-committee hearings.

Lisa Vitore, suggested the Gold Bone Program, leash option program, allows deserving owners not to have their dog on leash be put back in effect.



Robin Buckley, Alamo Square Dog Advisory Committee, stated there have been questions regarding Comm. Herndon being able to serve fairly on AC&W Comm. He requested the Commission send letter of support to SF Police Chief on behalf of Comm. Herndon.

**11. Calendar Items:**

Comm. Chi read proposed resolution for discussion at next months meeting regarding increased jurisdiction of Commission.

Eliot Katz requested Zoo; elephant issue is sponsored for the calendar next months meeting.

**12. Closing review of task allotment and next steps.**

1. Comm, Jensen, Franklin and Eckman and Jensen (Comm Wheeler if Comm. Jensen is unable to attend) will set up meeting with City Attorney to discuss Cambridge Ordinance.
2. Comm. Guldbeck will work on maintenance of outdoor dog ordinance for next months meeting.
3. Comm. Wheeler will work on anti-declawing measure.

**13. Adjournment**

The meeting was adjourned at 8:20 p.m., motion by Chair, seconded by Comm. Franklin

Dated: 20<sup>th</sup> May, 2003

Arita, Commission Secretary





# SAN FRANCISCO COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL & WELFARE

## MEETING AGENDA

Thursday, July 10, 2003

5:30 PM

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

JUL 10 2003

Room 408

City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

.....  
Laurie Kennedy, Sherri Franklin, Elissa Eckman,  
Kelly Jensen, Susan Wheeler, Chin Chi  
Jack Breslin, Vicki Guldbeck, William Herndon  
.....

MAILING ADDRESS: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 453  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689  
COMMISSION VOICEMAIL: (415) 554-6074  
WEBSITE: [www.sfgov.org/awcc](http://www.sfgov.org/awcc)  
COMMISSION CHAIRPERSON: Laurie Kennedy

*(Note: Public comment will be taken on each discussion/action item.)*

### **1. Call to Order and Roll Call**

- Vote taken on excused absences

### **2. Public Comment**

- Members of the public may address the Commission with comments or recommendations on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda* at the beginning or end of the meeting, but not both.

### **3. Approval of Draft Minutes from the June 12, 2003 Meeting** [Discussion/Action Item]

### **4. Chairperson's report and opening remarks** [Discussion Item]

- a. Welcoming remarks

### **5. Commissioner Comment**

### **6. Committee Reports/Commissioner's Reports** [Discussion Item]

- a. Report(s)/legal opinion from the City Attorney



- b. Status of Supervisor support/acknowledgment of the need to prioritize sufficient enforcement of Federal, State, and local law as it applies to entrepreneurs of live animal markets. [Commissioner Jensen]

## **7. Status and tracking of letters of recommendation approved by the Commission, requesting action by the Board of Supervisors**

[Discussion Item]

- a. All accounted for

## **8. Old Business**

- Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment, the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.
- a. Development of local "Cambridge-type" ordinance that would provide critical oversight of UCSF live-animal testing.  
[Commissioner Eckman and Franklin] [Discussion/Action Item]
- b. Establishment of a "Responsible Dog Guardianship" legislation package to include:
  - i. Development of a SF ordinance, which would outline/define humane and responsible guidelines for the welfare, care, and maintenance of dogs who are housed primarily outdoors.  
[Commissioners Herndon, Guldbeck, and Franklin] [Discussion/Action Item]
  - ii. Amendment of Section 40 of the SF Health Code - Increasing the penalty for individuals who fail to remove and properly dispose of their dog's feces on public property of this City or upon the private property of another.  
[Commissioners Herndon, Guldbeck, and Franklin] [Discussion Item/Action]
  - iii. Amendment of SF Health Code – Add Section 39: Requiring dog guardians, or those responsible for the supervision of a said dog, to exchange personal identification information and rabies shot verification when dog bites occur.  
[Commissioners Herndon, Guldbeck, and Franklin] [Discussion/Action Item]
- c. Proposed establishment of a local ordinance that would prohibit veterinarians from declawing cats. This legislation would prohibit declawing surgical procedures, but would allow declawing for therapeutic purposes only – when the procedure is medically necessary to protect the cat's health.  
[Commissioners Wheeler and Chi] [Discussion Item/Action Item]

## **9. New Business**

- Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment, the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.
- a. Consider eradicating "Commissioner Comment" as an official item on the Commission's monthly agenda.  
[Commissioner Eckman] [Discussion Item/Action Item]
- b. Proposed resolution urging the San Francisco Board of Supervisors to reaffirm that the Commission of Animal Control and Welfare is the official venue for studying and making recommendations on all issues impacting the welfare, control, and





maintenance of animals in public, private, and commercial care within the City and County of San Francisco.

[Commissioner Chi] [Discussion Item/Action Item]

## 10. Public Comment

- Members of the public may address the Commission with comments or recommendations on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda* at the beginning or end of the meeting, but not both.

## 11. Calendar Items

- Commissioners may provide a brief description of item(s) they request be on next month's agenda. Discussion and comprehensive narrative of new calendar submissions will take place during the next meeting. Commissioners need to follow-up on their calendar item submissions via email to the Chair at least one week in advance of the next monthly meeting.

## 12. Closing review of task allotment and next steps

[Commissioner Franklin] [Review Item]

## 13. Adjournment

\*\*\*\*\*

**Disability Access:** Room 408 is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART Station is Civic Center, three blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #42 Downtown Loop, the #71 Haight/Noriega, the F Line to Market and Van Ness, and the Metro stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call 923-6142.

There is accessible parking at the following locations: two (2) designated blue curb spaces on the southwest corner of McAllister Street at Van Ness Avenue; the Performing Arts Garage (entrance on Grove Street between Franklin and Gough Streets), and at Civic Center Plaza Garage.

Large print agendas may be arranged by calling Laurie Kennedy at (415) 522-3524.

The following services are available upon request at least two working days prior to the meeting: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting, or a sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. For information or to make arrangements, contact Carla Vaughn at 252-2500 (voice) or 252-2550 (TDD).

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals.

**Policy on Cell Phones, Pagers, and Electronic Devices:** The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers, and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

**Know Your Rights Under the Sunshine Ordinance:** Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco's Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact Donna Hall at the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 409, 1 Dr. Carlton B.





Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683; Office (415) 554-7724; Fax (415) 554-7854; E-mail: Donna\_Hall@ci.sf.ca.us

Citizens interested in obtaining a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance can request a copy from Ms. Hall or by printing Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code on the Internet, at <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/bdsupvrs/sunshine.htm>

**Attention:** Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 554-9510; fax (415) 703-0121 and web site <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/ethics>



**COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL & WELFARE**

Mailing Address: City Hall #1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 453

San Francisco, CA 94102

Voice Mail: (415) 554-6074

Website: www.sfgov.org/awcc

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

**DRAFT - MINUTES OF MEETING - July 10, 2003**

JUL 24 2003

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

**1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL**

Chair Kennedy, who presided during all aspects of the meeting, convened the meeting at 5:37 p.m. Eight Commissioners (or lawful designates) holding valid appointments being present, the quorum requirement of Section 6 of the Commission's Rules & Regulations (50 per cent of those eligible to vote) was satisfied.

Commissioners in Attendance: Chair, Laurie Kennedy, Vice-Chair, Sherri Franklin, Elissa Eckman, Esquire, Capt. Vicky Guldbeck, Animal Care & Control, Kelly Jensen, DVM, (arrived at 5:55 p.m.) Chin Chi, Susan Wheeler, Sgt. William Herndon (arrived at 5:50 p.m.), Absent with excuse: Jack Breslin, Department of Health, Absent without excuse: Jamal Modica  
Also, the continued absence of Recreation and Park

The Chair stated the Comm. Modica has missed three meetings without excuse which is deemed as resignation according to rules and regulation of the Commission. The Chair will post the vacant seat and also inquire as to when the hearing would be scheduled before the Rules Committee.

**2. Public Comment**

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment.

Eric Mills, Action for Animals stated concerns regarding live animal markets and their relations to SARS and other communicable disease. He further stated that China has ban on selling, keeping and eating of all wild life.

**3. Approval of the draft minutes of June 12, 2003**

The Commission unanimously approved the minutes with corrections.

**4. Chairperson Opening Remarks**

The Chair welcomed everyone and thanked all for coming to the meeting. The Chair further stated that this meeting had a full agenda but wanted to keep the adjournment of the meeting to 7:30 p.m. Each speaker would be kept to his or her allotted time limit.

**5. Commissioner Comment**

No Commissioner Comment

**6. Committee Reports/Commissioner's Reports**

- a. No report from the City Attorney
- b. Nothing new to report

**Public Comment:**

Eric Mills stated his continued concern for the conditions of the live animal markets and their relation to various communicable diseases. Corinne Beuchet stated her concerns regarding the terrible conditions of the live animal markets in the Sunset District. Comm. Eckman urged Ms. Beuchet and the other Commission attendees to write their Supervisor and express their concerns. Elliot Katz supported both speakers concerns. Bob O'Brien inquired of the status of live animal markets. Comm. Eckman stated that the Commission has continually struggled with the issue for many years. Comm. Franklin stated the Commission is advisory to the Board of Supervisors and it is up to the Board to take action on advice received from the Commission. There has been involvement of various agencies, Fish and Game, SFPD, and ACC in attempt to close these markets. Nadine May stated that the ACW Comm. has recommended in the past to the Board of Supervisors that markets be closed.

**Commissioner Comment:**

Capt. Guldbech has spoken with Jack Breslin, Environmental Health, DPH, whose strong opinion was that the live animal markets concerns are not health related issue as much as they are animal welfare related issues. Comm. Eckman stated AB2479 addressed the issue on statewide level, which requires animals sold for food have sufficient space, and also be treated humanely. Although there is a State Law, there has been no compliance within the City. The Commissions difficulty is dealing with the application of the state law. It was noted that Jack Breslin had said that there was a citation issued to one of the markets. Comm. Eckman reiterated her earlier statement and urged the audience to write their Supervisors to express their concerns.

**7. Status and tracking of letters of recommendation approved by the Commission, requesting action by the Board of Supervisors.**

A. All accounted for.

**8. Old Business**

**A. Cambridge Ordinance**

Comm. Eckman has been in communication with Susan Roy of In Defense of Animals, and an attorney in Washington, D.C. who have provided information. Comm. Eckman is currently trying to find out what connections the City has with UCSF that would give the Commission jurisdiction to enable them to establish a Commission on Animals in Laboratories (CAL), that would have ability to access UCSF live animal testing areas. The City Attorney will contact the attorney in Washington who is willing to assist with legal arguments that would be brought before the Board of Supervisors.

**Public Comment:**

Lurilla Harris suggested a committee be appointed to address the Sunshine Ordinance, which would apply to the City regarding public records and public access, which the public is paying for.

**Commissioner Comment:**



Comm. Eckman stated addressing the Sunshine Ordinance as it applied to UCSF was a good idea and would pass it on to those that are assisting the Commission. Comm. Eckman further stated live animal market is a difficult issue. The next step would be the City Attorney contacting the attorney in Washington to try to answer jurisdictional questions and she will also forward the Sunshine Ordinance.

**B. Responsible Dog Guardianship Legislation Package**

The three included in the package:

1. Ordinance for welfare, care and maintenance for dogs who are housed primarily outdoors.
2. Amendment of Section 40 of the SF Health Code, increasing the penalty for individuals who fail to remove and properly dispose of their dogs feces on public or private property within the City.
3. Amendment of SF Health Code adding Section 39, which would require dog guardians or those responsible for said dog to exchange personal identification and rabies shot verification.

Comm. Franklin stated that suggested language given at the last meeting was incorporated into ordinance. The Commission has also been in contact with Supervisor Dufty's office who will most likely carry the ordinance.

Comm. Guldbeck added language under Item A, regarding shelter requirements, "a dog must have equal space outside the shelter." Section D was wordy and was changed and made easily defined. Tethering was also redefined for ease in interpretation. The penalty section would be at the department's discretion. Their goal is compliance not penalty.

**Public Comment**

No public comment

Comm. Wheeler suggested the height requirement be added to the language. Comm. Guldbeck stated the type of stake would be approved for use by the ACC. Information would be distributed to individuals on the type of stake approved and also what pet stores carry the supply. Comm. Franklin will be contacting Supervisor Dufty this week to request he carry the package.

Comm. Eckman motioned to make recommendation to the Board of Supervisors; Comm. Kennedy seconded it. Vote: Jenson-approve, Eckman-approve, Franklin-approve, Kennedy-approve, Chin Chi-approve, and Wheeler-approve. Motion passed.

**C. Proposed establishment of local ordinance that would prohibit veterinarians from declawing of cats.**

Comm. Wheeler reported that Lauri Fazell was unable to obtain the percentage of revenues which comes from declawing procedure, but was able to obtain approximate number of veterinarian clinics that performed declawing vs. those that did not declaw cats. It was found the majority of veterinarians do declaw without asking many questions. Comm. Wheeler was in contact with Mr. Jenvel at the PAWS Project to inquire how veterinarians dealt with declawing issue, and also asked should S.F. attempt to pass an ordinance banning declawing given there was action on the State level. Comm. Wheeler will report her findings at next month's meeting. Comm. Wheeler

recommended that the Commission pursue passing an ordinance on declawing. Considerable discussion followed:

### **Public Comment**

Lurilla Harris suggested that a questionnaire be sent to the Veterinarians requesting information.

Tom Mack, practicing veterinarian, representing the Board Member of the California Veterinarian Medical Association (CVMA) stated the CVMA is strongly opposed to proposed ban on declawing ordinance. CVMA believes the decision to declaw a cat should be made by the owner in consultation with their veterinarian. Veterinarians need to continue to consult with their clients and explore all possible alternatives. Declawing may be the only available option that provides a family to keep their cat in their home. Procedure should be kept legal and performed in the best interest of the cat. Veterinarians are professionally trained to distinguish medical and behavioral problems, and need to be able to continue to consult and educate their clients on the issue. The underlying consequences could lead to increase owner abandonment or euthanasia by pet owners if the public is stripped of their choices. Dr. Mack respectfully urged the Commission to consider leaving the choice of declawing between owner and Veterinarian. If it were a life or death matter, than declawing would be the procedure to save the cat. Dr. Mack further stated that very few declawing procedures are done.

Comm. Kennedy requested that Dr. Mack contact Comm. Wheeler and share information. Comm. Chi stated that the Commission wrote educational pamphlets three years ago on why declawing was not good and the other alternatives. Comm. Chi asked whether members of CVMA would agree to keep this pamphlet in their offices and encourage clients to read it before making decision.

Comm Herndon stated that if legislation was passed in SF and owners could still go to surrounding counties. Could some type of agreement with the veterinarian community to distribute pamphlets be made so that Commission could be assured that information was going to owners considering declawing procedure?

Comm. Jenson asked Dr. Mack if the CVMA was concerned if new veterinarians entering a practice would not be able to voice their ethical concerns regarding this practice? Wouldn't the law help a young veterinarian, not wanting to do procedure, but felt pressured to do procedure?

Dr. Mack responded that no one should be forced to do a procedure. The CVMA respects the need and knows the difference between behavioral and pain control. The issue is addressed in the most humane way.

Comm. Wheeler stated there are more humane alternative ways of dealing with cat clawing issues.

Dr. Mack stated that veterinarians do not like to declaw cats, but when it is necessary to save cats life, it would be done.

Comm Eckman asked Dr. Mack what is the position of the CVMA on other elective types of surgeries, such as cosmetic surgery, cropping and docking.

Dr. Mack stated that the CVMA is opposed to any type of cosmetic surgery. They strongly advocate that animals be kept in their natural way. CVMA.



L'Danyielle Yacobucci, disagreed with the CVMA. Her main reason for disagreement was there was insufficient education of the public. Procedure is not done in the best interest of the cat.

Dr. Norman Freed, agreed with Dr. Mack, he stated most of the veterinarians do not advocate declawing, but felt procedure should be done when necessary.

Lana Basel reported that she canvassed all Vet Hospital in SF and found out of 26 veterinarian hospitals, 14 did perform the declawing procedures, 8 would try to discourage, and 4 did not perform procedure.

Jean Lindgreen, a volunteer with SPCA stated that many cats that have been declawed end up at the SPCA with behavior problems after being declawed. Training is possible as an alternative to declawing. She agreed the Commission should recommend declawing ordinance.

Volunteer at Pets Unlimited supported ordinance. When asked, customers who come to Pets Unlimited are not aware of the process of declawing. She felt veterinarians were not educating public on declawing issue and is in favor of the ordinance. Dr. Elliot Katz, in favor of declawing ordinance.

Linda Fisher, opposed declawing. She worked as veterinarian technician for ten years and has assisted in many declawing procedures. In her experience working with veterinarians did not ask questions, did not provide any education before performing procedure.

Dr. Ron Cole believes it is not a matter for legislation but a matter for education. Declawing should be procedure of last resort but needs to be used as a last resort, education is important.

June Wilson suggested using other alternatives of training. Martha Hoffman felt veterinarians needed to be educated.

#### **Commissioner Comment:**

Comm. Guldbeck stated behavior problems develop but owners need to be educated by their veterinarians. Comm. Guldbeck will be speaking before the CVMA and will bring up this issue. Comm. Guldbeck further stated that she is against this procedure and would like to see this procedure stopped. Comm. Eckman stated the public should be informed of the natural behaviors of cats.

Comm. Kennedy stated that from her experience it was lack of education. Comm. Wheeler found from research conducted, that veterinarians were not educating owners about alternatives to surgery, or about the actual surgery. Comm. Jenson. stated that there was a disconnect between education of veterinarians and what happens in real life. The community needs to take steps to ensure new graduates are educated on declawing and also give them the opportunity not to have to perform the surgery. Comm. Jenson stated she is against declawing and felt the only way to be effective was to promote education.

The Chair urged Dr. Mack to speak to other veterinarians who are taking part of this procedure, veterinarians outside of his clinic but are part of the CVMA what education is given to the clients before the decision to declaw is performed. Comm. Wheeler would service as his contact.

Comm. Wheeler stated she would be interested in knowing what counseling is given to clients so that it could be considered in discussion.

Comm. Eckman stated that speaking about educating veterinarians should be dealt with at the medical school level. Veterinarians do not want to advocate for a particular position and offer clients other alternatives and try to be objective. Most veterinarians err on the side of the client's feelings. A component of veterinarian's education, should be a requirement to take class on ethics in order to be aware of the opinions of the different communities.

Comm Kennedy suggested Comm. Wheeler contact the key individuals in West Hollywood, Dr. Mack discuss the issue more with the veterinarian community and connect with Comm. Wheeler. The information provided would help reach the same goal. Comm Kennedy also asked Comm. Guldbeck when speaking at the CVMA to bring up key issues that were shared with Dr. Mack. (Discussion Item to be continued)

## **9. New Business**

### **A. Eradicating "Commissioner Comment" as official comment:**

Comm. Eckman stated in order to remain compliant with the Sunshine Ordinance and to remain on issues on the agenda and not stray to other issues, Commissioner comment, Item #5, should be removed from agenda.

**Public Comment:** Dr. Katz, June Wilson support removing Commissioner Comment.

Comm. Franklin introduced motioned to vote on eradicating Commissioner Comment; Comm. Chi seconded the motion. Comm. Eckman, motioned to delete Commissioner Comment from Agenda, seconded by Comm. Franklin. Vote: Jenson-approve, Eckman-approve, Franklin-approve, Kennedy-approve, Chin Chi-approve, Wheeler-approve. Motion approved by unanimous vote.

### **B. Proposed resolution reaffirming ACW as official venue for all issues regarding animals in public, private and commercial care within the City and County of San Francisco**

Item B was continued for discussion at next months meeting. Comm. Eckman suggested that Comm. Chi review proposed language with the City Attorney, Rosa Sanchez.

## **10. Public Comment:**

Dr. Katz offered stated In Defense of Animals has posted \$1,500 reward for information on the persons who tied the hen to the helium-filled balloons and offered posters to be circulated within the community. Dr. Katz also suggested that Comm. Jenson be consulted for her input as well as Dr. Mack. L'Danyielle Yacobucci read statement from Mary McAllister in support of proposed resolution to reaffirm mission of the Commission. June Wilson informed Commission and audience of the Zoo audit tomorrow, 2:00p.m. Room 263 City Hall.

## **11. Calendar Items**

Comm. Chi suggested letter of commendation written for Officer who shot down balloons tied to the hen.

## **12. Closing review of task allotment and next steps**

Comm. Kennedy will post Commission seat vacancy.

Comm. Franklin and Guldbeck will set up appointment to speak with Supervisor Dufty

Comm Wheeler will continue communication with PAWS Project, Dr. Mack and Comm. Jenson.

Comm. Kennedy when writing up the agenda will delete Commissioner Comment from agenda

Comm. Eckman will continue to work on UCSF/Sunshine Ordinance request.

Meeting Adourned at 7:45 p.m.

Dated: 13<sup>th</sup> July, 2003



# SAN FRANCISCO COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL & WELFARE

## MEETING AGENDA

Thursday, August 14, 2003  
5:30 PM

Room 408  
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

AUG 14 2003

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

.....  
Laurie Kennedy, Sherri Franklin, Elissa Eckman,  
Kelly Jensen, Susan Wheeler, Chin Chi  
Jack Breslin, Vicki Guldbeck, William Herndon  
.....

MAILING ADDRESS: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 453  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689  
COMMISSION VOICEMAIL: (415) 554-6074  
WEBSITE: [www.sfgov.org/awcc](http://www.sfgov.org/awcc)  
COMMISSION CHAIRPERSON: Laurie Kennedy

*(Note: Public comment will be taken on each discussion/action item.)*

### 1. Call to Order and Roll Call

- Vote taken on excused absences

### 2. Public Comment

- Members of the public may address the Commission with comments or recommendations on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda* at the beginning or end of the meeting, but not both.

### 3. Approval of Draft Minutes from the July 10, 2003 Meeting [Discussion/Action Item]

### 4. Chairperson's report and opening remarks [Discussion Item]

- a. Welcoming remarks

### 5. Committee Reports/Commissioner's Reports [Discussion Item]

- a. Report(s)/legal opinion from the City Attorney
- b. Status of Supervisor support/acknowledgment of the need to prioritize sufficient enforcement of Federal, State, and local law as it applies to entrepreneurs of live animal markets. [Commissioner Jensen]





## **6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendation approved by the Commission, requesting action by the Board of Supervisors**

- a. Establishment of a "Responsible Dog Guardianship" legislation package to include:
  - i. Development of a SF ordinance, outlining/defining humane and responsible guidelines for the welfare, care, and maintenance of dogs who are housed primarily outdoors. [Commissioners Herndon, Guldbach, and Franklin]
  - ii. Amendment of Section 40 of the SF Health Code - Increasing the penalty for individuals who fail to remove and properly dispose of their dog's feces on public property of this City or upon the private property of another. [Commissioners Herndon, Guldbach, and Franklin]
  - iii. Amendment of SF Health Code – Add Section 39: Requiring dog guardians, or those responsible for the supervision of a said dog, to exchange personal identification information and rabies shot verification when dog bites occur. [Commissioners Herndon, Guldbach, and Franklin]

## **7. Old Business**

- Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment, the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.
- a. Development of local "Cambridge-type" ordinance that would provide critical oversight of UCSF live-animal testing. [Commissioner Eckman and Franklin] [Discussion/Action Item]
- b. Proposed establishment of a local ordinance that would prohibit veterinarians from declawing cats. This legislation would prohibit declawing surgical procedures, but would allow declawing for therapeutic purposes only – when the procedure is medically necessary to protect the cat's health. [Commissioners Wheeler] [Discussion Item/Action Item]

## **8. New Business**

- Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment, the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.
- a. Proposed resolution urging the San Francisco Board of Supervisors to reaffirm that the Commission of Animal Control and Welfare is the official venue for studying and making recommendations on all issues impacting the welfare, control, and maintenance of animals in public, private, and commercial care within the City and County of San Francisco. [Commissioner Chi] [Discussion Item/Action Item]
- b. Letter of thanks to the ACC officer(s) responsible for saving the hen who was tied to balloons in June. [Commissioner Chi] [Discussion Item/Action Item]
- c. Discuss posting some of the research and advocacy information collected by Commissioners with regard to Commission related topics. [Commissioner Wheeler] [Discussion Item/Action Item]



## 9. Public Comment

- Members of the public may address the Commission with comments or recommendations on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda* at the beginning or end of the meeting, but not both.

## 10. Calendar Items

- Commissioners may provide a brief description of item(s) they request be on next month's agenda. Discussion and comprehensive narrative of new calendar submissions will take place during the next meeting. Commissioners need to follow-up on their calendar item submissions via email to the Chair at least one week in advance of the next monthly meeting.

## 11. Closing review of task allotment and next steps

[Commissioner Franklin] [Review Item]

## 12. Adjournment

.....

**Disability Access:** Room 408 is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART Station is Civic Center, three blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #42 Downtown Loop, the #71 Haight/Noriega, the F Line to Market and Van Ness, and the Metro stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call 923-6142.

There is accessible parking at the following locations: two (2) designated blue curb spaces on the southwest corner of McAllister Street at Van Ness Avenue; the Performing Arts Garage (entrance on Grove Street between Franklin and Gough Streets), and at Civic Center Plaza Garage.

Large print agendas may be arranged by calling Laurie Kennedy at (415) 522-3524.

The following services are available upon request at least two working days prior to the meeting: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting, or a sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. For information or to make arrangements, contact Carla Vaughn at 252-2500 (voice) or 252-2550 (TDD).

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals.

**Policy on Cell Phones, Pagers, and Electronic Devices:** The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers, and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

**Know Your Rights Under the Sunshine Ordinance:** Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco's Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact Donna Hall at the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 409, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683; Office (415) 554-7724; Fax (415) 554-7854; E-mail: Donna\_Hall@ci.sf.ca.us







Citizens interested in obtaining a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance can request a copy from Ms. Hall or by printing Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code on the Internet, at <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/bdsupvrs/sunshine.htm>

**Attention:** Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 554-9510; fax (415) 703-0121 and web site <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/ethics>



# COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL & WELFARE

Mailing Address: City Hall #1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 453

San Francisco, CA 94102

Voice Mail: (415) 554-6074

Website: www.sfgov.org/awcc

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

SEP 25 2003

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

## MINUTES OF MEETING – August 14, 2003

55  
2  
11/4/03

### 1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

The meeting was called to order at 5:35 p.m. On the call of the roll, the following Commissioners were noted absent:

**Absent with excuse:** Kelly Jensen, DVM; Capt. Vicky Guldbeck, Animal Care & Control; also, the continued absence of Recreation and Park

**Quorum present:** Comm. Eckman was noted present at 5:51 p.m.; Comm. Herndon (will leave at 6:30p.m.); Chair stated that Jack Breslin, Department of Health, will not regularly attend Commission meetings, he will attend when necessary and/or requested.

### 2. Public Comment: No public comment.

### 3. Approval of Draft Meeting Minutes: Minutes approved for August 14, 2003

### 4. Chairperson Opening Remarks:

The Chair welcomed and thanked all for attending the meeting. The Chair announced the vacancy on the Commission. Notice is posted on the Commission's website and also on the Board of Supervisor's website. The Board of Supervisors will be on holiday until late September; the vacancy will not be heard before the Rules Committee until late September, early October.

### 5. Committee Reports/Commissioner Comment:

- a. **Report(s)/legal opinion from the City Attorney:** None
- b. **Status of Supervisor support/acknowledgment of the need to prioritize sufficient enforcement of Federal, State, and local law as it applies to entrepreneurs of live animal markets:** Comm. Jensen not available to provide update.

#### Public Comment:

Lurilla Harris questioned if individual Commissioners took responsibility for particular items? Comm. Kennedy stated any topic that is discussed, put into action for research or for comments to the Board of Supervisors, the Commissioners may work as a team, or less than a quorum. Comm. Jensen was the lead person on Item B. Ms. Harris requested that if it were known beforehand that a Commissioner would not be available to provide update, could arrangements be made for another Commissioner to provide update/report?

### 6. Status and tracking of 'letters of recommendation' approved by the Commission, requesting action by the Board of Supervisors.

Comm. Franklin reported that she would be meeting with Supervisor Dufty on August 20<sup>th</sup> to discuss the full package. If the Supervisor is supportive of package, he will bring it forth to the Health and Human Services Committee. If passed at Health and Human Services, it will then go before the full Board of Supervisors. If approved at all levels, the City may possibly have a new responsible dog guardianship package by the end of the year.

**Public Comment:** None



## 7. Old Business

### b. (Taken out of order) Proposed establishment of a local ordinance that would prohibit veterinarians from declawing cats.

Comm. Wheeler reported that contact was made with the *PAW* Project, the group that was instrumental in getting the West Hollywood ordinance passed and also the law that is currently in Sacramento. Dr. Conrad, a veterinarian with the PAWS Project, who has had considerable experience dealing with cats after they have been declawed (expertise with large cats, lions, tigers etc.), is now leading a crusade to ban declawing. The *PAW* Project also provided photos of declawing procedures. Contact was also made with Pam Rundquist, of the Association of Veterinarians for Animal Rights, who also supports the ban on declawing. They provided a number of pamphlets that the association produced on the subject. Additionally, contact was made with Jill Kiesow, of the Animal Protection Institute, who has written a position paper based on the work of Jean Holva. Both organizations strongly support the ban on declawing.

Comm. Wheeler has also had continued correspondence with Mr. Draganastic of the World Society for the Protection of Animals Convention. There were a number of countries in Europe that have signed on to this convention. Noted as part of the Convention's statement, "*Surgical operations for the purpose of modifying the appearance of a pet animal or for other non-curative purposes shall be prohibitive and in particular the docking of tails, cropping of ears, de-vocalization, declawing and de-fanging.*" Exceptions were made for the health of the animal.

Comm. Wheeler stated that all Commissioners received a sizable package from Dr. Mack stating reasons the CVMA organization is against the declawing ban. With the help of Comm. Kelly Jensen and Lana Bajal, a questionnaire has been created and sent to all the veterinarians in San Francisco. Comm. Wheeler will try to have the results from the survey by the next meeting. Comm. Wheeler further stated that until March of 2003, the American Veterinarian Association statement on declawing of domestic cats was: "*Declawing of domestic cats is justifiable when the cat cannot be trained to refrain from using its paws destructively.*" Comm. Wheeler noted that since the West Hollywood Ordinance was passed, and the Koretz Bill, the AVMA has issued another more humane statement regarding declawing and the importance of only doing the declawing procedure in extreme situations. It is assumed that the CVMA also follows the same guidelines. Political pressure may have been instrumental in this modification. The Chair thanked Comm. Wheeler for all the time and effort spent on the declawing issue.

#### Public Comment:

Ron Cole suggested questionnaire should ask information on how this procedure is done, i.e., laser surgery, type of instrument, the difference in behavior post-operatively, number of post-operative visits, and number of cats affected by this type of surgery. Dr. Cole also suggested that a hotline providing more information on the procedure might help educate owners and prevent this type of procedure. L'Danyielle Yacobucchi provided an article that was written in Catnip stating AVMA's old policy and the updated modified policy. Copy provided to Comm. Wheeler. Lana Bajal stated how procedure is performed should not be a precursor to ban on declawing. She agreed that the term "extreme cases" should be clearly defined. The purpose of the ban was to educate the public and to deter declawing of cats in the future. Lurilla Harris suggested questionnaire be made available to public for their suggestions. June Wilson, who is from New Zealand stated that although New Zealand is considered behind the times, they have had a ban on declawing for many years. Dr. Tom Mack, representing the CVMA, stated that he has discussed declawing issue with many veterinarians and has heard many different views. He has sent out a survey to veterinarians of San Francisco, and other involved agencies such as UC Davis and other representative groups. Dr. Mack further stated that the CVMA was appalled that the procedure was done without consultation with the owners, and also that Veterinarians should have owners fill out consent forms. The owners should also be made to realize that it is a surgical procedure, it is permanent and the cat could not be an outdoor cat afterwards. Many cats can be trained without going through the pain of

surgery. It is a procedure that has been overlooked and should be brought out into the open. Nancy Wurful, asked what percentage of veterinarian's income comes from this type of procedure, and how many declawing procedures are done compared to other surgical procedures.

**Commissioner Comment:**

Comm. Wheeler stated she would like to see the results of Dr. Mack's survey. She also informed Ms. Wurful that there was a question on the survey which asked the number of surgeries that are done a month. There were two polls taken one by Cat Fancy, which showed 74.48% of those that responded thought declawing was inhumane. The NBC's Internet poll stated 75% of the responses also thought declawing was inhumane. Comm. Franklin stated that many cats that come into shelters are also rehomed. Comm. Herndon stated concern for cats that did not fall under the category of "medically necessary" but are surrendered because of behavioral problems and are not adoptable. Comm. Franklin stated many cats that have been declawed end up with severe behavior problems and are not adoptable. Comm. Herndon suggested that before the veterinarian performs the declawing procedure, the owner/guardian of a cat would have to go to a behaviorist to try to modify the behavior of the cat. Comm. Kennedy stated research would have to be done on the number of available behaviorists in San Francisco. Comm. Wheeler will be in Southern California and will go to West Hollywood to speak with someone regarding the ban passed. Comm. Kennedy asked that Comm. Wheeler find out what problems, if any, they encountered in getting the declawing ordinance passed. The item will be carried forward for discussion at next month's meeting in September.

**8. New Business**

- a. **Proposed resolution urging the SF Board of Supervisors to reaffirm that the Animal Control and Welfare Commission as the official venue of all issues impacting the welfare control and maintenance of animals in public, private and commercial care within San Francisco.**

Comm. Chi stated the reason for introducing this proposal was the result of many discussions and urging from members of the public who felt that all issues concerning animals should be brought before the Commission of Animal Control & Welfare. Comm. Chi further stated that most of the public assumed that all issues that impact animals were brought before the Commission.

**Public Comment:**

Dr. Cole stated his concern that the language of the resolution was too broad. Other organizations such as Animal Care and Control, SPCA, the Zoo and others make decisions regarding animals. The resolution needs to be very specific in order not to inundate the Commission. Nancy Wurful supports resolution and felt the public needs to be informed that there is a forum in matters affecting animals, and encouraged to participate in the formation of policies. Copy of Ms. Wurful's speech provided for Commission records. Bob O'Brien, Lisa Vitore, Jean Lindgren, Nadine May, June Wilson, Martha Hoffman and L'Danyielle Yacobucci all support the resolution. Mark Claven stated concerns of proposed resolution specifically language regarding commercial care within the City, which include building code, zoning ordinances, health code and permitting issues.

**Commissioner Comment:**

Comm. Herndon requested the SFPD be exempt from proposed legislation, as is Animal Care and Control, for reasons of public safety. Comm. Eckman stated that resolution is not ready to be voted upon. Comm. Eckman further suggested that the City Attorney review the resolution. In its current form it changes the enacting mandate of the Commission. Comm. Kennedy felt the real issue is whether or not the feral cats issue is being heard. If the feral cat issues are not being dealt with and the public is not properly informed that is the issue that should be brought before the Board of Supervisors. As a Commission, AC&W has the authority to hear any issue, although being discussed at another committee, if they felt the issue was not being dealt with appropriately. This does not mean the Board would have to reaffirm on all issues.



Comm. Kennedy further stated that the credibility of the Commission needed to be established before asking for the Board of Supervisors for support the resolution. Comm. Wheeler suggested the item be re-tabled for a future date. Comm. Chi did not feel resolution needed to be reviewed by the City Attorney and requested the Commission take a vote. Comm. Franklin stated she was not ready to vote on the resolution and wanted time to research information further before presenting to the Board of Supervisors. Comm. Chi agreed to re-table resolution for a future date.

## **9. Old Business**

### **a. (taken out of order) Development of "Cambridge-type" ordinance that would provide critical oversight of UCSF live-animal testing.**

Comm. Eckman reported that she has continued discussions with Susan Roy of In Defense of Animals. It was decided that in order to gain access into UCSF a Sunshine Ordinance request would be written requesting what connections UCSF has with the City, i.e., labor, contracts, etc. Copy of request will be sent to attorney in Washington, who will review and inform Comm. Eckman if request is sufficient and can be used to gain access. He will also work closely with City Attorney, Rosa Sanchez at her request. If UCSF were found to be immune to the Sunshine Ordinance request, the California Public Records Act would be used. Comm. Eckman stated that although it is a lengthy process it is imperative that a procedure is found that would enable the Commission to have oversight over UCSF's live animal testing.

#### **Public Comment:**

Bob O'Brien stated that there are ethical considerations about what is going on at UCSF. The Committee on Animal Research at UCSF is overlooking it. This is something the Commission should be concerned about. The Animal Welfare Act, which requires community representation on the Committee, is being violated; there is no contact with the community and that Committee. They are working with a closed-door policy, which is a violation of the intent of the Animal Welfare Act. By the next meeting he will give summary of what they are doing to dogs. Comm. Franklin stated that the Commission is aware of the experiments that are being done at UCSF and has copious records on the different experiments. She asked Mr. O'Brien to discuss additional information after the meeting. Christine Hoerler stated her concern for animals at UCSF and urged Commission to do whatever possible to help animals. Lisa Vitorie stated continued concern with animal testing.

## **10. New Business**

### **b. Letter of thanks to the SFPD Officer responsible for saving the hen who was tied to balloons in June.**

Comm. Chi stated that a letter of appreciation should be written to the SFPD Officer from the Commission. Comm. Franklin motioned to have Comm. Chi write a personal letter on behalf of the Commission thanking the officer.

#### **Public Comment:**

Lisa Vitore requested the Officer's supervisor and the Police Commission be copied on the letter. Comm. Eckman stated that a note would be sent to the Board of Supervisors stating that a letter of appreciation from the Commission was going to be sent to the officer thanking him for his actions. If there is no response within ten days from the Board of Supervisors, the letter will be sent. Motion seconded by Comm. Wheeler, carried by the following vote: Ayes: 5 - Kennedy, Franklin, Eckman, Chi, Wheeler

**c. Discuss posting research and advocacy information collected by Commissioners with regard to Commission related topics.**

Comm. Wheeler stated that a forum was needed where work that was done by the Commission in the past could be presented for public view. This would help keep the public informed.

**Public Comment:**

Dr. Cole suggested requesting various organizations such as Animal Care & Control, SPCA, and the Zoo provide monthly reports of things that have changed or are new in their organization. Some type of incentive for writing these reports could be given. Nadine May supported idea; the public would appreciate more information.

**Commissioner Comment:**

Comm. Kennedy asked Comm. Wheeler how did she plan to implement this project? Comm. Kennedy further stated that the Commission has a website. Comm. Eckman stated that although it would be good for the public to view more information and to be able to access films that were shown the Commission, it would be a labor-intensive job. Comm. Franklin suggested using links to other websites. Comm. Kennedy stated an area on the website could be created for relevant materials that relate to the topics discussed at the hearings. Comm. Wheeler stated that if each Commissioner would be responsible for scanning or providing information to the Webmaster for the task that they were working on, the job could be manageable.

**11. Public Comment:**

Lisa Vitore, with SF Dog, requested the Commission's support on putting together a good dog policy. Dogs that pass some type of behavior test would be able to be walked without a leash. Comm. Franklin stated that a Good Citizenship test would be given at Alamo Square on Saturday, August 23<sup>rd</sup>. Bob O'Brien thanked Comm. Eckman for all the work she has done with the ordinance for UCSF. He further stated that if the Commission's plan did not work, he has a Plan B available. Eva Hoeler thanked Commission for devoting time to UCSF issue. Joan Miller, on the Board of Directors for Cat Fanciers' in Fairfield, was interested in addressing the Commission regarding feral cats. Of particular interest was the definition used for feral cats, which is a term commonly used when it is really meant to say free roaming cats. Ms. Miller stated she looked forward to coming back to the next Commission meeting to discuss feral cats and the proposed declawing ordinance.

**12. Calendar Items - none**

**13. Closing review of task allotment and next steps.**

- Comm. Wheeler will continue work on declawing issue.
- Comm. Eckman will continue to work on UCSF research issue.
- Comm. Chi will write a letter to commend SFPD officer. Prior to this, a notification will be sent to the Clerk of the Board informing her of the Commission's intention of sending a letter. If no response received from the Board, Comm. Chi will forward letter to the SFPD Officer with a copy to SFPD Commission.
- Re-table proposed resolution urging the SF Board of Supervisors to reaffirming the Animal Control and Welfare Commission as the official venue of all issues impacting the welfare, control and maintenance of animals in public, private and commercial care within San Francisco re-tabled for January 2004.

**14. Adjournment – Meeting adjourned at 7:58 p.m.**

August 26, 2003

Evonne Arita, Commission Secretary





# SAN FRANCISCO COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL & WELFARE

## MEETING AGENDA

Thursday, September 11, 2003  
5:30 PM

Room 408  
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

SEP 10 2003

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

.....  
Laurie Kennedy, Sherri Franklin, Elissa Eckman,  
Kelly Jensen, Susan Wheeler, Chin Chi  
Jack Breslin, Vicki Guldbeck, William Herndon  
.....

MAILING ADDRESS: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 453  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689  
COMMISSION VOICEMAIL: (415) 554-6074  
WEBSITE: [www.sfgov.org/awcc](http://www.sfgov.org/awcc)  
COMMISSION CHAIRPERSON: Laurie Kennedy

*(Note: Public comment will be taken on each discussion/action item.)*

### **1. Call to Order and Roll Call**

- Vote taken on excused absences

### **2. Public Comment**

- Members of the public may address the Commission with comments or recommendations on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda* at the beginning or end of the meeting, but not both.

### **3. Approval of Draft Minutes from the August 14, 2003 Meeting**

[Discussion/Action Item]

### **4. Chairperson's report and opening remarks**

[Discussion Item]

- a. Welcoming remarks

### **5. Committee Reports/Commissioner's Reports**

[Discussion Item]

- a. Status of Supervisor support/acknowledgment of the need to prioritize sufficient enforcement of Federal, State, and local law as it applies to entrepreneurs of live animal markets. [Commissioner Jensen]





**6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendation approved by the Commission, requesting action by the Board of Supervisors**  
[Discussion Item]

- a. Establishment of a "Responsible Dog Guardianship" legislation package to include:
  - i. Development of a SF ordinance, which would outline/define humane and responsible guidelines for the welfare, care, and maintenance of dogs who are housed primarily outdoors.  
[Commissioners Franklin and Guldbech]
  - ii. Amendment of Section 40 of the SF Health Code - Increasing the penalty for individuals who fail to remove and properly dispose of their dog's feces on public property of this City or upon the private property of another.  
[Commissioners Franklin and Guldbech]
  - iii. Amendment of SF Health Code – Add Section 39: Requiring dog guardians, or those responsible for the supervision of a said dog, to exchange personal identification information and rabies shot verification when dog bites occur.  
[Commissioners Franklin & Guldbech]

**7. Old Business**

- Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment, the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.
- a. Proposed establishment of a local ordinance that would prohibit veterinarians from declawing cats. This legislation would prohibit declawing surgical procedures, but would allow declawing for therapeutic purposes only – when the procedure is medically necessary to protect the cat's health.
  - i. Scheduled guest speakers:
    - 1. Dr. Conrad, DVM. and Dr. Jim Jensbold, M.D. from the Paw Project
    - 2. Pam Rundquist from AVAR
    - 3. Representatives from the Animal Protection Institute
    - 4. Dr. Dean Bayerink, DVM  
[Commissioners Wheeler] [Discussion Item/Action Item]
- b. Development of local "Cambridge-type" ordinance that would provide critical oversight of UCSF live-animal testing.  
[Commissioner Eckman] [Discussion/Action Item]

**8. New Business**

- Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment, the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.

**9. Public Comment**

- Members of the public may address the Commission with comments or recommendations on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda* at the beginning or end of the meeting, but not both.

**10. Calendar Items**

- Commissioners may provide a brief description of item(s) they request be on next month's agenda. Discussion and comprehensive narrative of new calendar submissions will take place during the next



meeting. Commissioners need to follow-up on their calendar item submissions via email to the Chair at least one week in advance of the next monthly meeting.

## 11. Closing Review of Task Allotment and Next Steps

[Commissioner Franklin] [Review Item]

## 12. Adjournment

.....

**Disability Access:** Room 408 is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART Station is Civic Center, three blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #42 Downtown Loop, the #71 Haight/Noriega, the F Line to Market and Van Ness, and the Metro stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call 923-6142.

There is accessible parking at the following locations: two (2) designated blue curb spaces on the southwest corner of McAllister Street at Van Ness Avenue; the Performing Arts Garage (entrance on Grove Street between Franklin and Gough Streets), and at Civic Center Plaza Garage.

The following services are available upon request at least two working days prior to the meeting: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting, or a sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. For information or to make arrangements, contact Carla Vaughn at 252-2500 (voice) or 252-2550 (TDD).

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals.

**Policy on Cell Phones, Pagers, and Electronic Devices:** The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers, and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

**Know Your Rights Under the Sunshine Ordinance:** Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco's Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact Donna Hall at the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 409, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683; Office (415) 554-7724; Fax (415) 554-7854; E-mail: Donna\_Hall@ci.sf.ca.us

Citizens interested in obtaining a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance can request a copy from Ms. Hall or by printing Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code on the Internet, at <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/bdsupvrs/sunshine.htm>

**Attention:** Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 554-9510; fax (415) 703-0121 and web site <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/ethics>





**COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL & WELFARE**

Mailing Address: City Hall #1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 453

San Francisco, CA 94102

Voice Mail: (415) 554-6074

Website: [www.sfgov.org/awcc](http://www.sfgov.org/awcc)

SEP 29 2003

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY**DRAFT MINUTES OF MEETING – September 11, 2003****1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL**

Chair Kennedy, who presided during all aspects of the meeting, convened the meeting at 5:39 p.m. Seven Commissioners (or lawful designates) holding valid appointments being present, the quorum requirement of Section 6 of the Commission's Rules & Regulations (50 per cent of those eligible to vote) was satisfied.

Commissioners in Attendance: Laurie Kennedy, Chair, Sherri Franklin, Vice-Chair, Elissa Eckman, Esquire, Chin Chi, Susan Wheeler, Capt. Vicky Guldbeck, Animal Care & Control, Sgt. William Herndon, SFPD. Absent with excuse: Kelly Jensen, DVM. Also, the continued absence of Recreation and Park

**2. Public Comment**

It was stated that on the agenda the Commissioners should be listed with the organizations they represent. Lisa Vitore would like Commissioners to be more assertive with the Board of Supervisors and the Recreation & Park Department regarding three issues: 1) No kill policy 2) Tool box of ways in which to socialize dogs, 3) Off-leash (Socializing and training more important than leash laws.)

**3. Approval of Draft Minutes from the August 14, 2003 Meeting**

The minutes were amended and unanimously approved by the Commission.

**4. Chairperson Opening Remarks**

The Chair reported: 1) A date has not been set by the Rules Committee for when they will hear the appointment for the vacant position on the Commission. Most likely, it will be heard in early October. 2) Comm. Franklin will provide an update on the Responsible Dog Guardianship package but the Public and Commissioner's comment would be postponed until the next months meeting due to the extensive discussion that will follow on the cat declawing issue. 3) The feral cats issue will be calendared at a future date. 4) Discussion on off-leash dog recreation will be postponed until the Dog Advisory Committee completes their process of defining additional off-leash recreational areas. The Chair welcomed everyone and expressed gratitude to all individuals who had traveled from out-of-town just to attend this meeting.

## **7. Old Business**

### **a. Proposed establishment of a local ordinance that would prohibit veterinarians from declawing cats. (Taken out of order)**

Comm. Wheeler reported the partial results received from the survey that was mailed to San Francisco Veterinarians. Of the fourteen surveys tabulated, there was a consensus that veterinarians did not like regulation. Comm. Wheeler found most veterinarians to be reasonable and felt their primary mission is to help animals. However, there was a divergence when it came to helping the guardian or helping the animal. Therefore, the declawing legislation would help provide a voice in support of the animals.

#### **Scheduled guest speakers were introduced:**

Jennifer Conrad, DVM, and Jim Jensvold, M.D., represented the Santa Monica Paw Project. Dr. Conrad displayed a power point presentation, which revealed many disturbing results of the surgical declaw procedure that was performed on various large cats. Dr. Conrad stated that declawing of cats is banned in most European countries, and if performed, it was not done to benefit the animal. Dr. Conrad strongly urged the Commission to help stop the abuse to cats by supporting the ban. Comm. Eckmam asked if Dr. Conrad would be willing to return and testify before a committee if hearings were held. Dr. Conrad was willing to return if needed.

Dr. Jim Jensvold refuted published information provided by the AVMA/CVMA, advocates for the practice of declawing. The actual data used for these articles was insufficient, using only 640 cats as the basis of their study. He stated that there was published and experiential evidence that declawing actually puts cats at higher risk by creating behavioral problems that result in relinquishment. Dr. Jensvold supports the ban on declawing and urged that San Francisco join the rest of the world that already rejects this procedure. Dr. Jensbold further stated that because of San Francisco's recognized leadership for their compassionate treatment of animals, implementing a ban would have a tremendous educational impact on California and the Country.

Pam Rundquist, representing the Association of Veterinarians for Animal Rights (AVAR) supports the ban on cat declawing. AVAR's position, on the declaw procedure, is that it is unnecessary, inhumane and considered a form of mutilation. The focus should be on educating the public and cat behavior. AVAR has printed and distributed brochures, which has been requested nationwide, to help educate the public on alternative methods to declawing. Geneva Paige, of the SF Animal Protection Institute and Jill Kiesow, from the Sacramento Animal Protection Institute, urged the Commission to support the ban on declawing.

Dr. Dean Bayerinks, Medical Director, Irving Street Veterinarian Hospital, supports the ban on declawing. He stated that most veterinarians do not enjoy performing the declawing procedure, but the procedure has been part of their culture for many years. In his discussions with other veterinarians he found that most felt declawing was acceptable if the following steps were taken: 1) The appropriate steps were taken to educate the client. 2) Every effort was made to persuade the client not to go forward with the procedure. 3) The surgery was performed in the most humane way possible, i.e., using the proper surgical equipment, and proper pain control medication. Dr. Bayerinks further stated that it was the opinion of the



veterinarian community that if this legislation passed, it would be the beginning of continued government regulations in their profession. Therefore, they are not in support of the ban. If veterinarians were made to understand that this was not the case, many would probably support the ban. Dr. Bayerinks stressed the importance of educating the students in veterinarian schools, and also the general public on declawing.

Dr. Mack, representing the CVMA, stated their oath is to help and cure animals. He has spoken with the dean of two schools, UC Davis and Sacramento State, who will allow him to address the veterinarian students regarding the concerns of declawing. Dr. Mack will also attend legislative meetings in Sacramento for the Veterinarian Medical Board's Sunset Review. This is the agency that controls veterinarian medicine. He intends to inform the Board that they have not been diligent in controlling medication in the areas of pain and suffering, and will ask that they do a job better. Dr. Mack stated this would help address not only the declaw issue, but other issues where pain and suffering is a concern and not addressed adequately. Dr. Mack further stated that mandatory regulations concerning consent is absolutely necessary and needed to be enforced by the CVMA so that individuals who did not follow the standard procedure would be considered negligent and should be punished for not obeying the accepted standard practices of California.

#### **Public Comment**

Dr. Katz, stated as a retired veterinarian, he witnessed the pain and suffering of cats after the declaw surgical procedure was performed and, therefore, strongly supports the ban. Bob O'Brien supports the ban and also requested endorsement of AB395 the Koretz Bill. Comm. Wheeler stated that she has been working with Supervisor Sandoval's office, who is also working on a resolution in support of the Koretz Bill. Michael Delgado, Susan Martin, Nancy Gelzo, Lana Bajsel, Linda Bryant and Lisa Vitore all expressed their support of the ban. Jean Lundgren, Cat Behavior Volunteer with the SPCA, provided unofficial data from the ACC Intake Evaluation Log, of declawed cats that were evaluated, accepted or declined by the SPCA during 2/2002 -8/2003. Anne Feingold, a volunteer with ACC, stated that once the SPCA declines an animal, the animal is euthenized, she urged support of the ban.

#### **COMMISSIONER COMMENT:**

Comm. Wheeler stated that data was helpful and asked if ACC could provide similar data. Comm. Guldbeck stated that ACC fully supported the ban and would furnish any data need. The Chair asked Comm. Wheeler if Supervisor Sandoval's office provided any information on how to proceed with ordinance. Comm. Wheeler stated that she informed the Supervisor's office that the Commission was looking at both a resolution and an ordinance. She provided Supervisor Sandoval's office with proposed language for a resolution which included 1) Support of the Koretz Bill, and 2) Condemning the practice of declawing, and 3) Requesting all veterinarians in San Francisco educate the public when they are requested to perform the declawing procedure. Comm. Wheeler also read her proposed language for the ordinance. Comm. Eckman stated that the language was good but that more work needed to be done before it could be finalized. Comm. Guldbeck stated that language would need to be carefully reviewed. Comm. Wheeler stated the West Hollywood's ordinance was more straightforward. Comm. Kennedy stated Commissioners should focus on movement to get support from the Supervisors. Comm. Wheeler stated Sup. Sandoval's aide was working on a resolution.

Comm. Eckman motioned to pursue the ban on declawing cats.

Comm. Wheeler seconded motion. The vote was unanimous in support of the ban to declaw cats. Ayes: Eckman, Franklin, Kennedy, Wheeler, Chi

Comm Wheeler would request Supervisor Sandoval to write a letter in support of Koretz Bill. Comm. Eckman would write request to Board of Supervisors to support the ban.

The Chair asked what the status of the Koretz Bill. Comm. Wheeler stated the Bill was in Committee but would check on status. Since Comm. Wheeler would be out of the County for a two months, another Commissioner would need to follow up in order to move forward with the ordinance. Comm. Franklin stated she would provide the follow up and also write to the Board of Supervisors.

**b. Development of local “Cambridge-type” ordinance that would provide critical oversight of UCSF live animal testing.**

Comm. Eckman reported that she has been in contact with Susan Roy regarding uncorrected violations at UCSF. The Commissioner has continued work on creating a commission that has the ability to go into UCSF and oversee animal testing. A Sunshine Ordinance request was sent to Bill Lee, the City Administrator on September 3<sup>rd</sup>. A letter was also sent to the Department of Agriculture regarding violations. Comm. Eckman will report on responses at the next meeting.

**Public Comment:**

Lisa Vitore asked where she could get a copy of the violations. Bob O’Brien questioned the use of the State anti-cruelty laws.

**Commissioner Comment:**

Commissioner Eckman stated federal laws should regulate abuses, but does not allow local government intervention.

**6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendation approved by the Commission, requesting action by the Board of Supervisors.**

**a. Establishment of a “Responsible Dog Guardianship” legislation package:**

Comm. Franklin stated that Supervisor Dufty was in favor of the legislation package. Part two of the legislation regarding the owners picking up their dog feces was dropped since the fine has already been raised.



**5. Committee Reports/Commissioner's Reports (out of order)**

- a. Status of supervisor support/acknowledgement of the need to prioritize sufficient enforcement of Federal, State, and local law as it applies to entrepreneurs of live animal markets.**

Report carried forward to the October 9<sup>th</sup> meeting.

**Public Comment:**

Jean Lundgren requested that the Commission consider strongly urging the Recreation and Park Department to attend the Commission meetings. The Chair stated that the Commission has been working on having a representative attend meetings.

**10. Calendar Items: None**

**11. Closing Review of Task Allotment and Next Step**

1. Commissioner's Kennedy and Franklin will follow up with Comm. Wheeler before she leaves the Country in order to continue work on the declawing ordinance.
2. Continue reports on old business.

**12. Adjourned: 8:05 p.m.**



## **COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL & WELFARE**

Mailing Address: City Hall #1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 453

San Francisco, CA 94102

Voice Mail: (415) 554-6074

Website: [www.sfgov.org/awcc](http://www.sfgov.org/awcc)

### **MINUTES OF MEETING – September 11, 2003**

#### **1. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL**

Chair Kennedy, who presided during all aspects of the meeting, convened the meeting at 5:39 p.m. Seven Commissioners (or lawful designates) holding valid appointments being present, the quorum requirement of Section 6 of the Commission's Rules & Regulations (50 per cent of those eligible to vote) was satisfied.

Commissioners in Attendance: Laurie Kennedy, Chair, Sherri Franklin, Vice-Chair, Elissa Eckman, Esquire, Chin Chi, Susan Wheeler, Capt. Vicky Guldbeck, Animal Care & Control, Sgt. William Herndon, SFPD. Absent with excuse: Kelly Jensen, DVM. Also, the continued absence of Recreation and Park

#### **2. Public Comment**

It was stated that on the agenda the Commissioners should be listed with the organizations they represent. Lisa Vitore would like Commissioners to be more assertive with the Board of Supervisors and the Recreation & Park Department regarding three issues: 1) No kill policy 2) Tool box of ways in which to socialize dogs, 3) Off-leash (Socializing and training more important than leash laws.)

#### **3. Approval of Draft Minutes from the August 14, 2003 Meeting**

The minutes were amended and unanimously approved by the Commission.

#### **4. Chairperson Opening Remarks**

The Chair reported: 1) A date has not been set by the Rules Committee for when they will hear the appointment for the vacant position on the Commission. Most likely, it will be heard in early October. 2) Comm. Franklin will provide an update on the Responsible Dog Guardianship package but the Public and Commissioner's comment would be postponed until the next months meeting due to the extensive discussion that will follow on the cat declawing issue. 3) The feral cats issue will be calendared at a future date. 4) Discussion on off-leash dog recreation will be postponed until the Dog Advisory Committee completes their process of defining additional off-leash recreational areas. The Chair welcomed everyone and expressed gratitude to all individuals who had traveled from out-of-town just to attend this meeting.

## **7. Old Business**

### **a. Proposed establishment of a local ordinance that would prohibit veterinarians from declawing cats. (Taken out of order)**

Comm. Wheeler reported the partial results received from the survey that was mailed to San Francisco Veterinarians. Of the fourteen surveys tabulated, there was a consensus that veterinarians did not like regulation. Comm. Wheeler found most veterinarians to be reasonable and felt their primary mission is to help animals. However, there was a divergence when it came to helping the guardian or helping the animal. Therefore, the declawing legislation would help provide a voice in support of the animals.

#### **Scheduled guest speakers were introduced:**

Jennifer Conrad, DVM, and Jim Jensvold, M.D., represented the Santa Monica Paw Project. Dr. Conrad displayed a power point presentation, which revealed many disturbing results of the surgical declaw procedure that was performed on various large cats. Dr. Conrad stated that declawing of cats is banned in most European countries, and if performed, it was not done to benefit the animal. Dr. Conrad strongly urged the Commission to help stop the abuse to cats by supporting the ban. Comm. Eckmam asked if Dr. Conrad would be willing to return and testify before a committee if hearings were held. Dr. Conrad was willing to return if needed.

Dr. Jim Jensvold refuted published information provided by the AVMA/CVMA, advocates for the practice of declawing. The actual data used for these articles was insufficient, using only 640 cats as the basis of their study. He stated that there was published and experiential evidence that declawing actually puts cats at higher risk by creating behavioral problems that result in relinquishment. Dr. Jensvold supports the ban on declawing and urged that San Francisco join the rest of the world that already rejects this procedure. Dr. Jensbold further stated that because of San Francisco's recognized leadership for their compassionate treatment of animals, implementing a ban would have a tremendous educational impact on California and the Country.

Pam Rundquist, representing the Association of Veterinarians for Animal Rights (AVAR) supports the ban on cat declawing. AVAR's position, on the declaw procedure, is that it is unnecessary, inhumane and considered a form of mutilation. The focus should be on educating the public and cat behavior. AVAR has printed and distributed brochures, which has been requested nationwide, to help educate the public on alternative methods to declawing. Geneva Paige, of the SF Animal Protection Institute and Jill Kiesow, from the Sacramento Animal Protection Institute, urged the Commission to support the ban on declawing.

Dr. Dean Beyerinch, Medical Director, Irving Street Veterinarian Hospital, supports the ban on declawing. He stated that most veterinarians do not enjoy performing the declawing procedure, but the procedure has been part of their culture for many years. In his discussions with other veterinarians he found that most felt declawing was acceptable if the following steps were taken: 1) The appropriate steps were taken to educate the client. 2) Every effort was made to persuade the client not to go forward with the procedure. 3) The surgery was



performed in the most humane way possible, i.e., using the proper surgical equipment, and proper pain control medication. Dr. *Beyerinch* further stated that it was the opinion of the Veterinarian community that if this legislation passed, it would be the beginning of continued government regulations in their profession. Therefore, they are not in support of the ban. If veterinarians were made to understand that this was not the case, many would probably support the ban. Dr. *Beyerinch* stressed the importance of educating the students in veterinarian schools, and also the general public on declawing.

Dr. Mack, representing the CVMA, stated their oath is to help and cure animals. He has spoken with the dean of two schools, UC Davis and Sacramento State, who will allow him to address the veterinarian students regarding the concerns of declawing. Dr. Mack will also attend legislative meetings in Sacramento for the Veterinarian Medical Board's Sunset Review. This is the agency that controls veterinarian medicine. He intends to inform the Board that they have not been diligent in controlling medication in the areas of pain and suffering, and will ask that they do a job better. Dr. Mack stated this would help address not only the declaw issue, but other issues where pain and suffering is a concern and not addressed adequately. Dr. Mack further stated that mandatory regulations concerning consent is absolutely necessary and needed to be enforced by the CVMA so that individuals who did not follow the standard procedure would be considered negligent and should be punished for not obeying the accepted standard practices of California.

#### **Public Comment**

Dr. Katz, stated as a retired veterinarian, he witnessed the pain and suffering of cats after the declaw surgical procedure was performed and, therefore, strongly supports the ban. Bob O'Brien supports the ban and also requested endorsement of AB395 the Koretz Bill. Comm. Wheeler stated that she has been working with Supervisor Sandoval's office, who is also working on a resolution in support of the Koretz Bill. Michael Delgado, Susan Martin, Nancy Gelzo, Lana Bajsel, Linda Bryant and Lisa Vitore all expressed their support of the ban. Jean Lundgren, Cat Behavior Volunteer with the SPCA, provided unofficial data from the ACC Intake Evaluation Log, of declawed cats that were evaluated, accepted or declined by the SPCA during 2/2002 -8/2003. Anne Feingold, a volunteer with ACC, stated that once the SPCA declines an animal, the animal is euthenized, she urged support of the ban.

#### **COMMISSIONER COMMENT:**

Comm. Wheeler stated that data was helpful and asked if ACC could provide similar data. Comm. Guldbeck stated that ACC fully supported the ban and would furnish any data need. The Chair asked Comm. Wheeler if Supervisor Sandoval's office provided any information on how to proceed with ordinance. Comm. Wheeler stated that she informed the Supervisor's office that the Commission was looking at both a resolution and an ordinance. She provided Supervisor Sandoval's office with proposed language for a resolution which included 1) Support of the Koretz Bill, and 2) Condemning the practice of declawing, and 3) Requesting all veterinarians in San Francisco educate the public when they are requested to perform the declawing procedure. Comm. Wheeler also read her proposed language for the ordinance. Comm. Eckman stated that the language was good but that more work needed to be done before it could be finalized. Comm. Guldbeck stated that language would need to be carefully reviewed. Comm. Wheeler stated the West Hollywood's ordinance was more straightforward. Comm.

Kennedy stated Commissioners should focus on movement to get support from the Supervisors. Comm. Wheeler stated Sup. Sandoval's aide was working on a resolution.

Comm. Eckman motioned to pursue the ban on declawing cats.

Comm. Wheeler seconded motion. The vote was unanimous in support of the ban to declaw cats. Ayes: Eckman, Franklin, Kennedy, Wheeler, Chi

Comm Wheeler will request Supervisor Sandoval to write a letter in support of Koretz Bill. Comm. *Wheeler* will also write request to Board of Supervisors to support the ban. *The request may go to Supervisor Sandoval.*

The Chair asked what was the status of the Koretz Bill. Comm. Wheeler stated the Bill was in Committee but would check on status. Since Comm. Wheeler would be out of the County for a two months, another Commissioner would need to follow up in order to move forward with the ordinance. Comm. Franklin stated she would provide the follow up and also write to the Board of Supervisors.

**b. Development of local "Cambridge-type" ordinance that would provide critical oversight of UCSF live animal testing.**

Comm. Eckman reported that she has been in contact with Susan Roy regarding uncorrected violations at UCSF. The Commissioner has continued work on creating a commission that has the ability to go into UCSF and oversee animal testing. A Sunshine Ordinance request was sent to Bill Lee, the City Administrator on September 3<sup>rd</sup>. A letter was also sent to the Department of Agriculture regarding violations. Comm. Eckman will report on responses at the next meeting.

**Public Comment:**

Lisa Vitore asked where she could get a copy of the violations. Bob O'Brien questioned the use of the State anti-cruelty laws.

**Commissioner Comment:**

Commissioner Eckman stated federal laws should regulate abuses, but does not allow local government intervention.

**6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendation approved by the Commission, requesting action by the Board of Supervisors.**

**a. Establishment of a "Responsible Dog Guardianship" legislation package:**

Comm. Franklin stated that Supervisor Dufty *felt confident that he would carry the legislation but he wanted to make sure that we heard all public comment.* Part two of the legislation regarding the owners picking up their dog feces was dropped since the fine has already been raised.

**5. Committee Reports/Commissioner's Reports (out of order)**

- a. Status of supervisor support/acknowledgement of the need to prioritize sufficient enforcement of Federal, State, and local law as it applies to entrepreneurs of live animal markets.**

Report carried forward to the October 9<sup>th</sup> meeting.

**Public Comment:**

Jean Lundgren requested that the Commission consider strongly urging the Recreation and Park Department to attend the Commission meetings. The Chair stated that the Commission has been working on having a representative attend meetings.

**10. Calendar Items: None**

**11. Closing Review of Task Allotment and Next Step**

1. Commissioner's Kennedy and Franklin will follow up with Comm. Wheeler before she leaves the Country in order to continue work on the declawing ordinance.
2. Continue reports on old business.

**12. Adjourned: 8:05 p.m.**

Dated: 25<sup>th</sup> September, 2003  
Arita, Commission Secretary





# SAN FRANCISCO COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL & WELFARE

## MEETING AGENDA

Thursday, October 9, 2003

5:30 PM

Room 408

City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

OCT - 8 2003

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

.....  
Laurie Kennedy, Sherri Franklin, Elissa Eckman,  
Kelly Jensen, Susan Wheeler, Chin Chi, Joanne Kipnis,  
Jack Breslin, Vicki Guldbeck, William Herndon  
.....

MAILING ADDRESS: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 453  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689  
COMMISSION VOICEMAIL: (415) 554-6074  
WEBSITE: [www.sfgov.org/awcc](http://www.sfgov.org/awcc)  
COMMISSION CHAIRPERSON: Laurie Kennedy

*(Note: Public comment will be taken on each discussion/action item.)*

### 1. Call to Order and Roll Call

- Vote taken on excused absences

### 2. Public Comment

- Members of the public may address the Commission with comments or recommendations on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda* at the beginning or end of the meeting, but not both.

### 3. Approval of Draft Minutes from the September 11, 2003 Meeting

[Discussion/Action Item]

### 4. Chairperson's report and opening remarks

[Discussion Item]

- a. Welcoming remarks

### 5. Committee Reports/Commissioner's Reports

[Discussion Item]

- a. Status of Supervisor support/acknowledgment of the need to prioritize sufficient enforcement of Federal, State, and local law as it applies to entrepreneurs of live animal markets. [Commissioner Jensen]



## **6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendation approved by the Commission, requesting action by the Board of Supervisors**

[Discussion Item/Action]

- a. Establishment of a "Responsible Dog Guardianship" legislation package to include:
  - i. Development of a SF ordinance, which would outline/define humane and responsible guidelines for the welfare, care, and maintenance of dogs who are housed primarily outdoors.  
[Commissioners Franklin and Guldbeck]
  - ii. Amendment of SF Health Code – Add Section 39: Requiring dog guardians, or those responsible for the supervision of a said dog, to exchange personal identification information and rabies shot verification when dog bites occur.  
[Commissioners Franklin & Guldbeck]
- b. Proposed establishment of a local ordinance that would prohibit veterinarians from declawing cats. This legislation would prohibit declawing surgical procedures, but would allow declawing for therapeutic purposes only – when the procedure is medically necessary to protect the cat's health.
  - i. Status of Supervisor support regarding a local resolution and ordinance  
[Commissioners Kennedy, Franklin, Jensen]

## **8. Old Business**

- Items are first introduced to the Commission then there is public comment. After public comment, the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.
- a. Development of local "Cambridge-type" ordinance that would provide critical oversight of UCSF live-animal testing.  
[Commissioner Eckman] [Discussion/Action Item]

## **9. New Business**

- Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment, the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.

## **10. Public Comment**

- Members of the public may address the Commission with comments or recommendations on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda* at the beginning or end of the meeting, but not both.

## **11. Calendar Items**

- Commissioners may provide a brief description of item(s) they request be on next month's agenda. Discussion and comprehensive narrative of new calendar submissions will take place during the next meeting. Commissioners need to follow-up on their calendar item submissions via email to the Chair at least one week in advance of the next monthly meeting.

## **12. Closing Review of Task Allotment and Next Steps**

[Commissioner Franklin] [Review Item]

## **13. Adjournment**

.....





**Disability Access:** Room 408 is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART Station is Civic Center, three blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #42 Downtown Loop, the #71 Haight/Noriega, the F Line to Market and Van Ness, and the Metro stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call 923-6142.

There is accessible parking at the following locations: two (2) designated blue curb spaces on the southwest corner of McAllister Street at Van Ness Avenue; the Performing Arts Garage (entrance on Grove Street between Franklin and Gough Streets), and at Civic Center Plaza Garage.

The following services are available upon request at least two working days prior to the meeting: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting, or a sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. For information or to make arrangements, contact Carla Vaughn at 252-2500 (voice) or 252-2550 (TDD).

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals.

**Policy on Cell Phones, Pagers, and Electronic Devices:** The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers, and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

**Know Your Rights Under the Sunshine Ordinance:** Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco's Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact Donna Hall at the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 409, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683; Office (415) 554-7724; Fax (415) 554-7854; E-mail: Donna\_Hall@ci.sf.ca.us

Citizens interested in obtaining a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance can request a copy from Ms. Hall or by printing Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code on the Internet, at <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/bdsupvrs/sunshine.htm>

**Attention:** Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 554-9510; fax (415) 703-0121 and web site <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/ethics>



# COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL AND WELFARE

Mailing Address: City Hall #1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 453

San Francisco, CA 94102

Voice Mail: (415) 554-6074

Website: www.sfgov.org/awcc

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

OCT 22 2003

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

## Draft Minutes of Meeting - October 9<sup>th</sup>, 2003

### 1. Call to order and roll call

5  
2  
19/03  
af+

The meeting was convened at 5.35p.m. by Chair Kennedy, who presided during all aspects of the meeting. Five Commissioners (or their lawful designates) holding valid appointments being present, the quorum requirement of Section 6 of the Commission's Rules & Regulations (50 percent of those eligible to vote) was satisfied.

Commissioners in Attendance: Chair Laurie Kennedy, Vice-Chair Sherri Franklin, Elissa Eckman, Chin Chi, Joanne Kipnis, Vicki Guldbeck, Animal Care & Control, Sgt. Bill Herndon, SFPD.

Absent with excuse: Susan Wheeler, Kelly Jensen DVM  
Also, the continued absent of Recreation and Park

### 2. Public Comment

Bob O'Brien stated that there is National Primate Liberation week from October 25<sup>th</sup> to November 2nd and on October 28th there will be a demonstration at UCSF from 11:30a.m. and he requests that a member of the Commission be present, as several animal organizations will be also present.

### 3. Approval of the draft minutes of September 11, 2003

The Chair opened the meeting to public comment. The minutes were unanimously approved by the Commission with a few minor amendments.

### 4. Chairperson's report and opening remarks

- a. The Chair welcomed Joanne Kipnis to the Commission and Comm. Kipnis stated that she was looking forward to working with the Commission and the Public. Comm. Herndon arrived at 5.46p.m.

(out of order)

### 6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendations approved by Commission requesting action by Board of Supervisors

- a. Responsible Dog Guardianship

The Chair stated that they had invited SF Dogs and Coleman Advocates to attend. Comm. Franklin stated that L.A. had recently passed legislation in



the Health Code. S.F. only requires at this time food, shelter and water. They started working on this 6 months ago to have more defined requirements.

### **Amendment of SF Health Code**

Comm. Herndon spoke about "Bite and Run" which means that if a dog bites whether you are owner, caretaker etc., you are required under this law to report the bite, the same as reporting a traffic accident. The primary reason is to know if the dog has had its rabies shot. They would like to make it a misdemeanor if a person leaves the scene without giving proper information about the dog. Comm.

Franklin stated that they have been in touch with Sup. Dufty and he seemed like he would support the amendment but wanted public comment first by SF Dogs and Coleman Advocates.

### **Public Comment**

Florence Sarrett spoke was in support of the legislation but she thought that the whole proposal should be rewritten. She referred to Section 39 and C "it shall be the duty of any person having knowledge of any animal which has bitten a human being or other animal within the City and Co. to immediately, and in no case later than the end of next business day, report the fact to the Health Dept. and to furnish complete information thereof, including date, time and location of bite, description of animal or person bitten, name and license number of biting animal and rabies vaccination. History of biting animal". She would not report a dog bite especially if it was a friend's dog. Comm. Franklin said that this was in the existing code.

This law has been in the code for years, primarily because of rabies. Ron Cole stated that this legislation was for L.A. sentry dogs and also what if a person has a stroke or goes away on vacation, is the person who is looking after the dog responsible? Comm. Guldbeck stated that ACC investigates as much information as they can and no one can get in trouble on the first visit and they will educate as best as possible. Ron Cole stated that anyone be it judge, jury, etc. can interpret the law, so we need it written into law. John Denny of the SF Police Dept. hopes to have the "Bite and Run" ordinance on the ballot. He said that a case where the child was on a swing, a man came with 2 dogs, one dog bit the child and when asked his name etc. he was verbally abusive to the woman and took off. Another incident, a man with a 9 year old boy went into the dog run near Spreckles Lake with his little dog and 5 pitbulls attacked him and his dog. The man threw his dog over the fence. The man had 37 cuts and scrapes. No witnesses would come forward to say whom the man and his dogs were. Comm. Herndon said that we needed to get to the owner/guardian, not the dog. Robin Buckley questioned the ordinance. There is no law that the dog must have a license tag or rabies tag. Comm. Eckman, 6a. Questioned this ordinance speaking about license requirements, exercise and socialization, medical care and education. Comm. Franklin and Comm. Guldbeck will be meeting with Sup. Dufty at the end of October.



### **Declawing Cats**

Comm. Wheeler was in touch with Sup. Sandoval's aide, Sup. Sandoval went forward with the resolution and it was passed by the Board. Comm. Jensen and Comm. Kennedy will be meeting with Sup. Sandoval next week to see if they can get support for ordinance. Comm. Eckman suggested that they look over last month's minutes to see what the doctors testified and also bring some photos so as to better inform Sup. Sandoval.

The Chair stated that at the Rules Committee Meeting, Sup. Dufty said that the Commission was not doing their job regarding public hearings, and at the Board of Supervisors meeting the veterinarians stated that they didn't want Government interfering with their jobs. Comm. Chi was unclear about last month's vote on cat declawing. It was stated that the Commission only voted to ban cats declawing. They did not vote on educating the public about cat declawing or supporting the Koretz Bill which failed in Sacramento. Comm. Chi stated that she was never against a ban, just improved conditions and education. Comm Eckman said that when she spoke with Dr. Gross, the doctor thought that it was better to concentrate on pain and suffering.

## **5. Committee Reports/Commissioner's Reports**

### **Live Animal Markets**

Comm. Franklin reported that ACC had a call that a canister of frogs was seen in Chinatown. They picked out the 10 worst cases and brought them to ACC. The Chair stated that live animal markets have been on the agenda for years but no Supervisor will touch issue.

## **8. Old Business**

Comm. Eckman stated that she is still working on "Cambridge-type" ordinance and will have more information next month. Bob O'Brien asked about an oversight committee and Comm. Eckman said that they are working on that.

## **9. New Business**

No new business

## **10. Public Comment**

Ron Cole asked where Comm. Breslin was and was told that he will attend the meeting when it is necessary.

## **11. Calendar Items**

Comm. Chi requested Trap-Neuter-Adopt-Return be put on agenda next month. Comm. Franklin requested also on the agenda to restore voting to departmental representatives. Comm. Kipnis requested that trapping on the agenda and how it affects the public.

## **12. Closing Review of Task Allotment and Next Steps**

Comm. Herndon will meet with City Attorney to review the Bite & Run. Comm. Guldbeck and Comm. Franklin will meet with Sup. Dufty to set up the dog ordinance. Comm. Jensen and Comm. Kennedy will meet with Sup. Sandoval about declawing ban.

## **13. Adjournment**

The meeting was adjourned at 6:58 p.m. motioned by Comm. Franklin, seconded by Comm. Eckman.

Dated: 12<sup>th</sup> January, 2003  
Wilson, Secretary

# SAN FRANCISCO COMMISSION OF ANIMAL CONTROL & WELFARE

## MEETING AGENDA

Thursday, November 13, 2003

5:30 PM

Room 408

City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place

San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

DOCUMENTS DEPT.

NOV 17 2003

SAN FRANCISCO  
PUBLIC LIBRARY

11-17-03A11:15 RCVD

.....  
Laurie Kennedy, Sherri Franklin, Elissa Eckman,  
Kelly Jensen, Susan Wheeler, Chin Chi, Joanne Kipnis,  
Jack Breslin, Vicki Guldbeck, William Herndon  
.....

MAILING ADDRESS: City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, Room 453  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

COMMISSION VOICEMAIL: (415) 554-6074

WEBSITE: [www.sfgov.org/awcc](http://www.sfgov.org/awcc)

COMMISSION CHAIRPERSON: Laurie Kennedy

*(Note: Public comment will be taken on each discussion/action item.)*

### 1. Call to Order and Roll Call

- Vote taken on excused absences

### 2. Public Comment

- Members of the public may address the Commission with comments or recommendations on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda* at the beginning or end of the meeting, but not both.

### 3. Approval of Draft Minutes from the October 9, 2003 Meeting

[Discussion/Action Item]

### 4. Chairperson's report and opening remarks

[Discussion Item]

- a. Welcoming remarks

### 5. Committee Reports/Commissioner's Reports

[Discussion Item]

- a. Status of Supervisor support/acknowledgment of the need to prioritize sufficient enforcement of Federal, State, and local law as it applies to entrepreneurs of live animal markets. [Commissioner Jensen]





## **6. Status and tracking of letters of recommendation approved by the Commission, requesting action by the Board of Supervisors**

[Discussion Item/Action]

- a. Proposed establishment of a local ordinance that would prohibit veterinarians from declawing cats. This legislation would prohibit declawing surgical procedures, but would allow declawing for therapeutic purposes only – when the procedure is medically necessary to protect the cat's health.
  - i. Status of Supervisor support regarding a local resolution and ordinance  
[Commissioners Kennedy & Franklin]
- b. Establishment of a "Responsible Dog Guardianship" legislation package to include:
  - i. Development of a SF ordinance, which would outline/define humane and responsible guidelines for the welfare, care, and maintenance of dogs who are housed primarily outdoors.  
[Commissioners Franklin and Guldbech]
  - ii. Amendment of SF Health Code – Add Section 39: Requiring dog guardians, or those responsible for the supervision of a said dog, to exchange personal identification information and rabies shot verification when dog bites occur.  
[Commissioners Franklin & Guldbech]

## **8. Old Business**

- Items are first introduced to the Commission then there is public comment. After public comment, the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.
- a. Development of local "Cambridge-type" ordinance that would provide critical oversight of UCSF live-animal testing.  
[Commissioner Eckman] [Discussion/Action Item]

## **9. New Business**

- Items are first introduced to the Commission and a motion is made, then there is public comment. After public comment, the Commission discusses the item and then may vote on it.
- a. Proposal to designate Trap-Neuter-Adopt-Return (TNR) as an officially approved means to humanely address homeless/feral cat issues in the City and County of San Francisco.  
[Commissioner Chi] [Discussion/Action Item]
- b. Proposal to restore Commission voting rights to city department representative members, which may include designated representatives from the Police Department, Animal Care & Control, Department of Health, and the Recreation and Park Department.  
[Commissioners Franklin and Kennedy] [Discussion/Action Item (2/3 vote required)]

## **10. Public Comment**

- Members of the public may address the Commission with comments or recommendations on items within the Commission's jurisdiction *other than the items on the agenda* at the beginning or end of the meeting, but not both.



## 11. Calendar Items

- Commissioners may provide a brief description of item(s) they request be on next month's agenda. Discussion and comprehensive narrative of new calendar submissions will take place during the next meeting. Commissioners need to follow-up on their calendar item submissions via email to the Chair at least one week in advance of the next monthly meeting.

## 12. Closing Review of Task Allotment and Next Steps

[Commissioner Franklin] [Review Item]

## 13. Adjournment

.....

**Disability Access:** Room 408 is wheelchair accessible. The closest accessible BART Station is Civic Center, three blocks from City Hall. Accessible MUNI lines serving this location are: #42 Downtown Loop, the #71 Haight/Noriega, the F Line to Market and Van Ness, and the Metro stations at Van Ness and Market and at Civic Center. For more information about MUNI accessible services, call 923-6142.

There is accessible parking at the following locations: two (2) designated blue curb spaces on the southwest corner of McAllister Street at Van Ness Avenue; the Performing Arts Garage (entrance on Grove Street between Franklin and Gough Streets), and at Civic Center Plaza Garage.

The following services are available upon request at least two working days prior to the meeting: American Sign Language interpreters, use of a reader during a meeting, or a sound enhancement system. Accessible seating for persons with disabilities can be made available. Following a meeting, meeting proceedings can be made available in alternative formats. For information or to make arrangements, contact Carla Vaughn at 252-2500 (voice) or 252-2550 (TDD).

In order to assist the City's efforts to accommodate persons with severe allergies, environmental illnesses, multiple chemical sensitivity or related disabilities, attendees at public meetings are reminded that other attendees may be sensitive to various chemical based products. Please help the City accommodate these individuals.

**Policy on Cell Phones, Pagers, and Electronic Devices:** The ringing of and use of cell phones, pagers, and similar sound-producing electronic devices are prohibited at this meeting. Please be advised that the Chair may order the removal from the meeting room of any person(s) responsible for the ringing or use of a cell phone, pager, or other similar sound-producing electronic devices.

**Know Your Rights Under the Sunshine Ordinance:** Government's duty is to serve the public, reaching its decisions in full view of the public. Commissions, boards, councils and other agencies of the City and County exist to conduct the people's business. This Ordinance assures that deliberations are conducted before the people and that City operations are open to the people's review. For more information on your rights under the Sunshine Ordinance (Chapter 67 of the San Francisco's Administrative Code) or to report a violation of the Ordinance, contact Donna Hall at the Sunshine Ordinance Task Force, City Hall, Room 409, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place, San Francisco, CA 94102-4683; Office (415) 554-7724; Fax (415) 554-7854; E-mail: Donna\_Hall@ci.sf.ca.us

Citizens interested in obtaining a free copy of the Sunshine Ordinance can request a copy from Ms. Hall or by printing Chapter 67 of the San Francisco Administrative Code on the Internet, at <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/bdsupvrs/sunshine.htm>

**Attention:** Individuals and entities that influence or attempt to influence local legislative or administrative action may be required by the San Francisco Lobbyist Ordinance (SF Administrative Code 16.520 - 16.534) to register and report lobbying activity. For more information about the Lobbyist Ordinance, please contact the Ethics Commission at 1390 Market Street, #701, San Francisco, CA 94102, telephone (415) 554-9510; fax (415) 703-0121 and web site <http://www.ci.sf.ca.us/ethics>













